Open Research Online

The Open University's repository of research publications
and other research outputs

"Adults participating in learning"

Thesis

How to cite:

West, Linden Reginald (1985). "Adults participating in learning". MPhil thesis The Open University.

For guidance on citations see FAQs.

© 1984 Linden Reginald West

https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

Version: Version of Record

Link(s) to article on publisher's website:
http://dx.doi.org/doi:10.21954/ou.ro.0000fcd1

Copyright and Moral Rights for the articles on this site are retained by the individual authors and/or other copyright owners. For more information on Open Research Online's data policy on reuse of materials please consult the policies page.

oro.open.ac.uk

UNRESTRICTED

"ADULTS PARTICIPATING IN LEARNING"

by

LINDEN REGINALD WEST, B.A. (HONS.)

Submitted for the Degree of Master of Philosophy

SCHOOL OF EDUCATION; ADMINISTRATION AND MANAGEMENT

Date of submission: December 1984

Date of award: 2 April 1985

December 1984

EX1Z

ProQuest Number: 27777165

All rights reserved

INFORMATION TO ALL USERS
The quality of this reproduction is dependent on the quality of the copy submitted.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send a complete manuscript
and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if material had to be removed,
a note will indicate the deletion.

ProQuest 27777165

Published by ProQuest LLC (2020). Copyright of the Dissertation is held by the Author.

All Rights Reserved.
This work is protected against unauthorized copying under Title 17, United States Code
Microform Edition © ProQuest LLC.

ProQuest LLC
789 East Eisenhower Parkway
P.O. Box 1346
Ann Arbor, MI 48106 - 1346

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This research is concerned with adults participating in learning. It has been a profound learning experience for me which has involved changes both in my intellectual grasp of some of the issues as well as the way I feel about the field. This would not have been possible without help and support from supervisors and colleagues. In particular, I would like to thank Keith Percy and Nick Small for bearing with me so patiently; Colin Kirkwood for many conversations and access to material; the organisers, tutors and student participants in the Edinburgh case studies; my former colleagues in the A.B.E. Unit in Lothian Region, particularly Margaret Wilson and Judy Parker, and my present colleagues in 'BB&O' District of the WEA. Last but not least I would like to thank Alma Brown for her patient typing and herculean efforts to decipher my handwriting as well as my personal secretary, Bette Jones, who has helped me combine research with the demands of a taxing job.

LINDEN WEST
December 1984
Oxford.

****

ABSTRACT

This thesis explores the theme of adults participating in learning with reference to social groups who are largely absent from adult education. This is done by refining four propositions through a literature review and some case studies. The first proposition is based on the idea that participation should be understood within the context of a person or group's general pattern of social participation while the second relates the development of learning to an individual or group's belief that control over significant events is possible. The third proposition focuses on the content of learning and that this should consist of reflection and action on social constraints to personal well-being. The final proposition examines the suggestion that learning is enriched when participants control what is done.

These ideas have been neglected in the literature although there is evidence that participation in learning is best analysed as an element within social class relationships. The case studies involve in-depth interviews with working class participants in four projects. These interviews indicate that learning should be understood in highly personal as well as institutional and relational terms. It is suggested that a theory of participation in learning needs to incorporate personal and socio-psychological perspectives as well as sociological. Equally it is not easy to develop an alternative approach to sustained learning from thinking about, and acting on, social constraints alone. Participant control is difficult to establish since people need confidence and personal legitimacy as well as skills and knowledge before learning can become more 'dialogical'. Nonetheless it is concluded that the forms of participation which maximise the potential for learning should be democratic in nature.

The thesis ends by discussing some practical implications. These include approaches to social organisation and curriculum development. Difficult questions are raised about values underlying the organisation of adult learning which cannot be avoided in research.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER ONE: AN APPROACH TO RESEARCH

1. Introduction.
2. The idea of participation.
3. Learning, education and the adult - working definitions.
4. The emergence of the thesis.
5. Propositions, methodology and the structure of the thesis.
6. A note on values and the researcher.

CHAPTER ONE

1. Introduction

Most research into adults participating in learning has been primarily concerned with the composition of formal adult education programmes - that is work undertaken through the medium of agencies such as Local Education Authorities, the Responsible Bodies or the Open University. A priority concern has been to understand the basis of existing recruitment and how this might be broadened. This may not be surprising given the institutional basis of much research. There has been rather less analysis of the meaning of participation or its relationship to an individual's wider social experience, the distribution of power and opportunity or the cultural characteristics of a given society. Culture is used here in its anthropological sense - a whole way of life including schooling, work, technology, values, social relationships and institutional forms. Research into adult education may have tended to focus too narrowly on adult learning in isolation from personal and more general cultural opportunities and constraints. There may also have been an assumption that participation in existing forms of adult education is an unquestionable good and relates to the learning needs of all people.

This thesis explores the idea that an understanding of participation and adult learning requires a broad approach. An examination of people participating in learning might necessitate a wider analysis of social participation, social relationships and the extent to which people may feel able to influence significant events. Such a study may be particularly useful in seeking to explain the underrepresentation of working class people in adult education. The work begins with a critical appraisal of the existing literature of adults participating in learning and education. This is followed by an exploration of a number of case studies and interviews with participants in particular projects. The projects have been primarily designed to engage students in significant learning through attempts at achieving social relevance and the negotiation of programme content. The case studies are based on work with groups of people living in the inner City or on peripheral housing estates in Edinburgh. The majority of the people who have been interviewed are from social groups largely absent from the formal world of adult education. The objective behind the study is to try to establish the meaning of such learning to participants. This could play an important part in the development of a more substantial theory and practice of adult learning.

The idea that adult learning should be viewed as part of a wider social experience may appear simplistic to a sociologist or social psychologist practised in the art of discerning patterns in a variety of social acts and contributing to theories from any problems which are encountered. Research in adult education (however broadly this is defined) has yet to establish a clear and distinct tradition. The uncertain state of research is perhaps unsurprising given the relative infancy of the discipline as a subject for serious and sustained study within Universities. A detailed analysis of the meaning of participation in the context of particular forms of learning may make a contribution to this field. The importance of research into adult learning may be growing as extensive social change could render the association of most educational research with childhood increasingly anachronistic.

2. The idea of participation

Historically, discussion of the idea of participation in adult education has never simply been concerned with numbers entering formal provision. In some agencies there has been a consideration of the relationship between content and control of the curriculum and a broader concept of participation. Thus in liberal adult education (primarily the work of the WEA and University Extramural Departments) there is a strong historical theme of the idea of participation consisting of three interrelated elements: a 'liberal' open-ended content, negotiation of curricula and an association of learning with social change. The first, a 'liberal' content stemmed from a belief in the importance of a 'humane' education for working class adults. This was a response to the limited vocational/technical/basic skill curriculum thought appropriate to working class people at the beginning of the twentieth century. There was a conviction that all adult people could turn such an education to *'as good account as the minority who succeeded in those athletic feats'*.[1] For R.H. Tawney, the idea of a humane education meant *'an acquaintance with literature and art, the history of society and the revelation of science'* - this being a prerequisite of the political movement of working class people itself being put to good account. No-one *'could be fully at home in the world'*, or fully participate in social life without an understanding of history, literature and science.[2]

The second element was based on the view that adults should be a central resource in the development of the curriculum - working class adults could contribute to, and enrich learning from their own direct experience. This element often involved conflicting interpretations that are not without echoes in more contemporary discussions. Thus the

classic liberal view of Mansbridge and Tawney[3] regarded knowledge as neutral and largely unproblematic;[4] the main contribution from working class adults would be to enrich learning through the exploitation of direct experience in relation to social, political, historical or economic ideas. This was in contrast to the idea of a distinct working class education, predicated on the centrality of class struggle and the specific educational needs of those engaged in an essentially revolutionary activity. An educational agenda for working class people was largely determined by the ideological position of the protagonists. One writer has summarised the debate in terms of *'a Marxist interpretation of what to think as compared with the mainstream WEA view of how to think'*.[5] This probably oversimplifies the issue and the approaches which different tutors have adopted. For some people workers' education was a means to enhance the class struggle; for others it provided an opportunity for a humane education in which there were opportunities to reflect on a range of views. These varied perspectives can be found in the more recent literature.

There was a general belief that the student should play a major part in shaping the curriculum. There was an acceptance that students learned from each other as much as any tutor and that the essence of an *adult* education was an exchange of ideas, knowledge and insight between equals. The process of participation was as crucial as the act of participation in learning itself. The process of democracy in adult education was a model for other forms of social organisation.

The third element was an association of education with social change. Participation in adult education was considered to be part of a broader political struggle in which working class men and women were to be equipped to participate more fully in, indeed control, the political, social and economic institutions of society. Education was part of 'a social dynamic' of change - a means through which a wider experience of participation in a range of activities could be undertaken by an historically dispossessed class.[6]

Thus the idea of participation in adult learning has never simply revolved around the act of entry into education per se or a head count of participants. There has been a concern with the control of educational provision as well as its content and relevance to social action and political participation. The emergence of a liberal adult education *movement* can be interpreted as part of a broader social ideal through which working class people could develop the necessary degrees of

competence, knowledge and skill to contribute to social action and change. The more contemporary debate surrounding adult education and social change and the Freirean ideal of an organic unity between social action and reflection (the idea of praxis - learning being energised through action on social influences which are said to constrain the individual or group) is not without historical antecedents. The work of educators such as Thompson[8] and Lovett[9] has only continued a debate surrounding adult education, its relationship to social change and how learning can be made meaningful and relevant for working class people. This issue is an important theme in the thesis.

Research into the cultural context of participation is considered to be important because of a continuing failure by adult education agencies to engage large numbers of working class people in their work. The WEA has constantly felt uneasy about the relative under-representation of manual workers in its numbers;[10] indeed research has shown that some of the early tutorial classes were not as overwhelmingly proletarian as some mythology may have suggested.[11] Participation in existing patterns of adult education is unrepresentative of the adult population, with a majority never having participated in any form of post-compulsory education or training.[12] Such unrepresentativeness is most clearly illustrated by reference to those placed in lower socio-economic groups and having benefitted least from formal initial education - at least as measured by conventional certification.[13] This can be correlated with research findings of low levels of educational attainment among large sections of the adult population and substantial evidence of minimal levels of basic skill competence among many adult people.[14] Although indicators such as low levels of computational skills or formal certification may only be crude measures of the degree to which the adult population can be said to be 'educated', they do provide support for the proposition that the adult population may be considerably under-educated.

Recent research[15] has confirmed that those gaining most from initial education (in this context defined as a continuous period in schooling and further or higher education prior to employment) and in highly paid senior managerial or administrative occupations gain most from the existing resources devoted to the education and training of adults. In-service industrial training, management education and professional skill updating constitute a more substantial element of expenditure than the conventional non-vocational sector of adult education.[16] Far from being a source of redistribution of educational opportunity, much existing adult education and training may only tend to compound educational inequality. In turn adult education may reflect or reinforce patterns of

socio-economic inequality rather than being a vehicle of greater social equality. In analysing participation in learning and educational opportunity, there is clearly a close relationship with the more general distribution of power and social opportunity.

Therefore, a theory and practice of participation in adult learning is developed through an examination of three inter-related ideas. First, whether adult participation in education (and its antithesis) can be understood in isolation from the broader pattern of social and political relationships in which an individual is involved. Secondly, the importance in curriculum development of exploiting the concrete and particular in the experiences of working class adults as a basis for sustained learning. Such learning might include an understanding of abstract concepts and the development of an ability to discriminate between various ideas in an informed way; it could involve a confidence to apply such knowledge to the resolution of personal or more general social predicaments. Thirdly, the relevance to those who can be seen as gaining least from existing educational opportunity of a pedagogy based on a unity between social action and understanding as formulated in the writings of such theorists as Paulo Freire.[17] As yet such issues have been relatively insignificant in research into participation in adult education.

At this stage such research can be briefly placed into five categories with considerable overlap between them: research into the composition of the existing student body especially in formal adult education programmes; socio-psychological theories focusing on the individual's interaction with his or her immediate environment; locational questions concerned with the accessibility of existing provision; a relatively new area of research into 'independent learning' - that is unconnected with formal institutional adult education. A final and related category is based on a tradition of action-research and the socio-political context of adult education.

Most research belongs to the first category. There has been a concentration on descriptions of the composition of the student body with some attempts to explain its unrepresentativeness in relation to the total adult population. For example, the work of Trenaman[18] established a clear correlation between success in early education and participation in adult education. The second category of research has produced a considerable body of analytical work. Researchers have been concerned to identify factors in the contemporary socio-psychological environment of the individual such as the 'self-concept' and its

relationship to participation in education. An objective has been to identify factors within an individual's psychology which may make participation in learning more or less likely. The third category has been concerned with the identification of barriers to participation in existing adult education programmes - including their timing, content and location or the degree to which existing post-initial education constitutes an intelligible system.[19] Research into independent learning is in contrast to an interest in institutional barriers to participation.

The present research relates to some issues which have been central to the fifth category of 'action-research'; although the thesis is not a record of a particular educational project, it is an attempt to clarify the theoretical and ideological bases of participation in learning and any practical implications for the design and development of adult education.

There is a growing body of literature devoted to such issues; some educators have been concerned to examine the assumptions which might underlie some existing formal adult education provision - not the least how many educators may define educational 'problems'. For example, Keddie[20] has argued that the assumptions underlying much adult basic education imply an 'individual-pathological' model of educational deprivation. Problems are seen to lie in an individual's deficiencies; practical solutions may be geared to helping people cope better with them. Keddie is concerned that such analysis tends to exclude socio-structural explanations of personal difficulty - for example, the consequences of being marginal to personal, political and economic decisions of direct relevance.

The literature has also been concerned with elucidating any relationship between the context and control of educational programmes and an individual's capacity to change personal or social constraints which are seen to hinder or stifle personal development. For example, Thompson[21] has suggested that the basis of successful women's education is a supportive, egalitarian atmosphere in the 'classroom'; this can enable women to realise shared problems and identify action in which support can come from other women. Shared problems have been identified as an exclusion from social and political power. Learning is part of a dialectic of action/reflection to change such social relationships. A theory and practice of adult education for those who may be marginal to social and political power within our society should be concerned with such ideas.

3. Learning, education and the adult - working definitions

There are difficulties in establishing even a provisional definition of 'learning' and 'education' since this may depend on wider sets of values, ideology or assumptions. A particular definition may well imply an approach to 'participation' which is problematic; an example would be when the epithet 'education' is considered to be appropriate only if the form, content and evaluation of learning is mediated through formal, accredited institutional agencies. Gagne[22] has argued that organised programmes of instruction exist because *'according to experience as currently appraised, developing a student into a truly independent learner takes years'*. In contrast, some views of learning are dependent on a particular ideology of socio-political change; in given circumstances meaningful learning is dependent upon a consciousness of social constraints to personal growth and action being taken to remove them. In short, there is no widespread consensus over what might constitute learning and education in adulthood. Their definition may depend on the cultural analysis or wider ideology of the educator or researcher.

There are also problems raised by sociological and economic perspectives which stress that what is defined as appropriate learning and education may depend on, or be determined by, specific socio-cultural and historical circumstances. In some states of economic development, in which one cannot adequately feed one's child or certain basic necessities of survival such as adequate food or shelter are not available for most people, there may be a stress on learning as a tool of economic development. Alternatively, as with Freire's philosophy, learning may be defined in highly radical political terms as an element in social transformation. The opposite can equally apply - that is a dominant élite having access to scarce resources may seek to impose an educational 'system' in which only their cultural or economic interests are secured.[23] As Durkheim has argued, some educators may be guilty of abstracting the realisation of learning from a socio-historical milieu to the point where discussion becomes meaningless.[24]

Nonetheless, some working definitions are needed to explore and develop a theory of participation. A basic assumption is that the researcher is only interested in particular forms of learning. Learning takes place in an enormous variety of ways - from a study of the works of philosophers to 'gossip' within a pub. In a sense one can learn, as Jessup remarked,[25] if one falls off a bus. Such incidental experience is not of direct concern. Likewise, the fact that it is possible to define some learning as 'anti-educational' or propagandist indicates that the

educator is concerned with learning having certain characteristics. Wiltshire has drawn attention to this in some of his writing:

> *'The concept of learning is highly generalised, almost as though it were a simple and unanalysable thing and as though the more we had of it the better. This is obviously not so and no teacher behaves as if it were so. A man can learn and can be taught to be prejudiced, cruel and insensitive; he can learn or be taught what is false, or misleading; he can acquire skills which are self-destructive or anti-social ...'*[26]

Therefore learning and education are assumed to be based on certain values (however problematic the social context or the possibility of them being realised). It is possible to make certain provisional statements about these values and the conceptual basis of learning (including its context, content and process) which will be reviewed as part of the research.

It is accepted that it is difficult to distinguish rigidly between informal, educative activity and learning of a more systematic kind. Learning is a process unique to the individual's phenomenological field and a variety of influences will exist at both a more formal and informal level. At this stage, it may be best to regard all learning as part of a continuum stretching from informal influences at one end, to highly structured, deliberately planned and organised educational activity at the other. The study will initially focus on this latter area rather than more incidental experience. It will be suggested however that some distinction between informal and formal learning can be arbitrary and that the meanings given to learning by an individual can sometimes only be understood as part of a pattern of experience. For present purposes the concept of learning is taken to incorporate the following characteristics:

i. It is normally deliberate, planned and organised with a conscious intent of bringing about changes in knowledge, attitudes or skill. At this stage casual, accidental or random elements within a learning continuum are incidental to the study.

ii. It is assumed that learning is a distinctly human characteristic when conceived of as an activity possible to an intelligence capable of making *reasoned* choices, directing or controlling impulses with a capacity to reorder in a conscious way the social and personal context of existence.[27] It is suggested that 'reason' implies a capacity to reflect on context which differentiates human beings from animals.

iii. That the content of learning should facilitate an intellectual pursuit of explanation and truth or the nurturing of skills which allow the person to develop some personally or socially valued skill.

iv. That the content of learning is normally concerned with the realisation of some agreed objectives,[28] however open to negotiation and change. In this sense, learning is concerned with a mastery of 'x' to an agreed level of success or achievement. To have learnt is to have achieved some progress whether in understanding, skills or social competence which can be quantified and evaluated. Learning is a process which involves some degree of planned progression.

v. That there is some clear sense of an organised and sequential process in which there is a conscious and deliberate intent on the part of the adult to learn.[29] This would tend to exclude influences which the learner may be unaware of, perhaps in the field of advertising or propaganda.

vi. That learning merges into education when it incorporates some system of planning objectives, agreeing evaluative criteria (of an intellectual, affective or creative kind) and the identification of methods which will assist the learner to realise the agreed goals or those which he/she has set for him/herself.

Neither 'learning' nor 'education' are regarded as the sole province of formal educational institutions or social organisations. Houle has offered a definition which meets this broader perspective. He regards adult education as a 'deliberate, planned and organised' process which is not confined to institutional settings:

'Adult education is the process by which men and women (alone, in groups, or in institutional settings) seek to improve themselves or their society by increasing their skill, knowledge or sensitiveness or it is a process by which individuals, groups or institutions try to help men and women improve in these ways.'[30]

Such a definition incorporates formal and non-formal learning; it includes learning in institutional and non-institutional settings. Its focus is narrower than all learning by incorporating elements of intentionality and development. The persons or institutions *'seek to improve'* or *'try to help'* which implies either an active or at least conscious participation in learning by the individual. Similarly, there should be discernible development in skills, knowledge or inter-personal skills.

The term 'adult' at this stage is used primarily in a descriptive rather than a normative or philosophical sense. It refers to people who

have moved beyond initial education. Although 'initial education' for a majority may have terminated at 16 or earlier, a main focus is adults who have had some break from full-time education perhaps involving a period of employment.

4. The Emergence of the Thesis

> *'Real people have laboured, agonised, sweated, found joy, frustration and exhilaration; but we write about them and their adventures in learning as if they were cadavers or ciphers, not living, striving, loving, failing human beings'.*[31]

The structure of a thesis can be presented as though participating in research necessarily follows a clear, logical sequence. A problem is identified, suitable research methods are developed and results tabulated. A sequence of events can be more complex, less linear and undirectional, as numerous researchers have testified.[32] The definition of a problem may change as the literature is evaluated or as enquiry reveals problems or provokes new insights. Investigation can involve a reevaluation of theory. In turn, the nature of the original problem may come to be redefined. A record of changes in perception may be omitted from a thesis. Its content might over simplify the nature of the research process itself; this can include experiences of frustration with a particular approach; a realisation of the impracticality or inappropriateness of undertaking a statistical exercise; perhaps even a complete reorientation of the work as part of a personal learning process. Often ideas can become central to research by chance or good fortune - living in a city such as Edinburgh in the summer of 1982 and given a particular post enabled access to educational projects which would otherwise have remained unknown. These were a source of intellectual stimulus as well as practical revelation. A brief resumé of the totality of a research project, including substantial changes, should therefore be considered an essential component of any research record.

The initial interest in research (setting aside personal ambition and the occupational utility of higher degrees) lay in the continuing failure of conventional adult education agencies to engage substantial numbers of working class people in their provision. This seemed to be despite the expansion of adult education post-1945, as well as the substantial increase in aggregate expenditure on all forms of education especially in the 1960's and 1970's (accepting that adult education has remained a 'poor cousin' in terms of the proportion of resources devoted to it - even adopting the broadest definition such as that employed by

OECD).[33] The original proposal was to study varying perceptions of learning within and between social classes; what was the relationship between learning and class and what were the practical implications for the adult educator?

This idea was abandoned partly because of the extensive statistical exercise which may have been involved in ensuring representative samples within and between various social groups. There are obvious problems for an isolated researcher, without access to research funds, conducting a major empirical enquiry involving extensive questionnaires and interviews. A detailed analysis of the literature of adult education - particularly the debate within the Responsible Bodies on the theme of what a University's responsibilities to working class people should or should not be - or the WEA's alleged 'embourgoisement', encouraged a changing perspective. Questions were raised surrounding the relevance of much existing liberal adult education;[34] in particular, there was a criticism of the failure to acknowledge a political dimension within adult education. Education was one part of a social struggle in which some working class people were seen to be engaged.[35] (This was often related to a broader analysis of the social function of the educational system within 'capitalism'. Thus the institutions of schooling and adult education were said to reinforce the structure of class relationships within the economy and not vice-versa). Certain theoretical issues surrounding education and its social function are important in an analysis of participation.

Such reading and discussion led to an interest (encouraged by the then internal supervisor) in some radical ideas subsumed in the concept of recurrent education.[37] Educational theorists such as Houghton and Richardson[38] have advocated a complete transformation of the educational system away from a concentration on the child and towards the adult. It is argued that a challenge to the primacy of schooling and its alleged function of cultural reproduction and social adaptability is necessary. Participation in education should encourage a critical approach to existing social arrangements and a recognition of the importance of adults defining and shaping their own destiny. Educational theory, planning and practice should reflect the practical and ethical necessity of adults understanding and controlling social change. Schooling has been primarily a vehicle for a relatively passive familiarisation with the existing order. When society is constantly changing, there should be resources - such as education - through which people can learn to influence or determine its direction. Many

people are the victims of social processes over which they have no control.[39] It was unclear how a major theoretical or empirical analysis of recurrent education might be undertaken. It seemed too large a task for one project; nonetheless, two sets of ideas continued to influence the research. The first emerged from the psychological evidence against the dominant popular association of educability with the earlier phases of the life-cycle. For example, Cropley[40] has exhaustively reviewed the evidence used to support an association of intellectual growth with childhood and adolescence. He quotes the work of Horn and Donaldson:[41]

> *'Although writing from the point of view that the recent tendency has been to underestimate the degree of age-related decrement in intellectual functioning, especially on the part of those with a vested interest (such as writers in the area of lifelong education), they concluded that there is a need for caution in asserting that all intellectual abilities decline with age, that some abilities may not decline at all, and that whatever decline occurs may not commence as early as has been thought to be the case.'*[42]

Cropley has suggested that a major teleological error may have been committed; while some evidence may indicate greater intellectual growth at certain stages of childhood this can be correlated with the period of major investment by societies in formal education programmes.[43] Where evidence does exist of continuing learning in adulthood, intellectual capacity can continue to grow or at least is not subject to some inexorable process of decline. Such findings can be regarded as deeply ironic. It is increasingly clear that intellectual and cognitive ability (no analysis is attempted of other forms of learning) are in part a function of activity, confidence and continuing learning. This contrasts with research[44] into perceptions of education among the population at large. One explanation for the limited participation in formal programmes of adult education may be a widespread association of learning ability with childhood and early adolescence. People might not participate in adult education because of the association between education and schooling. At the same time intellectual development in adulthood may be dependent on the degree to which learning is expressed as a lifelong activity. Some researchers[45] have suggested continuing learning throughout life may correlate with psychological health as well as intellectual growth. This can be developed further to suggest an association between personal and more general social well-being and the degree to which any given culture facilitates adult learning. Possible correlations of this kind might be analysed through identifying patterns of social interaction and

organisation which may encourage or dispel any impetus towards intellectual or broader personal development. The development of a theory of participation in learning should include a consideration of evidence and sociological ideas concerned with the way particular institutional forms and other social relationships may be said to determine, or at least substantially influence, an individual's sense of intellectual or personal worth.

The second idea relates to the contemporary unpredictability of social change and its consequences. Discussions of recurrent education frequently involve trying to relate the implications of constant change for a paradigm of education based on the idea of *preparation for life*. Thus post-industrial societies have been characterised as involving far-reaching changes affecting individuals many times in their lives;[46] it has been suggested that learning and education might be important elements in any individual or collective resolution of personal or social difficulties which might stem from change. Those without access to learning have been compared with some immigrants entering different cultures: *'They may find their vocational skills are no longer valid ... values and morals are different, social status may be disrupted, treasured rituals may become foreign nonsense'*.[47] Similar experiences may have resulted from some technological change, for example de-skilling and increased unemployment. How does the idea of participation in learning relate to people who may be excluded from participation in significant economic activity? What are the consequences of social change for any theory of participation in learning?

The significance and extent of economic change and unemployment has been the subject of extensive research. The increase in unemployment among manual workers has been described as 'dramatic'.[48] It has been calculated that there has been a fall of nearly two millions in male manual employment in the economy over a ten year period to 1981. This was only very partially offset by a rise of just over half a million in male non-manual employment.[49] There is also an estimated decline of 30% in full-time employment of male manual workers with only a marginal increase in part-time female employment in manual work. There is a marked decline in women's full-time manual jobs which has been associated with the destruction of jobs and industrial capacity in sectors such as textiles.[50] There is also evidence to indicate a substitution of full-time work by part-time in the service sector of the economy.[51]

It should be noted that the absolute number of people engaged in all types of formal employment has decreased in the decade from 1971. Thus, in 1971 the total number of employees in work was 22,648,000 whereas by

September 1981 this figure had declined to 21,213,000. By June 1983 the figure had reduced further to an estimate of 20,360,000. This decline in the number of 'jobs' in the economy has only marginally been compensated for by increases in part-time employment. Thus, the equivalent figure for full-time workers in 1971 was 18,307,000; by 1981 this was reduced to 16,815,000 and by 1983 to 15,830,000. In part-time work the equivalent figures are 3,341,000, 4,499,000 and 4,530,000.[52] Some economists consider that these processes are part of a fundamental structural change in the economies of advanced industrial countries. There is a shift to capital intensive production methods which reduce the number of semi- and unskilled jobs and 'de-skill' others at an accelerating rate.[53]

Therefore a reflection on possible directions for research had revealed the possibility of connections between a number of factors. For example, the degree to which learning may be perceived as inappropriate and participation in education undesirable might relate to the consequences of exclusion from participation in other socially significant activities. Miseducative, dispersive, divergent experiences produced by social change might undermine any confidence to participate in learning. It might be significant to attempt to explore the impact of such experiences on those at the centre of such change - for example unemployed people. One of the Case Studies examined in Chapter Three is an adult education project devoted to unemployed people. The content of the programme is based on an attempt to relate to the problems faced by participants through a negotiation of course content. Likewise, many of the participants in the other projects explored in the Chapter were unemployed at the time the field work was taking place.

5. Propositions, Methodology and the Structure of the Thesis

A number of ideas had been raised in thinking about the research. The ideas can be taken slightly further and tabulated in the following way. They are expressed in the form of propositions which could be useful in an analysis of the theoretical basis of participation in adult learning and ways in which participation might be increased:

i. Participation in adult education should be viewed as a particular form of social participation and not as an isolated, discrete activity.

ii. Participation in learning may be related to perceptions of personal power/potential to influence events and this can be considered as largely socially determined.

iii. Certain forms of participation in socially relevant learning projects might be particularly significant for many working class people. Education might only be successful if it relates to the identification of social constraints or contradictions within culture and encourages social action to alter them. Conversely, learning may be more meaningful when action on a political and social level is used as a basis for adult education.

iv. Participation in education should not be seen as an activity which is an exclusive prerogative of formal educational institutions; rather for some people the most consequential learning may result from adult education in which the content and objectives are controlled by participants; this may not be compatible with the modus operandi of some institutions.

The four propositions are not presented as conventional research hypotheses, but are intended as a framework in a heuristic approach to research. They will be refined and developed as evidence is evaluated. This is done through a study of the literature and four Case Studies. The methodology used in the Case Study research has been defined as 'qualitative'. There is an emphasis on establishing the subjective interpretations of experience for those being 'researched'. Such an approach within adult education research has been exploited in the work of researchers such as Jones and Charnley,[54] Mezirow,[55] Newby[56] and Brookfield.[57] Their studies have proved useful in suggesting ways in which aspects of a person's consciousness, confidence and feelings could be best understood.

Chapter Two involves a critical analysis of the existing literature devoted to the theme of adults participating in learning and education. There is an associated discussion of methodological issues in undertaking research in this field. How does the existing literature and research support, problematise or refine the four propositions? To what extent have researchers succeeded in understanding the personal and social context of learning for working class participants? What methods may be open to the researcher to extend our understanding?

Chapter Three uses some qualitative methods in an attempt to understand the broader context of learning for a number of participants in four adult education projects. Each project, in varying ways, is concerned with the development of either a student-centred or more participatory approach to adult learning. There is an emphasis on engaging people who would not normally be involved in the formal adult education world. The participants live either in the 'inner city' or on

peripheral council estates. One of the case-studies - the Adult Learning Project in Gorgie/Dalry - has been inspired by the philosophy of Paulo Freire. The Project attempts to enrich learning opportunities for local people through their total involvement at all stages in the learning process. The second project is the Craigmillar Festival Society where learning and education are perceived as part of a process of personal and community self-improvement. The third project is an 'Unemployed Workers' course in which the organisers have sought to engage unemployed people in determining course content. In particular, there has been a systematic attempt to incorporate potential participants' *'wants and wishes'* (through the use of extensive interviews) into a course. The course was to emerge from a content analysis of the interview transcripts. The final project is concerned with the development of adult basic education in an area of multiple deprivation. The development of literacy, numeracy and problem-solving was considered to be part of a responsive, student-centred approach to learning which was thought to contrast with the inflexible predetermined nature of much existing adult education.

The Chapter includes an analysis of thirtyone interview transcripts which were the basis for recruitment and content of the Unemployed Workers' Course as well as lengthy conversations with five participants in each of the Projects. The objective is to compare, contrast and refine perspectives on participation in adult learning through an exploration of what may be significant to students. How do the perspectives of these adults compare with the values or ideology which the course organisers bring to the situation? How easily can the thought worlds of participants be incorporated into a philosophy of learning dialectically related to social charge?

Chapter Four attempts to apply psychological, sociological, philosophical and educational theories to the four propositions. Can the frustration or animation of adult learning be related to a person's well-being from the evidence in the literature and the Case Studies? How much can personal well-being be understood in isolation from culture? Are there shared experiences among some working class people which circumscribe the meaning and extent of learning? The first and second propositions are discussed in relation to sociological theories of power, determinism and alienation in a search for a wider theory of participation.

The third proposition is critically examined with reference to ideas such as those of Paulo Freire; how easily can adult learning be associated with political theories of learning in a first world culture?

Similarly, the problems of achieving participant control in learning are discussed through an examination of student expectation and the organisation of learning opportunities. A theory of participation is suggested from this analysis. The definition of learning and education are reassessed. .Is participation in adult learning an amalgam of intellectual, creative or emotional experience alone or can it be regarded as a broader process? Are there particular forms of organisation or interpersonal skills and behaviour which might maximise adult learning? How do these relate to wider forms of social organisation?

Chapter Five examines some of the practical implications of a theory. Suggestions are made for possible experiments in the 'classroom' and beyond to encourage adult learning. A curriculum model is developed which might act as a guide to 'good practice' for adult educators and others. The problems and possibilities of existing adult education agencies experimenting with different approaches to learning in inner-City contexts or on peripheral council estates are examined. A perspective on research and evaluation in such work is developed in which they might become more integrated elements within adult education practice. Methods of evaluating learning may need to be refined which could identify both quantifiable and qualitative changes. The thesis concludes with some reflections on the relationships between adult learning, wider values and policy choices in education. Choices in education may not simply be made according to educational criteria. They may be part of a wider debate about social organisation, the nature of the person and what is to be valued most in human society.

6. A Note on Values and the Researcher

It is difficult to imagine the personal values of a researcher being excluded from a piece of research of this kind. If education is concerned with the development of particular forms of learning, this could be especially so in research of this kind. The initial choice of a research project and the motivation to continue despite difficulties may only in part be explained by the satisfaction of intellectual enquiry. What is significant to the researcher might also be explained by reference to his or her broader values. It is important that the researcher is aware of the influence of these and their capacity to distort empirical enquiry. It is always a temptation to see those aspects of behaviour or 'hear' those ideas which most conform to what the researcher thinks should happen. It is important in any evaluation of the utility and integrity of a piece of research to understand some of the assumptions on which a project is based. As Berger[58] has concluded, the best that can be hoped for in social research is to be explicit about underlying values and to attempt to record what *is* rather than what might be.

The connection between the research process and a researcher's own values has been illustrated in other areas of social research. Thus Newby has written:

> *'... Had I not possessed the initial interest in farm workers, irrespective of a professional interest qua sociologist, then I would never have been able to devote five years of my life to studying their social situation with all the boredom, tedium, depression and sheer physical effort that it entailed.'*[59]

Such an interest in farm workers does not simply result from intellectual curiosity but also from a range of personal, political and ideological values. A desire to understand what determined their social identity was born of some sympathy with the position of farm workers. Newby does not disguise this but argues that it is possible to combine it with systematic investigation.

Therefore in social research it may be better to be explicit about underlying assumptions rather than to disguise them. A research report can become a potentially more comprehensive record if such values and assumptions are made explicit. Too often the problem in research may be the opposite - a failure to identify any underlying assumptions or any pressures in choosing an area for research. Some social science research is discussed almost entirely in technical terms; underlying values are obscured.

For example, Ruddock[60] has noted that in the literature of adult education programme planning and development tend to be reduced to the status of an applied skill. There is comparatively little reference to the social, political or moral context in which the educator must operate. This might include a requirement to achieve certain financial targets or the personal and moral issues which can be raised by spending time with one social group to the neglect of others.

There is little analysis in the literature of the political pressures which may force the adult educator to choose one group as a priority or to commit resources to one project as distinct from another. Adult educators can be seen to be operating in a socio-political environment in which some people are more able to articulate a claim on resources and to gain access to them.

A related problem is that much existing research into participation in adult education may be based on a range of assumptions which cannot be taken for granted. There is a tendency to consider all existing formal adult education as an uncomplicated 'good'. 'Participation' in such work is necessarily better than being uninvolved. It is assumed that particular institutional interests are compatible with all forms of learning. Such an assumption is not a self-evident truth.

There is no attempt in this work to disguise underlying values. Thus the purpose of learning and education may be based on broader assumptions surrounding what might constitute desirable social relationships or a greater sense of personal worth. For example, it is considered to be better to be self-aware than ignorant; it is preferable to be in control of one's own life than to be a passive instrument and recipient of others' decisions. The choice of people living in particular socio-economic contexts as fellow participants in 'dialogue' betrays a sense of unease at the deep inequality of educational opportunity which can be said to characterise the existing distribution of resources. The unease stems not only from many people's experiences which often appear to be mis-educative , stifling any dynamic towards growth. It is also based on a concern for democratic values in society - their strength may relate to the degree to which large numbers of people can experience and promote their expression in a range of social situations. A powerful motivation to survive an experience of a number of years of some 'boredom' and not a little frustration has been to delineate a theory of participation in learning which might contribute to a clearer understanding of these issues. The tradition of scholarship which Tawney represented combined a humanistic concern with a degree of intellectual rigour. The main

criterion to judge this thesis might well be the latter but it is hoped that this can be combined with a greater understanding of what may facilitate a wider participation in systematic learning.

REFERENCES

1. *R.H. Tawney: 'The Radical Tradition', Penguin 1964, p.89.*
2. *Ibid. p.88.*
3. *See my own article: 'The Tawney Legend Re-examined' in 'Studies in Adult Education', Vol.4. No.2, 1972, pp.105-119.*
4. *Ibid. pp. 105-7.*
5. *M. Stocks: 'The Workers' Educational Association: The First Fifty Years', Allen & Unwin, 1953, p.50.*
6. *R.H. Tawney: Op.Cit. p.90.*
7. *The three major works by P. Freire referred to in the study are: 'Education: The Practice of Freedom', Writers and Readers Publishing Co-operative, 1976. 'Pedagogy of the Oppressed', Penguin Education, 1972. 'Cultural Action for Freedom', Penguin Education, 1972.*
8. *See J.L. Thompson (Ed.): 'Adult Education for a Change', Hutchinson, 1980; more recently 'Learning Liberation: Women's Response to Men's Education', Croom Helm, 1983.*
9. *The major work is T. Lovett: 'Adult Education, Community Development and the Working Class', Nottingham Studies in the Theory and Practice of the Education of Adults, No.12, 2nd Edn. 1982.*
10. *See for example the debate surrounding the article by R. Shaw: 'Adult Education and the Working Class', 'Studies in Adult Education', Vol.2, 1970, pp.1-17. Also one response: K. Jackson and T. Lovett: 'Universities and the WEA: An Alternative Aporoach', 'Adult Education' Vol.44, No.2, 1971 pp. 100-7.*
11. *L.R. West: 'The Tawney Legend Re-examined': Op.Cit. pp.105-119.*
12. *See ACACE: 'Adults - their Educational Experience and Needs', ACACE, Leicester, 1982, pp.15-16.*
13. *Ibid. p.13.*
14. *See ACACE: 'A Strategy for the Basic Education of Adults', ACACE, Leicester, 1979; also: 'Adults' Mathematical Ability and Performance', ACACE, 1982.*
15. *M. Woodhall: 'The Scope and Costs of the Educational Training of Adults in Britain', ACACE, Occasional Paper Four, 1980.*
16. *Ibid.*
17. *Extensive reference to Freire's writing is made in later Chapters, see in particular pp.44-47 and pp.87-91.*
18. *J. Trenaman: 'Communication and Comprehension', Longmans, 1957.*
19. *For example, K. Percy et al: 'Post-initial Education in the North West of England: A Summary of Provision'. ACACE, Leicester, 1983. See in particular the limitations of this approach discussed in pp.228-235.*
20. *See N. Keddie: 'Adult Education: an Ideology of Individualism' in J.L. Thompson: Op.Cit. pp.45-64, particularly pp.58-64.*
21. *J.L. Thompson: 'Learning Liberation, Women's Response to Men's Education', Op.Cit. pp.21.27.*
22. *See R.M. Gagne: 'Essentials of Learning for Instruction', Dryden Press, 1975, p.120.*

23. *For a discussion of this issue at greater length see R. Ruddock: 'Perspectives on Adult Education', Manchester Monographs No.2. 1980, pp.23-28.*

24. *E. Durkheim: 'Education and Sociology', Collier-MacMillan, 1950, p.115.*

25. *F.W. Jessup: 'Lifelong Learning: A Symposium on Continuing Education', Pergamon, Oxford, 1969.*

26. *H. Wiltshire: 'The Concepts of Learning and Need in Adult Education', p.146 in A. Rogers (Ed.): 'The Spirit and the Form, Essays in Adult Education in Honour of Professor Harold Wiltshire', Nottingham Studies in the Theory and Practice of the Education of Adults, Dept. of Adult Education, Nottingham, 1976, pp.145-148.*

27. *This idea is based on an article by M. Oakeshott: 'Learning and Teaching', in R.S. Peters (Ed.): 'The Concept of Education', Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1967, pp.151-157.*

28. *P.H. Hirst and R.S. Peters: 'The Logic of Education', Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1970, p.75.*

29. *Ibid. p.25.*

30. *C.O. Houle: 'The Design of Education', Jossey-Bass, San Francisco, 1972, p.32.*

31. *J. Roby Kidd: 'Research Needs in Adult Education', 'International Council for Adult Education', 'Studies in Adult Education', Vol.13 No.1, Aug. 1981, p.3.*

32. *For example, see the comments on his research by S. Brookfield: 'Adult Learners, Adult Education and the Community', Open University Press, 1983. pp. 6-7.*

33. *For a detailed evaluation of the costs of the education and training of adults, see M. Woodhall's study: Op.Cit.*

34. *For example, K. Jackson: 'The Marginality of Community Development: implications for adult education' 'The International Review of Community Development', 1973.*

35. *The classic text in this tradition has become T. Lovett: 'Adult Education Community Development and the Working Class', Op.Cit. see in particular p.17.*

36. *The idea of the subordination of schooling and education to dominant social and economic requirements has been particularly developed in the work of C. Jencks; see: 'Inequality', Allen Lane, 1974.*

37. *This is not to imply that all notions of recurrent education are 'radical'. For example, P. Furter has asserted in 'The Planner and Lifelong Education', UNESCO, IIEP, 1977, p.287:*

> *"Since recurrent education eschews the problems of authority and does not recognise sufficiently the importance of social (and political) conflicts in the preparation of programmes of education, it can only offset the effect of inequality rather than deal with it at its roots."*

38. *V. Houghton and K. Richardson: 'Recurrent Education. A Plea for Lifelong Learning', Ward Lock Educational, 1974.*

39. *See V. Houghton's intoductory essay, Ibid. pp.1-9.*

40. *A.J. Cropley: 'Lifelong Education - A Psychological Analysis', Pergamon, UNESCO, 1977, pp.53-78.*

41. *J.L. Horn and G. Donaldson: 'On the Myth of Intellectual Decline in Adulthood, 'American Psychologist'. 1976, 31. pp.701-719.*

42. *A.J. Cropley: Op.Cit. p.57.*

43. *Ibid. pp.61-63.*

44. *The major work in the field is by J. Trenaman: Op.Cit. p.p. 183-193, based on a D.Phil. thesis. The major national study by ACACE: 'Adults: their Educational Experience and Needs', ACACE, Leicester, 1982, would add weight to these findings.*

45. *I am thinking particularly of the major studies of pre and post-retirement education which have explored this theme: C. Philipson & P. Strang: 'The Impact of Pre-Retirement Education: A Longitudinal Study', University of Keele, 1983, and A. Coleman: 'Preparation for Retirement in England and Wales', NIAE 1982.*

46. *H. James: 'A Sociological Perspective', in R.H. Dave: 'Foundations of Lifelong Education', Pergamon/UNESCO, 1976, pp.129-185.*

47. *A.J. Cropley: 'Some Psychological Reflections', in R. Dave: Op.Cit. pp. 204-5.*

48. *For a comprehensive analysis of these trends see Trade Union Research Unit: 'Labour Market Issues', No.2, Oct.1982, Ruskin College, Oxford, particularly pp.3-5.*

49. *TURU: Op.Cit. pp.3-5.*

50. *Ibid.*

51. *Ibid.*

52. *These figures are taken from Department of Employment: 'Census of Employment', D. of E. Gazette, 1971, 1981 and Dec. 1983.*

53. *TURU: Op.Cit. No.7, June 1982, p.3. For an interesting discussion of the educational issues see an unpublished paper by V.P. Houghton and T.E. Gew: 'Management Science and Recurrent Education', Faculty of Educational Studies, the Open University, p.26.*

54. *A.H. Charnley and H.A. Jones: 'The Concept of Success in Adult Literacy', ALBSU, 1979.*

55. *J. Mezirow, G.G. Darkenwald and A.B. Know: 'Last Gamble on Education', Washington, D.C., Adult Education Association of the USA, 1975.*

56. *H. Newby: 'In the Field: Reflections on the Study of Suffolk Farm Workers' in C. Bell and H. Newby (Eds.): 'Doing Sociological Research', Allen and Unwin, 1977.*

57. *S. Brookfield: Op.Cit; in particular pp.6-7.*

58. *P.L. Berger: 'An invitation to Sociology', Penguin, 1966, pp.15-16.*

59. *H. Newby: Op.Cit. p.108.*

60. *R. Ruddock: 'Perspectives in Adult Education'. Op.Cit. 22-32.*

CHAPTER TWO - A REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

1. Introduction.
2. Participation in adult education in context.
3. Five themes in the literature.
4. Research into participation in adult learning and education - some general observations.
5. The propositions and the literature, some initial conclusions.

---

1. Introduction

The four propositions consist of socio-psychological ideas, related to approaches to teaching and learning and curriculum development. For example, the idea of participation might be broadened both to incorporate a wider social context as well as a pedagogy which may add to the significance of learning. Such ideas have been largely tangential in most of the literature and research. A main concern has been to establish the social composition of participants in formal programmes. There have been attempts to explain the distribution of existing adult education participation among different social groups but this remains relatively underdeveloped. A similar observation can be made about much of the international literature where there is a considerable body of evidence tabulating the characteristics of participants. Many of these studies tend to be primarily descriptive rather than analytical or theoretical. There are important exceptions to this but many commentators have observed an apparent satisfaction with 'headcounts' of those involved in formal programmes. The more qualitative, theoretical issues raised in the introduction have received relatively little attention.

The development of theory - an identification of general patterns in behaviour and a search to explain them - has emerged from two main sources. The first consists of attempts to explain perceptions of education among the adult population and how these influence participation in formal adult education. The second, primarily associated with American researchers, has been concerned to identify and evaluate major sources of motivation in adult learning. One extension of this work has been some psychological research which is largely behaviourist in orientation. The objective has been to measure factors in the immediate socio-psychological environment of the individual as a basis for the development of predictive theory.

There are two other loci of theoretical discussion which may merit more research. One area has emerged from attempts to establish and explain the extent and quality of independent adult learning. It has been suggested that such learning may be a phenomenon of some social significance and requires incorporation into research design and theory. The other development has largely resulted from some radical critiques of existing society, including institutionalised education. A debate has centred on the degree to which particular forms of socially relevant, 'maladaptive' learning provide the basis of both an alternative

pedagogy and theory of participation. Some elements within this debate result from ideological concerns which have long been central issues to some educators; for example, some theorists assume (or base their analysis on) a need for major social change, part of which involves radical alternatives to existing education. It is argued that much formal adult education reinforces rather than is a source of challenge to the existing social order or educational inequality. Adult education is conceived as but one part of a dominant hegemonic culture which induces feelings of inhibition, inferiority and inactivity in many working class people. A culture of silence to use Freire's words, is said to result.[1] What is to be noted in some aspects of this debate is a particular stress on a relationship between the quality of learning and the nature of classroom interaction. 'Learning liberation', to use Thompson's description,[2] is as much dependent on democratic interaction in learning as any accumulation of knowledge. Content and process are interdependent. Note has already been made of Tawney's[3] ideal of a community of equals being an essential prerequisite of an *adult education*. The work of Thompson[4] and Lovett[5] has reinvigorated this debate. They have sought to provide some theoretical justification for approaches to adult education which place a more egalitarian form of participation as a precondition of learning for many working class people.

The literature and research devoted to participation in adult learning can be classified in a number of ways. A five part schema is suggested as a useful way to classify the available evidence and to analyse the major themes in the literature. It is not intended to imply a neatly compartmentalised frame of reference - indeed much of the evidence and discourse overlaps; rather it seems a useful approach since it reflects both research patterns and existing theoretical debates which have been noted by others in analyses of the literature.[6]

i. Literature focusing on the characteristics of participants in formal programmes; this would include descriptions of the social class, age, sex etc. of participants. This literature has also included attempts to *explain* the social composition of the 'student' body as well as 'non-participation'. Such explanations have consisted primarily in locating perceptions of formal education within more general social attitudes and experiences including earlier education.

ii. A research tradition mainly concerned with the identification of motivational factors in learning. This has led to some interest in developing predictive theory. Such research is often psychologically based.

iii. Locational issues in relation to adult education - the timing, accessibility and location of existing adult education provision. This also might include the degree to which 'provision' can be said to be co-ordinated and planned coherently and thus any 'system' of formal provision can be identified. Subsumed in this category could be situational factors of the type identified by Cross;[7] for example, lack of time due to job responsibilities, lack of money or child care facilities which often compound locational problems.

iv. Research into participation in learning unconnected with the formal institutions of adult education; such learning has been regarded as qualitatively distinct from a mere catalogue of incidental learning. It has been defined as 'major deliberate effort(s) to gain certain knowledge or skill (or to change in some other way).'[8]

v. A body of action-research influenced by certain sociological and political perspectives on the distribution of power within society. Much of this work has been undertaken with working class people or in relation to the women's movement.

2. Participation in Adult Education in Context

It is difficult to review the literature in this field without an awareness of empirical research into the relationship between the education system more broadly and social structure. Major longitudinal studies of the educational biographies of samples of the population,[9] as well as the other substantial empirical research,[10] indicate the important relationship between social background and educational achievement - defined according to social mobility and high status certification. The context of participation in adult education is a maldistribution of educational opportunity which can in major part be correlated with social class. Recent research, focusing on the 'origins' and 'destinations' of participants in formal education has provided a rich body of empirical evidence. Social class and education are closely related variables throughout all stages of formal education.

Halsey et al have concluded, from an exhaustive study of samples of the male population in 1972, that 'class differentials widen at each rung of the education ladder'.[11] The boy from the working class was much more likely than his service class[12] contemporary to drop out of school as soon as the minimum learning age was reached, was less likely to continue his school career into the sixth form and to enter a university or some other form of education after school.

'... there was a persistent class difference in survival rate ... a service class boy in our sample was four times as likely as his working class peer to be found at school at the age of 16, eight times as likely at the age of 17, ten times as likely at the age of 18, and eleven times as likely to enter a university.' [13]

Halsey and his research team utilised *'summary familial and educational biographies collected from a sample of 10,000 men living in England and Wales in 1972'.*[14] (It will be noted that the sample was confined to men. Halsey[15] justifies this through reference to the unavoidable historical character of mobility studies; *'male occupations were the major articulation between on the one hand nuclear families and on the other the class and status structure of Britain'* during the period being studied. To exploit previous studies based on the educational biographies of males, it was necessary to exclude women.) Raffe[16] has utilised the same data and has drawn similar conclusions for further education. The reforms in further education following the Crowther Report were seen to provide 'an alternative route' to educational certification and professional and other higher status occupations. Although evidence emerges that those with marginally less prestigious 'school' qualifications have entered further education, individuals from the upper-middle and lower-middle classes were more likely to enter part-time courses and to be taking higher level courses. ACACE's[17] summary of other very recent research findings serves to compound the picture so clearly drawn by Halsey and others. Figures taken from the Central Policy Review Unit's Studies and the DES/SED indicate that:[18]

i. Nearly two out of three young people (65% in 1977) leave school at 16 and do not go to any form of full-time or higher education.

ii. About 15% of young people leave school at 16 without any formal qualifications at all. One in five (21% of all school leavers) gain at least one CSE pass. It is largely those with low academic results who leave for employment at 16. Of those early school leavers, less than a quarter continue with a release from work for part-time study.

iii. The proportion of young people entering higher education in any given year reached a high point of 14.2% in the early 1970s, but declined in the late 1970s.

iv. The Robbins Report considered that there was a vast mass whose perfomance merited entry to higher education and beyond, but that this depends greatly on how they have lived and been taught beforehand. Whilst the 1966 and 1971 censuses showed that just under two

thirds of economically active males were employed in manual work, their children have consistently obtained less than a third of the first degree places in universities. The development of the polytechnics seems not to have improved opportunities for working class children. A national survey of polytechnic students found that 60% of all students had fathers in non-manual occupations. For students on degree courses the figure was 64%.

The picture in Scotland is not substantially different. Grant[19] has recently provided a useful summary of research data and has concluded that:

> *'It is, of course, nonsense to claim that the Scottish Universities are, or ever were, open and classless institutions. The 'lad o' pairts' from the croft, bag of meal on his shoulder and sound learning in his head, pulling himself up the social ladder by talent and sheer hard work, did exist, but he was scarcely typical. The social composition of university intakes has hardly changed in thirty years, and still shows a marked class bias.'* [20]

Raffe has examined the destination in 1973 of those who left Scottish schools in 1971-2.[21] His focus was primarily on further education and his conclusions are similar to the evidence from England and Wales. There are some slight variations; Scottish further education does compare more favourably with universities - that is in the 'participation' of more working class students; this was especially true of the 'non-advanced' sectors of further education. There is though no major quantitative difference north of the border. SED studies[22] have concluded that Scotland has one of the highest 'drop-out' routes from 'education' in Western Europe after compulsory schooling has been completed.

It is clear that participation in adult learning can only be understood in such a context. Educational 'success' - defined in terms of conventional certification or occupational differences between generations - is strongly influenced by social class 'origins'. The social class bias in formal adult education programmes seems to mirror patterns already established in the dominant 'front-end' model. It is difficult to imagine programmes of adult education profoundly affecting such patterns of unequal opportunity. The complex process of learning being realised in adulthood is mediated through the experiences of initial education - for many such experience may have been miseducative. At the very least, a quantitative analysis of participation in formal adult education programmes tends to indicate a sector which reinforces rather

than mitigates social and educational inequality. For many education in childhood and adolescence has appeared to be a terminal experience. For a majority, 'termination' is at 16 or earlier.

3. Five Themes in the Literature

i. The social composition of participants in formal adult education and possible explanations

The literature devoted to participation in adult education is primarily descriptive and confined to the formal sector of adult education. There is a surfeit of studies tabulating the characteristics of participants according to age, gender, social class and previous experience of formal education. A number of researchers have sought to develop explanatory theory from such data or from their own empirical work, but as yet this area is relatively weak in the literature.[23] There is a sense in which quantification has been seen to be sufficient in itself rather than the basis for a rigorous theory to explain either factors influencing participation in programmes or the fact of non-participation by a majority.[24]

There are important exceptions to this - not the least the work of Trenaman.[25] He sought to exploit statistical correlation techniques to relate the meaning of education and learning among groups of adults to the pattern of participation in formal adult education. In turn he was concerned to establish whether any correlation existed between educational attitudes and other 'deeper' social attitudes. In particular, he was anxious to define the significance of experiences of schooling to perceptions of learning and education in adulthood.[26]

A population sample was used to collect a large assortment of statements of opinion expressed towards formal education. Some 300 statements were then reduced by various analytical processes (Thurstone scaling, bipolar and group factor analysis, scalagram analysis using an adaptation of the Guttman methods and subjective classifications by a group of educationists) to be endorsed or not by those being interviewed. According to Trenaman 'this scale proved to be reliable in the sense that individuals, when retested, gave consistent responses and different population samples also produced similar responses'.[27]

A population sample of 1000 people was used in the London area. An additional sample was also taken from the Oxford area for 'certain purposes'. From an analysis of responses Trenaman concluded that 45% of the sample could be said to be resistant to new ideas and higher

(i.e. 'educational') values.[28] He also concluded that participation in adult or further education is largely dependent on the influence of earlier educational experience:[29]

> *'The whole further educational provision ... is a reinforcing rather than a remedial process. Thus, the proportions of people undertaking any kind of further study or training (even including craft and recreational classes) range from 90% of those who reached the top forms of grammar schools to 13% of those who left elementary schools.'*[30]

Trenaman tries to explain such 'resistance' by reference to the possibility of natural reactions to a succession of 'selection barriers' in educational and occupational mobility leading to rewards and status.[31] It is suggested that people who are continually rejected may come to resent the system which has excluded them. Trenaman is cautious in his conclusions. In effect he suggests a correlation between participation in adult education and success in schooling and upward social mobility. Conversely 'failure' in school and exclusion from high status occupations can be related to non-participation. A process of being excluded from 'socially valued occupations' and educational opportunity is mutually reinforcing.

There are some difficulties with Trenaman's analysis. For example, what he calls *'the fundamental values'* in education (the respect for truth and tolerance and an awareness of social responsibilities) are *'to some extent shared all the way down the scale' ... 'But at the lower levels, almost without exceptions, people reject expressions of the very values they claim to respect'.*[32] It is not clear how to interpret this. It is uncertain whether people are necessarily rejecting 'higher values' or some of the institutions which are seen to enshrine them. In a sense, Trenaman's work illustrates the limitations of some questionnaire techniques; there may well be a need to probe deeper into significant attitudes and their precise meaning to the individual. The research concludes on a note of ambiguity.

What is not ambiguous is that those with satisfactory earlier education tend to want more. Those gaining most from initial education (defined as a continuous period in schooling and post-compulsory education) tend to predominate in formal adult education programmes. Recent research undertaken by ACACE[33] has confirmed the findings of the earlier NIAE, Russell and Alexander Report studies.[34] A survey has been made of the *'educational needs of the adult population in England and Wales'.*[35] This was undertaken in 1980 through structured personal interviews with

a statistically validated sample of 2,460 adults aged 17-75.[36] The evidence indicates that one adult in three left school at the minimum leaving age, has had no form of education or training afterwards and has never taken any form of examination.[37]

Taking all forms of adult, continuing education and training, the number of adults engaged in some form of education or training in any one year is approximately 12% of the adult population.[38] Most will never enter. 51% of the adult population have never engaged in any kind of education/training since completing their initial education. Equally, most of the 51% who had never undertaken any sort of continuing education had finished their initial education at the minimum school leaving age.[39]

Many more local studies have produced similar findings. Hanna discovered that the student population in adult education classes in Leeds consisted of *'the better educated, holders of jobs or skills, those who live in residential areas ...'*[40] Although there had been a substantial increase in enrolments since 1945, those with minimum formal education and low economic status remained outside. Arriens revealed that participation in leisure activities in new towns followed a similar pattern, with people of low socio-economic status being underrepresented in activities. This was despite deliberate attempts at social integration.[41]

Two major developments in adult education in recent years were in part a reflection of a concern over these trends, crystallised in Russell's call for more attention to be paid to the disadvantaged.[42] The Open University and the Literacy Campaign illustrated a desire to involve wider sections of the population in different levels of learning experience; both though provide evidence of the difficulties in breaking new ground with working class people.

The Open University's origins relate, at least in part, to a long-standing wish in adult education to provide higher education opportunities for those gaining little or nothing from their previous education.[43] McIntosh and Calder have demonstrated, through a study of the first year's intake of students, that although the University had made a considerable contribution to the provision of higher education for those denied access by the 'closed' nature of conventional provision, the social composition of the University was very unrepresentative of the adult community as a whole.[44] (It is important to note though that Open University students are not classified according to a parent's occupation whereas other University students are. The researchers go to considerable lengths to stress the working class credentials of many students' parents but this

cannot disguise the marginal involvement of manual workers in particular.)[45]

More recent reviews of research evidence suggest that the Open University is servicing the needs of a 'new population'; according to the students' own perceptions, 52% of their fathers were in manual work and a further 28% were in lower grade 'white collar' occupations.[46] (This compares with a national figure of 59% of males being involved in manual work in 1971.)[47] While the significance of this should be noted, it is still some way removed from the major breakthrough for working class people that some had thought possible.

The Literacy Campaign can be regarded as a significant development in British adult education. Its recruitment patterns indicate only a limited success. Jones estimated that only 8% or one in thirteen of the target group of two million had been reached. Further 'participants' may have been unrepresentative of the target group as a whole in that almost half the students were in relatively skilled and demanding occupations.[48]

Such a profile of social bias in education and the unrepresentativity of participants in adult education compared with the total population, is by no means confined to the United Kingdom. Thus Dalin found that in Norway in 1965, 75% of those over 40 had no education beyond 7 years or less of basic education,[49] while Rudolph has argued that:

> *'a further feature of the (German) situation is that unskilled workers, who were disadvantaged in their first phase of education, continue to be neglected when a second educational chance is given by organisations outside the formal system. The 'Volkshochschule' had 2,200,000 participants in 1970 but the ratio of workers was extremely low.'* [50]

In Holland over 25% of the adult population had had no more education than 6 years at elementary school.[51] Johnstone and Rivera's American study revealed that only 4% of participants had no schooling as against 47% who had received more than 16 years of education.[52]

Although much of the above data applies to adult education provision which is not explicitly related to training for vocational skills, in or out of employment, a similar picture emerges from a study of training programmes. A recent report by Killeen and Bird[53] reveals that 'Paid Educational Leave' is weighted heavily in favour of young well educated white collar men in their 20s. Managers and professionals are ten times more likely to receive it than other workers and some groups such as labourers and unskilled manual workers, sales workers, service workers and clerical workers are lucky to receive it at all. Belorgay has noted

that in France, where an Act of 1971 guarantees to all workers the right to training or educational leave, actual participation was biased towards higher status occupations.[54] Likewise Bolo[55] noted that in a survey of 104 firms employing a total of 62,534 people there were only 21 applications and those were from the more skilled elements in the work force. Charnley,[56] in a study of P.E.L. in France, the Federal Republic of Germany and Sweden concluded that manual workers seemed to share little in the arrangements compared with foremen, technicians and executives.

An analysis of the under-representation of some social groups in formal adult education and training programmes raises two further and related issues. Age and gender may be significant variables in their own right in influencing the extent and nature of participation in adult learning. There appear to be other cultural factors among the adult population surrounding 'ageing' and gender which may transcend class differences. Further negative social experiences may result from growing older or being female to compound other social barriers.

The ACACE research[57] clearly indicates that the older a person is, the less likely he/she is to be found in the formal world of adult education and training. Unsurprisingly, this is particularly marked in some training programmes; in one extensive study of two Skill Centres providing 'TOPS' courses, the overwhelming number of trainees were in their mid-20s, while there was a minimal involvement by people over the age of 40.[58]

Participation in adult education by women tends to predominate in 'non-vocational adult education' with greater numbers involved than men.[59] This is open to possible misinterpretation since women are greatly underrepresented in 'conceptual' and work-related activities such as vocational training and professional updating.[60] Some interpretations of this pattern of participation have regarded existing adult education as supporting rather than challenging sex stereotyping and traditional roles. Thus non-vocational adult education for women has been ironically described as 'vocational' - supporting the traditional 'work' of 'mother' or 'sex object' through subjects such as cookery, beauty culture, keep fit etc.[61] For both women and older people the extent of participation decreases among lower socio-economic groups.

Research has thus helped to provide a picture of participants in formal adult education; it is clearly influenced by the inter-related factors of social class and initial education. Such statistical aggregates are though only a basis for the development of theory; where some attempt has been made to establish causal relationships, as in the work of Trenaman, a need for further research and theory has been acknowledged.

Trenaman's study lends support to the idea that participation in adult learning cannot be divorced from broader experiences of social participation and that these may be largely determined by social class. Thus, initial education and the experience of barriers to educational and occupational opportunity may encourage negative attitudes towards learning. If a relationship is accepted between some social contexts and power - that is an ability to shape the course of events - this may affect the degree to which continuing learning seems relevant. Those who feel most excluded from socially valued activity - for example, paid work (such as those in unemployment or 'retirement') - may be less likely to participate in adult learning. An ability to influence significant events and a feeling of social worth may encourage positive attitudes towards self and learning. Conversely, powerlessness and low status may lead to personal denigration and diminish or obscure the relevance of learning.

Such a theory is tentative; this major area of research into participation in adult education lacks any clearly established theoretical tradition. Explanation or interpretive theory have sometimes seemed secondary to the task of data collection.[62] Thompson has suggested that adult educators are suspicious of attempts at theorising, bred as they are in the English empirical tradition and the cult of the practitioner.[63] Certainly, the assumptions on which 'provision' may be based and the influence of socio-political contexts in the definition of formal adult education programmes appear to be neglected.[64] A perception of adult education as a *service* to be delivered *to* people may explain a sameness throughout much formal provision and its apparent remoteness from many people.[65] For example, a desire for adults *to participate in adult education*, that is formal provision, might be complicated by such institutional provision being seen as part of a more general 'system' by potential participants. Such a system may stir feelings of rejection or exclusion.

Such interpretations of the evidence are tentative. More effort needs to be made to interpret statistical findings. A large number of researchers seem to have found comfort in numbers alone. Such statistics are at best a guide to a theory of participation in learning rather than being sufficient unto themselves.

ii. Motivation in learning and the idea of participation

Courtney[66] has noted that a number of American researchers have focused strongly on the motivation of adult learners far more systematically and extensively than British researchers. Indeed, the latter have

been defined as *'rather weak-kneed and turgid'*.[67] The work of Hoy, Johnstone and Rivera[68] has revealed the many and varied reasons adults give for coming on courses. The most important is often quoted as the fact that education is seen as a way to become better informed, the desire for knowledge. A close second appears to be the 'vocational', instrumental or 'goal' motives. A problem (which is recognised in the literature) is the comparative 'weighting' to be given to these various factors and their inter-relationships. Houle has been regarded as a significant influence in attempting to sharpen the focus surrounding these problems with his tripartite formulation of - (a) goal orientated, (b) activity orientated and (c) learning orientated motivation among adults.[69] A difficulty with Houle's work is that his typology is based on a limited sample of students and that among his group *'all had goals which they wished to achieve or found the process of learning enjoyable and significant and that all felt that learning is worthwhile for its own sake'*.[70] A major criticism of Houle's approach and developments of it is that participation scales, constructed along psychometric lines and channelled through the sieve of factor analysis can easily confuse two strands in an analysis of participation - how much is the act of entry a function of response to immediate circumstances or a function of more abiding values which favour educational endeavour.[71] Further, there is little analysis of the relationships of participation in learning to general patterns of social participation. The social context of adult life, experience and opportunity remains largely unexplored. This weakness in the research material has been noted in discussion of the idea of 'self-concept' and motivation. Rubenson,[72] reviewing available evidence, has asserted that people with a 'positive self evaluation' can be expected to get further in achievement-orientated situations than those with a negative self-evaluation. The act of 'participation' is said to reflect a belief, however temporary and open to change, in personal learning capabilities. But such a 'belief' - a perception of personal worth and the instrumentality of pursuing learning - is difficult to disentangle from social context. There is an abundance of detailed research[73] which suggests that the process of self-evaluation is deeply influenced by social experience. People may come to see themselves through observing and evaluating the attitudes and feelings towards them of those around them. Those who are held in high esteem or with strong relational/emotional ties may be especially important in this respect.

Rubenson has attempted to incorporate a social dimension to motivational theory by developing the expectancy /valence theory.[74] Expectancy

is defined as a belief in the probability that particular actions would lead to certain outcomes. Valence refers to the affective orientation towards particular outcomes. A person's behaviour is a result of a field of forces with direction and magnitude. The assumption is that people choose among alternative acts the one that corresponds to the strongest positive or weakest force. Rubenson accepts a social dynamic within such 'forces' and that people who do not see participation in adult education as a means of satisfying certain needs may well be influenced by social constraints.[75]

Bergsten has reviewed this work and has concluded that more testing and modelling may be necessary *'in order to base it more firmly and analytically'*.[76] Such a 'theory' is as yet at a formative stage. Whilst accepting the provisional nature of such 'theory', the assumptions on which it is based can still be questioned. The idea of a 'testable theory' and individual behaviour being reduced to but one element in a stimulus/response chain might devalue the complexity of the individual's identity and social context. Bergsten has claimed that such a theory views the *'person as a thinking and reasoning human being'*.[77] If this is so it may be important to place his or her 'voice' and interpretation of experience more centrally in any analysis even though this may complicate a search for testable hypotheses. This is a source of constant concern in any discussion of behaviourist approaches to the explanation of human action. ('Behaviourist' is taken to describe a particular tradition within social science, which stresses the importance of establishing testable theory and a predictive 'science', in the manner of the natural scientist.) There may be an over-emphasis on psychological and social factors which might be more easily measured and a neglect of the problem presented by each action ultimately being mediated through an individual. The individual constitutes a unique configuration of consciousness, experience and perception which may not be easily quantified and thereafter aggregated into data providing the basis for testable hypotheses .

iii. Locational and organisational issues

There is a considerable body of literature devoted to analysis of the location and organisation of formal adult education. There has been a desire to understand the degree to which the location, timing and organisation of programmes may increase or diminish participation. For example, Newman referred directly to problems stemming from the physical location of much provision:

'Using schools in the evening does not always help. It requires faith on entering some adult education premises to believe that anything but a repetition of one's worst school experience could ever take place in such surroundings.' [78]

The Russell Report was concerned about unnecessary formality in procedures and arrangements which could act as an additional deterrent to hesitant students.[79] Rogers and Groomsbridge have criticised the scheduling, timing and siting of classes as well as lack of child care facilities for women.[80] This focus on planning, organisation and location within formal provision has been sharpened by the recent ACACE research reports. These have been concerned with identifying particular ways in which the idea of continuing education might be practically developed or 'practice' made more accessible.

For example, Cross identified locational difficulties which may compound 'dispositional factors' such as limited perceptions of learning ability, lack of confidence etc.[81] These include 'practices and procedures' within institutions *'which discourage working adults from taking part in education, for example inconvenient schedules or locations, high fee levels, and the lack of appropriate provision'.*[82] It is suggested that insufficient attention is paid by providing agencies or at a national policy planning level to 'situational' factors in an adult's life: for example, limited time because of 'work'; lack of money when young *'or lack of child care arrangements for parents'.*[83] Some researchers also suggest that participation in certain types of formal adult education is likely to vary since provision is uneven and inadequate. This has been particularly noted in the field of adult basic education. ACACE estimates that *'at least 3 million people in Britain'* lack basic literacy and computational skills;[84] despite this, there is an absence of appropriate programmes and suitable resources in many areas to enable this problem to be tackled. For example, there may be a lack of educational guidance services, financial support to learners or geographically accessible local centres.[85]

Lack of resources or the absence of provision is considered by some researchers to be only one part of the problem. Percy has suggested that a lack of coherence or system within post-initial education, at both a national and local level creates 'barriers' to participation.[86] In short the organisation of existing provision within and between agencies is incoherent. It is asserted that there is no 'system of provision' in post-initial education:

'There is not a comprehensive system of post-initial education

visible with agreed sequencing of the existing different levels, types and modes of learning opportunities for adults.' [87]

Such 'incoherence' is regarded as an important barrier to increased participation. The formal sector of post-initial education can be said to compound the maldistribution of educational opportunity within the population; organisational arrangements are unclear, educational policy is obscure and there is a lack of clarity over goals. Likewise, 'levels and types of pedagogy' are described as uncertain.[88]

A difficulty in research is to disentangle such 'barriers' to participation from other more general 'social barriers'. The P.I.E. Project Report noted that *'attitudes in society towards the education of adults are the major barrier to the development of increased provision'.*[89] In particular, the association of education with schooling and its unhappy connotations for many may be as significant a factor as conceptual and organisational confusion within formal adult education institutions. There is considerable evidence to suggest that access to a variety of forms of adult education is difficult but it might be simplistic to assume that the removal of certain barriers will change the situation dramatically.[90] Further, Percy has questioned how much the conventional meaning of the term participation has been analysed by practitioners.[91] The imagery of 'barriers' may evoke a view of learning and education provided by others, which must be made more accessible. A concern for the learner as a full participant in the creation of educational activity does not fit easily with such metaphors. It may well be the case that until such qualitative issues are more widely understood among adult educators, it will be difficult to envisage large-scale and geographically widespread experiments with alternative ways of organising adult learning.

iv. Independent Learning

Research into 'independent learning' is comparatively undeveloped. 'Independent learning' is normally associated with adults having little or no contact with the formal adult education sector but who are said to be engaged in substantial and successful learning. Tough has argued that independent learning, at least in a North American context, is a social phenomenon which has been underestimated by most researchers.[91] Clearly such an assertion may have significance for a theory of participation. If participation in successful *independent* learning (in which the learner has control over content and objectives and does not rely on any formal, accredited agencies) is a major social phenomenon, such learning should

be a focus of major study. It would be relevant to examine its extent and cultural context and wider significance for education. Tough has attempted to do this through an analysis of various forms of learning.[92] He has developed the concept of 'intentional changes' from observations on what may be common between deciding to give up smoking, to move to a new house or to learn a foreign language. This has led him to challenge the conventional role of institutions or professionally accredited agents managing people's change for them. Tough substitutes the idea of freely chosen and self-managed change as a key element in adult learning. He suggests that a vast generic and yet to be named movement of personal expansion and liberation is emerging. His evidence is culled from 'transition management', para-professional life-organisers and learning networks.

Such a theory is a refinement of Tough's earlier work to establish the context and extent of adult learning beyond the walls of the formal sector.[93] His definition of learning involves the accumulation of knowledge or a skill in some 'highly deliberate' way. The evidence on which his earlier work was based involved only limited samples. His first major piece of research involved 35 adults from one geographical area - Toronto. The interviewees were all highly educated people. Tough claims that *'the general findings would probably be duplicated by almost any group of urban middle class, fairly well educated, relatively young, North American adults'*. No analysis has been undertaken within other social groups. Likewise in Tough's later research Marriot has questioned the extent of evidence to justify his claim of a widespread social movement with substantial pedagogic and cultural significance.[95]

A major difficulty in assessing the evidence surrounds the degree to which 'intentional change' constitutes learning which is more substantial or distinct from incidental learning. For learning to be of significance, change in cognitive ability or affective behaviour has in some sense to be measurable. This implies that certain objectives can be identified to enable measurement to be undertaken. If learning has no defined objectives it becomes difficult to distinguish the incidental from the significant, the unplanned and ad hoc from the systematic and deliberately organised. It is not yet clear whether Tough has established a case for 'intentional changes' to be treated as a synonym for systematic learning.

Brookfield has attempted to deal with this problem through a qualitative study of particular groups of adults.[96] His view is that a range of people ' ... *can be found in any neighbourhood who have come to be expert in some area of interest (such as botany, dog breeding, antique china or aero modelling)*' and that they have followed this interest for

years. He chose 25 adults whose learning had resulted in the development of such a high level of expertise that the learner had been awarded the acclaim of fellow enthusiasts at local or national levels. Such expertise has been accumulated without participation in externally planned educational programmes.

Brookfield's research supports Tough's findings that some people can learn and develop in a variety of ways independently of formal agencies. This is not to be taken as equivalent to isolation since most people in Brookfield's sample were 'gregarious' and welcomed the support of informal learning networks.[97] There were also elaborate mechanisms to evaluate the quality of achievement in the hobbies and practical pursuits in which most of the interviewees were involved.[98] What remains uncertain is the significance to be attached to these findings. Brookfield also seems anxious to demonstrate a whole new, as yet barely discernible pattern of learning which constitutes 'a parallel educational universe'.[99] His evidence is similarly limited. It is based on what may be an atypical community in the rural West Midlands of England. The extent to which a similar picture might be uncovered in contexts of urban deprivation can be questioned.

There may also be problems in applying Brookfield's ideas of locally available skill models (people who can demonstrate a skill to be learnt) and skill exchanges as an alternative and more participatory form of learning. As with Illich's 'learning webs',[100] there is a sense in which they might become the preserve of the more confident and less diffident. There are many people who may feel and think they have little to offer and for whom an 'exchange' may be as remote as an institution.

It may also be the case that researchers in this field may devalue the contributions which adult education agencies can make. In a desire to establish adult learning unconnected with formal agencies as a major social phenomenon, there is a tendency to suggest that such 'independent learning' provides an alternative model in all contexts. According to some of the researchers in this field, intervention by agencies can be seen to stifle or restrain creativity and independence in learning. It is not clear why *'learners retaining responsibility for setting learning goals and for deciding when advice and assistance'*[101] is necessarily always appropriate. A sensitive educator can suggest, guide or facilitate in a way which does not encourage dependence. It should be possible to convey particular insights and skills without stifling another's creativity. A theory of participation in learning which places the participants at the centre does not have to exclude being taught by others.

Brookfield may be justified in regarding some adult education in community contexts as contradictory. There is a sense in which 'dialogical relations' of the type advocated by Freire and his disciples[102] may not easily co-exist with the strongly held educational and political ideologies of organisers. At times there may seem to be an assumption that 'dialogue' is an inevitable precursor of a radical world view and political action.[103] A tension can exist between educators holding strong views and methods designed to encourage learners to search for their own answers. To note that such situations may be a basis for indoctrination does invalidate the sense in which we can be taught *and* learn. What needs to be distinguished is education from indoctrination; nor can it be assumed that dialogue cannot produce similar ideas, convictions and collective action.

The work of researchers in this field may also neglect the social and political context of learning. The metaphor of the 'adult learning iceberg', a hidden world of learning activity and networks - may convey a useful image of areas of activity neglected in empirical research. It might also be used to suggest a cold, frozen structure in which social relationships and cumulative experience may be constrained. Research in this field tends to lack an awareness of relationships between culture and learning. Too little is known about the nature of any 'iceberg' to suggest that research in this field may provide a basis for an entirely new theory and practice of participation in learning. What can be concluded is that some learners in middle class groups define, control and evaluate their own learning to an extent that may have been devalued by some researchers.

v. 'Action Research' and Radical Perspectives

The fifth category of research is based on the work of some adult educators committed to adult learning being interconnected with the achievement of social change. Programmes have been designed on the basis of what Fletcher has called a libertarian philosophy.[104] It is assumed that learning is frustrated for many people by the distribution of power and social constraints within 'advanced capitalist societies'. Participation in learning should in part involve a political assertion by 'subordinate' classes of a claim to control over material resources and their own destiny. 'Communities' are seen to be split by division and inequalities of an economic, political, ethnic or sexist nature. 'Learning' as a concept seems closely related to becoming 'conscious' of such fragmentation and why and how to change it. Such an educational

ideology incorporates some aspects of all four propositions discussed in the first chapter.

For example, Lovett and Thompson would regard learning as a growing awareness of contradictions within a person's experience. A curriculum is of necessity based on the resolution of such contradictions. Learning is conceptualised as part of a political process in which an understanding of either class or sexual conflict is the core element.

It is important to note that the ideological positions of this group of 'radicals' vary considerably. For example, Jackson has been described as belonging to more of a reformist tradition although his ideas incorporate the notion of class conflict.[105] He tends to stress a need for positive discrimination towards working class people - adult education is one part of a package of social and economic measures designed to assist people to surmount material and confidence barriers. On the other hand, Lovett seems to stress the necessity of a more revolutionary process in which working class people become more conscious of a common interest in substantial social change.[106] Thompson would regard such advocacy as 'patriarchal' - insufficiently sensitive to a pattern of social relationships dominated by men. Patriarchy (a literal definition would be power of the father) refers to an interpretation of interpersonal relationships in which there is *'explicit and implicit subordination by men'*. Patriarchy is defined as a a system in that it is said to involve a process of exploitation of the gratuitous labour of women in the home and in the relationships of reproduction.[107]

Despite the political emphasis in such work, most of these radical practitioners emphasise the importance of process as much as content and objectives within learning. All have been influenced by Freire's belief in social change being dependent upon a full participation by people in all aspects of education. Change is as much facilitated by particular approaches to learning - stressing interdependence, respect for another's integrity and the importance of collective control of the totality of learning - as any radical content. While change depends in part on political consciousness - an understanding of those social and economic forces which are said to 'domesticate', it also relies on people articulating their own salvation. People are seen to be silenced, are denied the right to speak. A solution lies in naming the world - identifying its constraints and opportunities - an activity which Freire defines as a 'fundamental' and 'distinctive' human activity - the core of human creativity.[108] A pedagogy which seeks to silence or inhibit others in the name of any ideology is as much a tool for domestication as existing

social organisation. As Freire has written:

> *'From the beginning, we rejected the hypothesis of a purely mechanistic literacy programme and considered the problem of teaching adults how to read in relation to the awakening of their consciousness. We wished to design a project in which we would attempt to move from naivety to a critical attitude at the same time we taught reading. We wanted a literacy programme which would be an introduction to the democratisation of culture, a programme with men as its subjects rather than patient recipients, a programme which itself would be an act of creation, capable of releasing other creative acts.'*[109]

There are three comments which can be made about these radical views and the quality of action-research. First, there is little detailed research into specific projects. Action needs to be analysed in relation to outcome. The view of organisations should be compared with participants. How is learning to be evaluated? Most of the literature consists of the impressions of Project leaders rather than sustained quantitative or qualitative research. In part this is a result of the small number of educational projects devoted to such a libertarian philosophy. The evidence that does exist for successful work tends to emerge from the women's movement; Mezirow in particular has reviewed many projects and has concluded that such methods have often been successful with groups of women.[110] Other 'action-research' reports tend to indicate some difficulties. Lovett has recognised problems in establishing a 'radical' participatory mode of learning in inner city contexts. These include difficulties in establishing a dialogue with people in the first instance. Any 'learning' or 'education' may appear remote in comparison with more immediate personal and material concerns.[111] Other outreach projects, less radical in orientation, have uncovered a problem in encouraging people to engage in socially relevant learning or boarding the 'educational train' at all, regardless of its appearance and interior.[112] This tends to confirm the association of education with schooling held by many people and its marginality within the social experience of working class adults.

Secondly, as has been noted above, there may well be a tension between 'dialogical relationships' and the radical political philosophies of many practitioners. Bown has reviewed the Scottish evidence and has concluded:

> *'A group's critical reflection on their situation should enable them to come to some generalisations on their problems and thus to indicate what problem it is that they wish to learn about.*

'But in Gorgie/Dalry it appears that the transition does not necessarily come about as naturally as Freire assumes and the team are faced with the ethical dilemma of whether they should signpost the learners towards an articulation of issues more heavily than the Freirean method suggests ...'[113]

Berger has developed similar observations into a more general critique of many Freirean inspired action-research projects.[114] He has claimed that in some American practice the idea of 'conscientization' is in opposition to democratic modes of learning or dialogue. He has suggested that there is irony in theories of democratic action which contrast with the practices of a 'self-appointed élite ' of intellectuals seeking to raise others' consciousness. He also asserts a deeper philosophical error within Freire's own theory; 'levels' of consciousness may be taken to mean one level is superior to another. Being critically conscious is a more desirable state than any other. Berger questions this - the peasant may have a superior consciousness of natural things - plant and animal life for example. He is happier with the idea of an exchange between those having differing perspectives in which there are no prior assumptions of one level of understanding being superior to another. He explains this idea through the phrase *'the equality of all empirically available worlds of consciousness'*.[115]

Berger may be justified in his criticism of some North American work - in particular an identification of a possible tension between organisers sharing a belief in the necessity of particular forms of social and political action and dialogical relationships. There is no reason why dialogue should not produce a range of perspectives and differences of interpretation. Where Berger's interpretation may be naive is to assume that all understanding is of equal political, social or personal significance. Some levels of understanding may make substantial participation in political activity or social participation more possible. An ability to control external forces may become more achievable. While an experientially based appreciation of natural forces may be important, it is to be questioned whether this is sufficient unto itself. Self-knowledge and social awareness involve intellectual effort. A sense of control over events may be an important part of fulfilment in adulthood. It may depend on intellectual understanding.

Berger seems to be confusing particular methods employed by some practitioners with the idea of dialogue in Freirean philosophy. Some methods may involve the imposition of tutors' view on students. The student is not encouraged to make up his/her own mind. Participation

in all forms of adult education may involve interaction with tutors who may belittle attempts by participants to interpret experience. This is not to say that a tutor's own ideas should not be included in a learning exchange. What is important is the respect and sensitivity shown towards others by all participants in a learning group. Language, ideas and social interaction can become instruments of intimidation rather than mutual development.

A third comment is concerned with philosophical criticisms of adult education being related to social change or more democratic forms of learning. It has been claimed that this is based on a false and misleading egalitarianism.[116] For example, Lawson and Paterson[117] see the purpose of adult education to be a fostering of aesthetic discrimination, the development of the person and his or her initiation into worthwhile states of knowledge. Social change or community action may be incidental consequences of such a process but are incidental to the idea of education per se. Further, to associate learning with democratic forms of interaction can assume that teachers and learners are equal in terms of their knowledge. Lawson rejects the association of valuable knowledge with the 'piecemeal and relative' compared with its conventional interpretation as that which is timeless, objective, rigorous and developed according to accepted ground rules.[118] It is suggested that the idea of democratic relationships in learning confuses the teaching/learning process in which some at various times should learn from others.

It is not clear why such criticisms necessarily contradict the idea of participation in learning set in the context of broader social experience and change. Note has already been taken of the varied reasons people give to explain participation in learning - in practice instrumental and learning-orientated goals are often combined. It is possible to argue that in some cultural contexts learning can only be significant if it relates to, and helps the individual interpret and change, their culture. Lawson may be open to the criticism of abstracting human interaction from social context to a point where it is unrelated to what enables people to learn. Lawson's view of knowledge may likewise suggest a degree of dichotomy between forms of knowledge which cannot be justified. Thus the 'piecemeal and relative' may be of significance at an individual or group level as part of learning - for example a spontaneous expression in poetic form of feeling and emotion. This is not to deny the importance of systematic thought and its appreciation, merely that there are other ways to develop insights and understanding which may complement or facilitate it.

The possibility of participation in the determination of content and process in learning may similarly be compatible with systematic learning. An understanding of complexities will only emerge if the individual perceives them to be relevant. Perception is a dynamic concept; it may develop as an individual is allowed to influence what is done and learns from others. Consciousness can increase as dialogue becomes enriched. The development of learning in adult life may depend on the extent to which it is integrated with existing experience. Lawson may have confused content with process and oversimplified the nature of knowledge.

The literature of 'radical adult education' has tended to be characterised by theoretical discussions rather than sustained research at a micro-level. Some of the problems raised by Berger and others might be more easily discussed if practice could be analysed more extensively. In particular there is a need for research to focus on any problems in maximising participation in the planning of content and evaluation of adult education. There may also be a need for a clearer understanding of the complex relationships between the ideologies and practice of organisers and students, learning and social action. These can be considered as central issues in developing a theory of participation.

4. Research into Participation in Adult Learning and Education - some general observations.

As was suggested in the first Chapter, research into participation in adult learning and education has not satisfactorily combined theory with empirical enquiry. Much existing research tends to be primarily descriptive while other writing - for example, the work of those concerned to develop a radical alternative education - tends to lack a firm empirical grounding. To improve the quality of research may raise methodological questions of a distinct kind. One underlying theme in reviews of the current state of research in this field, is that research into adult learning may require the development of particular techniques and approaches which are distinct from many of those used in other educational research. The nature of such techniques may be more clearly defined as field work and experiment increases.

For example, Holmes[119] has questioned the suitability of methods borrowed from research with children and college students. He has suggested that they may tend to avoid asking awkward questions. An adult might wish to express himself/herself in a personal way or believe that behaviour follows from one's own will and cannot be encapsulated in someone else's frame of reference. Adults may wish for privacy or might be

suspicious of a comparative stranger, playing a role of an 'objective', detached researcher. This may provoke anxiety[120] particularly for those whose confidence may be vulnerable or whose experience of interviewers may be of people from social work, or the Police. One study of literacy students noted that some conventional data collection techniques provoked anxiety and unhappy memories:

> *'Furthermore, our preliminary pilot scheme revealed that students viewed overtly structured questions as a form of testing which reminded them of failure at school and roused in them strong feelings of hostility. Thus the basic tools of quantitative research could not be utilised. The approach had to be qualitative and imaginative.'*[121]

Research experience of this kind has led to a debate at two levels. The first surrounds methods of establishing the meaning of experience in learning for participants. It focuses on the problems of establishing a productive dialogue with another adult when words may convey ambiguity and provoke feelings of anxiety. There is a curious parallel between the discussion of problems in research and the debate surrounding the idea of participation in learning itself. How much does a researcher need to be accepted as a fellow participant in an *interview* to enable substantial dialogue to develop? What problems does this pose for research objectivity and the interpretation of data?

A number of researchers[122] have experimented with what have been called 'participatory' or 'qualitative' approaches to the understanding of participation. Jones and Charnley, for example, have combined an extensive empirical enquiry with 'qualitative techniques'. By this is meant an intention to establish the subjective meaning of learning to participants. This was attempted through methods of 'synchronic induction' and an ethological approach; the processes are:

> *'to observe, to infer, to refer, to relate, to hypothesise, to reobserve ... in the ethological approach, the criteria for the choice of observable data are based on general experience and the researcher's analysis of the level of cohesion and integration of the theoretical approach.'* [123]

A theory is regarded as at all times provisional; its refinement involves a constant process of synchronising findings from various field workers. This in turn is based on methods which include the phenomenological idea of the participant defining reality in terms of his or her own subjectivity. Recording the subjective impression of students is regarded as a prerequisite of interpretive theory rather than the means through which hypotheses are tested.

The second level of debate has raised the problem of quantitative methods being employed in such research. It has been noted that there may be a tendency within some behaviourist interpretations of participation in learning to focus on those aspects of human action which are more susceptible to quantification and precise measurement. It has been suggested that this can involve a dismissal of subjective factors such as human intention and consciousness because of their insusceptibility to precise measurement.[124] It may well be that a development of a more integrated body of empirical research and theory, focused on a fundamental aspect of human activity, will enrich this debate within educational research and social science more generally.

5. The Propositions and the Literature : Some Conclusions

In Chapter One certain questions were asked in relation to the literature and the propositions. How does existing research support, problematise or refine such ideas? To what extent have researchers succeeded in establishing and analysing the personal and social context of learning for working class participants? What methods may be most appropriate in increasing our understanding of the interaction between participation in learning and more general personal and social experience?

An attempt to answer these questions should be tentative since the research is either inadequate or the issues have been tangential in most of the work. There is a surfeit of descriptive studies or highly theoretical/ideological debates which lack an adequate empirical grounding. There is an absence of studies which combine quantitative measurements of observable behaviour with qualitative techniques which seek to interpret the meaning of learning to working class people. The next Chapter consists of a qualitative study into the meaning of learning for particular groups of working class students as one contribution to this underdeveloped area.

At present, the following observations can be made from the existing research in relation to the four propositions.

i. Participation in adult learning and education and more general patterns of social participation or exclusion

Trenaman's work is particularly significant in this context. He suggests that perceptions of learning and education and the probability of participation relate to the degree to which a person has secured a high status occupation and/or has successfully negotiated the various barriers within the educational system. Conversely, the likelihood of participation is decreased to the extent that a person is excluded from

socially valued activity such as fulfilling and high status employment. Unemployment or retirement for some people could be regarded as particularly poignant forms of social exclusion. Other research[125] into self-concept and general confidence among retired people indicates the ways in which learning can appear unrelated to immediate concerns and people lose any motivation to participate in learning. There appears to be a clear correlation between the extent of participation in a range of socially valued activity and the likelihood of participation in adult learning and education.

The evidence suggests that there may be a more general relationship between social class, attitudes to learning and participation in adult education. Trenaman's research established common patterns of perception and attitudes among people from the same social class. This can be interpreted to mean that learning in adulthood is largely dependent on shared cultural expectations and experience. For many working class people experience may have been miseducative. Any impetus towards learning might have been stifled by initial education and lack of social status. Participation in existing adult education tends to reinforce rather than change broader patterns of social inequality and cultural differences.

From another viewpoint research evidence based on working class participants in learning reinforces the idea of learning as an element within general social participation. Jones and Charnley have discovered that the most important aspect of success to participants in literacy programmes was confidence to enter into a range of social activity from which they may have previously retreated.[126] This underlines the importance of analysing learning as part of general social experience. Increased participation in social activities may produce a more positive self-concept and vice versa. A growing confidence, a sense of achievement and social activity may encourage the individual to see a relevance in other forms of adult education.

The literature therefore indicates that participation in learning is not an isolated activity. At a personal level it is related to the self-concept and confidence. At a social level it may be one aspect of class and/or gender relationships, institutional experience, inequality and cultural differences. The relationships between these factors and adult learning is understood in only the most general terms.

ii. Power, influence and social context

There is an overlap between the issues raised in considering the first proposition, and a person's sense of power (or powerlessness) to influence

the course of their lives. A sense of power can result from a belief that change is possible. The individual has the knowledge and confidence to act. It may also depend on the extent to which an individual understands factors which may constrain him/her in achieving some desired objective. Most of the literature in this field is based on a belief that substantial learning is dependent upon a developing consciousness of constraints upon personal development. Social change is an essential component within learning for many of those at the margins of society. Learning is discussed as part of a dialectic of action and reflection which constitutes a 'pedogogy of the oppressed'. The views of 'radical' adult educators flow from a broader political analysis. Theories of learning focus on those aspects of experience which may facilitate independence, self-assertion or 'liberation' from social constraints imposed by dominant groups. Society is seen to deny the conscious and active participation in its determination by many working class people.

Not all learning is defined as liberating. Some forms are said to reinforce powerlessness, marginality or 'domestication'. For example, traditional adult education is said to reinforce the traditional role of women in the home as an object to be 'enjoyed' by men.[127] In the view of many feminists or political radicals learning is inextricably related to a political process in which people become aware of shared disadvantage and discover a power to change. Non-participation in relevant learning is part of a broader pattern of subordination and powerlessness for such groups.

This identification of learning with political consciousness is based on limited analyses of participants' experience.[128] There is a tendency in the literature to base firm conclusions exclusively on ideological assumptions and limited samples of participants.

It is important in research to record all aspects of participant experience. More detailed evaluation is necessary of the possibility of varied motives and responses among participants which might not be simply accommodated into one exclusive theory of learning. As Thompson herself admits:

> *'Making generalisations about students' reactions is difficult because I suspect that they have valued the course in different ways, to different degrees and for different reasons.'*[129]

Such 'differences' need to be carefully identified, evaluated and explained. It may be particularly important in 'action-research' to justify techniques of data collection and interpretation and to secure

some degree of objectivity (incorporating the subjective interpretations of participants) precisely because of the ideology of researchers or organisers. For example, perceptions of what constitutes socially or personally significant learning may vary as the Literacy research indicated. Apparently unimportant and trivial social encounters can become a means to personal growth and development. Such social activities may have no obvious political identity or relationship to social change. The relationship between participation in learning, power and powerlessness, may need to be understood in highly personal, psychological terms as much as through any broader social analysis.

iii. Social Relevance and Working Class People

There is no clear evidence from the literature that working class adult education can only be important if it relates to issues of immediate relevance or those of wider political and social significance. For example, Thompson has acknowledged that more *'conventional courses'* in medieval history, conversational French or Yoga can be important to the individual, regardless of social class.[130] Achievement in such learning can be a source of personal satisfaction, confidence and self-belief.

Equally, Lovett has noted[131] an unwillingness on the part of many working class people to engage in political activity or 'socially relevant' educational programmes in the inner City. Although this may be part of a broader phenomenon of political and social alienation[132] it underlines the reluctance of many adults to engage in any form of learning. There is a reluctance to board 'the educational train' regardless of exterior and interior appearances in social contexts such as those explored by Lovett or Fordham. Conversely, Thompson has produced evidence from women's education (and, to a lesser extent Lovett with small numbers of people in the Liverpool scheme) that participation in issue-based adult education of a 'radical' kind may induce a change in perspective, a developing political consciousness and confidence to act to change personal or social circumstances. Some evidence exists that learning may come to be seen as personally and socially relevant. It is difficult to draw any conclusions from this since some participants may have had prior political or trade union involvement. There is little attention paid in the literature to problems of cause and effect. Do some of the women in 'Second Chance' education already have some commitment to feminist issues or a reasonable involvement in a variety of forms of learning? The literature would have benefitted from more detailed biographical Case Studies of participants.

iv. Participant control of learning and institutions

There is some evidence to suggest that adults can play a fuller role in shaping their own learning than has been conventionally assumed. Brookfield and Tough have provided useful case studies where individuals have undergone significant learning without reference to the formal education sector. Similarly, the women's movement provides examples of major 'perspective transformation' among people determined to reflect upon and influence their own experience. An important element within this process has been participant control over content and objectives as an element within learning and confidence raising. Thompson[133] regards such control by participants as a precondition of successful change; it is claimed that 'dialogical' supportive relationships emerge from a collective struggle to define the nature of problems, to understand and resolve them.

In the case of 'independent learning', it is difficult to distinguish educational from incidental activity. The evidence for a major social movement of the type suggested by some researchers is insufficient. Further, such evidence and research which does exist tends to be confined to 'continuing learners' in the sense defined by Houle;[134] these would be mainly adults having succeeded in initial education, enjoying reasonable occupational status and material comfort; they do not tend to be from the ranks of the 'socially excluded'.

'Independent learning' as a social phenomenon still requires extensive theoretical and empirical research. Some existing research may neglect the social context of learning - the degree to which a given culture may constrain opportunity and learning. It may be that a sociological analysis of independent adult learning may uncover a similar relationship to social status and power as that characterising more conventional forms of adult education. A corollary of this may be an over-emphasis by researchers such as Brookfield on the utility of alternative ways of organising learning. These include the ideas of learning webs or skill exchanges which largely bypass the existing world of adult education. The absence of evidence of 'independent learning' in the inner-city may indicate a range of cultural factors which inhibit adult learning of any kind. It may be that neither self-generated activity nor traditional adult education makes sense to people who may be experiencing material poverty, powerlessness or long term unemployment. The work of educators such as Thompson has illustrated the highly conservative, service orientation of most adult education. Programme planning and curriculum development may often contradict the idea of student-centred learning. Students can easily be excluded from determining

what they should learn.[135] It need not follow that conventional practice in adult education or its division into subjects reminiscent of the school curriculum are inevitable features of adult education institutions. Thompson and Lovett in their issue-based work operated under the auspices of Responsible Bodies.

The idea of 'independent learning' may also devalue the role of teaching; it may even be suggested that teaching is in some sense antithetical to learning. Crombie[136] for example, has postulated a 'teaching' as distinct from a 'learning' paradigm. It is claimed that the latter is based on a participatory mode of learning, whereas the former can inhibit a learner's creativity. The 'teaching paradigm' is said to characterise much initial education - children are regarded as the 'objects' of education and to become educated is to become a 'good adult'. The official aim within the teaching paradigm is the transmission of knowledge (as codified into a curriculum, subject, courses etc.) rather than what are seen to be *'the interests of the learner ... and as a correlate ... seeing ... learners themselves and not teachers as the main agents of learning, supported and helped by a diverse range of people'.*[137] This view may provide a useful critical perspective on some traditional definitions of teaching. There may though be a sense in which the significance of teaching as an essential component within the process of learning is being devalued. The transmission of knowledge, insights and guidance does not logically contradict the interests of the learner. It is possible to learn by listening to others. A strength within the women's movement has been seen to be interdependence in which participants are both teachers as well as learners. Perhaps Freire has come closest to expressing this ideal by stressing the degree to which the role of teacher-student can and should be interchanged.[138] The illumination of concepts or information by a person with particular skills may enliven learning and introduce a participant to experience and ideas beyond his/her own. The history of adult education contains countless examples of people who have been inspired or encouraged to continue and expand their learning through the skills of tutors such as Tawney. It may be significant that he stressed the importance of dialogue in the classroom in which student experience could be a means to develop collective intellectual understanding.[139]

v. Conclusion

The literature and research into participation in adult learning and education can therefore be criticised on a number of grounds. There is an important tradition of survey research but relatively little attention to

interpretative theory. Where empirical research and theory have been integrated, as in the work of Trenaman, important questions remain concerning the validity of his conclusions. There is an element of ambiguity surrounding whether the people in his sample were rejecting higher values per se or particular educational institutions which were thought to represent them. Research of this kind would have benefitted from more in-depth analysis of the meanings adults themselves attach to concepts and action. Similarly, behaviourist research has focused on aspects of student experience which are more easily measured and may have failed to incorporate student consciousness or personal explanations of action into theory. Action-research has yet to provide the broad historical, institutional and cultural analysis of student experience which may be a pre-requisite of speculative theory. The thought worlds of participants in learning have remained largely unexplored and unanalysed. Techniques to combine quantitative approaches to research - for example the measurement of changed reading habits, increased social participation or entry into further education or training - have rarely been combined with more qualitative research. Methods through which the latter might be undertaken and triangulated with quantitative research have been piloted in only a small number of studies. The Literacy research indicated the methodological and logistical difficulties of analysing open-ended interview material and understanding the meanings which interviewees may themselves have attached to statements. There is much to be done in developing an integrated tradition of theoretical and empirical research which incorporates the biographies and phenomenology of participants in learning.

The four propositions remain therefore in a highly provisional state. Participation in adult learning seems to be one element within a social matrix of occupational status and educational achievement. A sense of power or powerlessness appears to be related to these variables and in turn the wider backcloth of social class in determining objective opportunity and the meanings people give to learning. Relevance in learning cannot simply be reduced to a political curriculum in which social contradictions are recognised and changed. Small increases in confidence, wider social participation or more conventional educational achievement can be important to students. Participant control in learning should not be confused with 'independence' of the kind analysed by Tough and Brookfield. Independent learning seems to characterise some middle class contexts rather than the 'icebergs' of the inner City. It may be that questions of participant control are best analysed through

practical attempts to include students at all stages in curriculum planning such as those within some women's education. These seemed to have involved the careful incorporation of student experience into adult learning.

Therefore at the centre of research problems and the development of the four propositions appears to be a need to understand the thought worlds and biographies of working class participants in learning more extensively. The next Chapter involves an attempt to establish a dialogue with some participants in four specific projects. The intention is to examine the meaning of learning to them; can participation in education be discussed in isolation from general social experience? how does their cultural context and historical experience affect the way learning is perceived? how do feelings of powerlessness and cultural determinants influence the way learning is experienced? how easy or difficult is it to establish socially relevant learning in the worlds of the inner-city or council estate? What difficulties exist in establishing greater participant control in learning and how do participants view this? These issues have been considered in only the most general terms in the literature. There is no claim to statistical representativity in the case studies; the intention is rather to use in depth interviews as one way to clarify the issues further. There is a growing belief in social research that one element within field work should be to understand the construction of reality by those participating in a social 'drama'. This may be particularly true in adult education research where questions surrounding consciousness, understanding, motivation and change are of central importance.

REFERENCES

1. *P. Freire: 'Cultural Action for Freedom', Op.Cit. pp.16-17.*
2. *J. Thompson: 'Learning Liberation', Op.Cit.*
3. *See Chapter One, p.2.*
4. *The two major works have already been referred to. 'Adult Education for a Change' and 'Learning Liberation'.*
5. *T. Lovett: 'Adult Education, Community Development, and the Working Class', Op.Cit.*
6. *See for example S. Courtney: 'Factors Affecting Participation in Adult Education - An Analysis of Some of the Literature', 'Studies in Adult Education', Vol.13, No.2, Oct.1981, pp.98-111.*
7. *K.P. Cross: 'A Critical Review of State and National Studies of the needs and interests of Adult Learners', in C.B. Statford (ed.): 'Adults learning needs and the demand for lifelong learning', National Institute of Education, Washington, DC. 1978.*
   See also the reference to Cross' work in ACACE 'Continuing Education: from Policies to Practice, ACACE. Leicester, 1982, p.60.
8. *A. Tough: 'Why Adults Learn: A Study of the Major Reasons for Beginning and Continuing a Learning Project', Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, 1968, p.4.*
9. *A.H. Halsey, A.F. Heath and J.M. Ridge: 'Origins and Destinations: Family, Class and Education in Modern Britain', Clarendon, 1980.*
10. *J.H. Goldthorpe and C. Llewellyn: 'Class Mobility in Modern Britain: Three Theses Examined', 'Sociology' II, 2 May, 1977, pp.257-287; also 'Class Mobility: Intergenerational and Work/Life Patterns', British Journal of Sociology, Vol. XXVII, 3 Sep. 1977, pp.269-302.*
    Also with C. Payne: 'Trends in Class Mobility', Sociology, 123, Sept. 1978, pp.438-468.
11. *A.H. Halsey: Op.Cit. p.204.*
12. *'Service Class' is defined as 'lower grade professional, higher grade technicians' etc.*
13. *A.H. Halsey: Op.Cit. p.204.*
14. *Ibid. p.204.*
15. *Ibid. p.20.*
16. *D. Raffe: 'The Alternative Route Re-considered: Part Time Further Education and Social Mobility in England and Wales', Sociology, 13, pp.47-73.*
17. *ACACE: 'Adults - their Educational Experience and Needs', Op.Cit. particularly pp.19-22.*
18. *Central Policy Review: 'Education, Training and Industrial Performance', HMSO, 1980.*
    DES/SED: 'Higher Education into the 1980s', DES/SED, London, 1978.
19. *N. Grant: 'The Crisis of Scottish Education', The Saltire Society, No.2, New Series, Edinburgh, 1982.*
20. *Ibid. pp.6-7.*
21. *D. Raffe: 'Social Class and Entry to Further Education', Scottish Education Studies, Vol.9, No.2, Nov. 1977.*
22. *SED: '16-18s in Scotland, The First Two Years of Post-Compulsory Education', SED, Edinburgh, 1979, p.1.*

23. *An exhaustive review of some of the literature in the field has been undertaken by K. Rubenson: 'Participation in Recurrent Education: A Research Review', OECD/CERI, 1972, Paris. His major conclusion is that there is a strong empirical tradition but a neglect of theory. A similar conclusion has been reached by S. Courtney, Op.Cit.*

24. *I am not alone in such a conclusion. Rubenson and Courtney come to a similar view. See also J. Thompson: 'Adult Education for a Change' Op.Cit. p.220.*

25. *J. Trenaman: 'Communication and Comprehension', Op.Cit.*

26. *Ibid. pp.185-193.*

27. *Ibid. p.186.*

28. *Ibid. p.187.*

29. *Ibid. p.189.*

30. *Ibid. p.189.*

31. *Ibid. p.191.*

32. *Ibid. p.191.*

33. *ACACE: 'Adults: Their Educational Experience and Needs', Op.Cit.*

34. *NIAE: 'Adequacy of Provision', 'Adult Education', Vol.42. March 1970. SED/HMSO: 'Adult Education - The Challenge of Change'. 'Report of a Committee of Enquiry appointed by the Secretary of State for Scotland chaired by Prof. K.E.W. Alexander', Edinburgh, 1975. DES/HMSO: 'Adult Education, a Plan for development', 'Report of a Committee of Enquiry under Sir Lionel Russell', London, 1973.*

35. *ACACE: 'Adults: Their Educational Experience and Needs', Op.Cit. pp.3-4.*

36. *Ibid. pp.1-5.*

37. *Ibid. pp.14-15.*

38. *The figure 12% is very much of a guesstimate given an unsatisfactory statistical basis from which to produce an aggregate. This is fully discussed in M. Woodhall: 'The Scope and Costs of the Educational Training of Adults in Britain', Op.Cit. pp.8-10.*

39. *ACACE: 'Adults etc.' p.15.*

40. *I. Hanna: 'A Socio-Psychological Survey of the Student Membership of Adult Education Classes in Leeds and Changes in the Adult Education Student Population since 1945', M.A. Thesis, Leeds, 1964, quoted in A. Charnley: 'Research in Adult Education in the British Isles', NIAE, 1974, pp.131-134.*

41. *J.W.F. Arriens: 'A Study of Factors Affecting Membership and Participation in Voluntary Leisure Association', Ph.D. Thesis, Cambridge, 1968. Quoted in A. Charnley: Op.Cit. pp.134-5.*

42. *'Adult Education, a Plan for Development'. Op.Cit.*

43. *See in particular: T. Burgess: 'The Open University', New Society, 27 April 1972, also J. Pratt: 'Standards in Higher Education', Higher Education Review, Autumn, 1971.*

44. *N.M. McIntosh and J.W. Calder: 'A Degree of Difference: A Study of the First Year's Intake in the Open University of Great Britain', Open University, 1975.*

45. *See N.M. McIntosh and J.W. Calder: Op.Cit.*

46. *A. Charnley, M. Osborne and A. Withnall: 'Review of Existing Research in Adult and Continuing Education', 'Mature Students', Volume One, NIAE, 1980.*

47. *See J.H. Goldthorpe and C. Llewellyn: 'Class Mobility in Modern Britain: Three Theses Examined', Op.Cit. pp.257-287.*

48. *For a discussion of the evidence see: H.A. Jones: 'Beyond Literacy - the background to a strategy for adult basic education', in M. Hayes (Ed.): 'Papers on Adult Basic Education', University of Southampton, 1979, p.3-21, particularly pp.12-13. Also A.H. Charnley and H.A. Jones: 'The Concept of Success in Adult Literacy', Op.Cit. pp.21-3.*

49. *A. Dalin: 'Recurrent Education in Norway', OECD/CERI, Paris, 1972, p.31.*

50. *H. Rudolph et al: 'Recurrent Education in the Federal Republic of Germany', OECD/CERI, Paris, 1972.*

51. *The figures are taken from C. Stapel and N.H. Bergen: 'Dutch Adult Education on its way to an Open School System', Council of Europe, January, 1974.*

52. *J.W. Johnstone and R.J. Rivera: 'Volunteers for Learning', Washington, 1965, pp.6-8.*

53. *J. Killeen and M. Bird: 'Education and Work: A Study of Paid Educational Leave in England and Wales, 1976-7', NIAE, 1981, particularly pp. 38-51.*

54. *J.M. Belorgey: 'Recurrent Education in France', OECD/CERI, Paris, 1976, p.12.*

55. *P. Bolo: 'Application of the Continuous Vocational Training Act', (16 July 1971) CCC/EED, 1976, Council of Europe.*

56. *A.H. Charnley: 'Paid Educational Leave'; Hart Davis Educational, 1975.*

57. *ACACE: 'Adults: Their Educational Experience and Needs', Op.Cit. pp.52-3.*

58. *R. Berthoud: 'Training Opportunities for Skilled Jobs - Skill Centre Training and Labour Markets', PSI, Vol.XLIV, 1978, pp.13-14.*

59. *NIAE: 'Adequacy of Provision', Op.Cit. p.60 and pp. 129-131.*

60. *See M. Woodhall: Op.Cit. pp. 11-12.*

61. *See.N. Keddie: 'Adult Education: an ideology of individualism' in J.L. Thompson: 'Adult Education for a Change', Op.Cit. pp. 45-64, particularly pp.55-57. Also R. Gray and M. Hughes: 'Half our Future', Adult Education, Vol.52, No.5, Jan.1980, pp.301-308.*

61. *J.L. Thompson: 'Adult Education for a Change', Op.Cit. p.220.*

62. *See K. Rubenson: 'Participation in Recurrent Education', Op.Cit. also S. Courtney: Op.Cit.*

63. *For a discussion of this see J. Thompson: 'Adult Education for a Change', Op.Cit. pp.220-221.*

64. *Observers having very difference perspectives such as Brookfield and Keddie have arrivedat similar conclusions. See S. Brookfield: 'Adult Learners, Adult Education and the Community', Op.Cit. pp.198-199. N. Keddie: Op.Cit. pp.47-64, develops this into a critique of the assumptions built into the 'ideology' of adult basic education.*

65. *G. Mee and H. Wiltshire: 'Structure and Performance in Adult Education', Longman, 1978.*

66. *S. Courtney: Op.Cit. p.99.*

67. *Ibid. p.99.*

68. *J.P. Hoy: 'An Enquiry into the Interests and Motives for Study Among Adult Evening Students', British Journal of Educational Psychology, Vo.3, pp.13-26. Also J.W.C. Johnstone and R. Rivera: 'Volunteers for Learning - A Study of the Educational Pursuits of American Adults', Aldine, Chicago, 1965.*

69. *C. Houle: 'The Enauiring Mind: A Study of the Adults who Continue to Learn', University of Wisconsin, Maddison, 1961.*

70. *S, Courtney: Op.Cit. p.106.*

71. *See R. Bosher: 'Factor Analysis - A Critical Review of the Motivation, Orientation Literature', 'Adult Education' (USA) Vol.27 1, 1976, pp.24-41.*

72. *K. Rubenson: 'Participation in Recurrent Education: A Research Review', Op.Cit.*

73. *See for example, J. Botwinick: 'Age Differences in Self-Ratings of Confidence', Psychological Reports, Vol.27, 1970, pp.308-12.*

74. *K. Rubenson: 'Recruitment in Adult Education, A Research Strategy', Report from Dept. of Educational Research, School of Education, Stockholm, 1976, p.23.*

75. *Ibid. p.23.*

76. *U. Bergsten: 'Adult Education in Relation to Work and Leisure', Dept. of Educational Research, Stockholm Institute of Education, Almqvist and Wiksell, 1977, pp.68-9.*

77. *Ibid. p.69.*

78. *M. Newman: 'The Poor Cousin: A Study of Adult Education', Alan and Unwin, 1979, p.26.*

79. *DES: 'Adult Education: A Plan for Development', Op.Cit. pp.92-99.*

80. *J. Rogers and B. Groombridge: 'Right to Learn', Penguin, 1979.*

81. *K.P. Cross: 'A Critical Review.. etc.', Op.Cit. Quoted in ACACE: 'Continuing Education: From Policies to Practice', Op.Cit. pp.60-61.*

82. *Ibid. p.60.*

83. *Ibid. p.60*

84. *Ibid. p.61. See also ACACE: 'A Strategy for the Basic Education of Adults', Op.Cit. Also B. Sewall: 'Adults' Mathematical Ability and Performance', Op.Cit.*

85. *ACACE: 'Continuing Education: From Policies to Practice', Op.Cit. pp.69-70.*

86. *K. Percy, J. Powell, S. Butters, I. Willet: 'Post-Initial Education in the North West of England: A Survey of Provision', Op.Cit.p.214.*

87. *Ibid. p.214.*

88. *Ibid. p.216.*

89. *Ibid. p.212.*

90. *See the study of K. Percy and S. Lucas: 'The Open College and Alternatives', University of Lancaster, Lancaster Series on Adult Education, No.2, 1980, in particular p.14. Despite major innovations, the 'recruitment' of working class students has not increased in any marked way.*

91. *A. Tough: 'Intentional Changes: a Fresh Approach to Helping People Change', Follett Publishing Co., 1983.*

92. *Ibid.*

93. *In particular: A Tough: 'Why Adults Learn: A Study of the Major Reasons for Beginning and Continuing a Learning Project', Op.Cit.*

94. *Ibid. p.5.*

95. *See S. Marriott: for a review of Tough's latest research in 'Studies in Adult Education', Vol.15, Sept.1983, pp.111-112.*

96. *S. Brookfield: 'Independent Adult Learning', Studies in Adult Education, Vol.13, No.1, April 1981, also 'Open Learning' Continuing Education, NEC, Cambridge, July 1980.*

97. *S. Brookfield: 'Adult Learners, Adult Education and the Community', Op.Cit. p.53.*

98. *Ibid. p.51.*

99. *Ibid. p.56.*

100 *I. Illich: 'De-Schooling Society', Calder and Boyers, 1974, pp.72-104.*

101. *S. Brookfield: Op.Cit.*

102. *Ibid. p.70.*

103. *Ibid. p.70.*

104. *C. Fletcher: 'The Theory of Community Education and its Relation to Adult Education' in J.L. Thompson: 'Adult Education for a Change', Op.Cit. pp.65-82.*

105. *In particular see K. Jackson: 'Adult Education and Community Development', Studies in Adult Education, Vol.2, 1970, pp.165-172.*

106. *See especially the concluding chapter of T. Lovett, C. Clarke and A. Kilmurray: 'Adult Education and Community Education', Croom Helm, 1983, pp.157-159.*

107. *J.L. Thompson: 'Learning Liberation', Op.Cit. p.11.*

108. *P. Freire,: 'Education: The Practice of Freedom', Op.Cit. pp.41-58.*

109. *Ibid. p.43.*

110. *J. Mezirow: 'Perspective Transformation', Studies in Adult Education, Vol.9, Oct.1977, pp.153-164.*

111. *T. Lovett: 'Adult Education, Community Development and the Working Class', Op.Cit. p.96.*

112. *P. Fordham, G. Poulton and L. Randle: 'Learning Networks in Adult Education, Non-Formal Education on Housing Estates', Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1979, particularly pp.222-235.*

113. *L. Bown: 'Participation in Learning - for Power or Powerlessness' Keynote Address to the Community Education Association Fifth Annual Study Conference, Edinburgh, March 1982, p.5.*

114. *P.L. 'Pyramids of Sacrifice, Political Ethics and Social Change', Pelican, 1977, pp.135-158.*

115. *Ibid. p.141.*

116. *See K.H. Lawson: 'Philosophical Concepts and Values in Adult Education', Dept. of Adult Education, Nottingham, 1975. Also K.H. Lawson: 'A Critique of Recurrent Education', ARE, 1977.*

117. *R.W.K. Patterson: 'Social Change as an Educational Aim', Adult Education, Vol.45, 1973, pp.353-359.*

118. *K.H. Lawson: 'Philosophical Concepts and Values ...' Op.Cit. p.39.*

119. *J. Holmes: 'Thoughts on Research Methodology', Studies in Adult Education, Vol.8, No.2, 1976, pp.144-163.*

120. *See in particular A.H. Charnley and H.A. Jones: 'The Concept of Success in Adult Literacy', Op.Cit. p.6, and pp.35-6.*

121. *Ibid. p.6.*

122. *See S. Brookfield: 'Adult Learners, Adult Education and the Community', Op.Cit. pp.49-57.*

123. *A.H. Charnley and H.A. Jones: Op.Cit. pp.35-36.*

124. *Particular attention should be paid to M. Pilsworth and R. Ruddock: 'Some Criticisms of Survey Research Methods in Adult Education', 'Convergence', Vol.8, No.2, 1975, pp.33-43.*

125. *See C. Philipson and P. Strong: 'The Impact of Pre-Retirement Education: A Longitudinal Study', Op.Cit.*

126. *A.H. Charnley and H.A. Jones: Op.Cit. pp.87-101.*

127. *N. Keddie: 'Adult Education: an ideology of individualism', Op.Cit. J.L. Thompson: 'Adult Education for a Change', Op.Cit. pp.45-64.*

128. *Lovett and Thompson are both aware of the limitations of their work; see T. Lovett: 'Adult Education, Community Development and the Working Class', Op.Cit. pp.76-121.*

129. *J.L. Thompson: 'Learning Liberation', Op.Cit. p.171.*

130. *Ibid. p.175.*

131. *T. Lovett: Op.Cit. pp.113-117.*

132. *See Chapter Four, pp. 133-134.*

133. *J.L. Thompson: 'Learning Liberation', Op.Cit. pp.148-195.*

134. *C.O. Houle: 'The Enquiring Mind', Op.Cit.*

135. *N. Keddie: 'Adult Education: an ideology of individualism', Op.Cit. pp.45-64; also G. Mee and H. Wiltshire: 'Structure and Performance in Adult Education', Op.Cit. for an analysis of what may be seen to be the consequences.*

136. *A.D. Crombie: 'Participation and Recurrent Education', ARE, Nottingham, May 1980.*

137. *Ibid. pp.1-3.*

138. *P. Freire: 'Pedagogy of the Oppressed', Op.Cit. pp.45-59.*

139. *See R.H. Tawney: 'An Experiment in Democratic Education' in 'The Radical Tradition', Op.Cit. pp.81-83.*

CHAPTER THREE - FOUR CASE STUDIES

1. Introduction.
2. Methodology.
3. Adult Education in Scotland.
4. The Unemployed Workers' Course.
5. The Adult Learning Project.
6. The Craigmillar Festival Society.
7. Adult Basic Education in Pilton.
8. The Propositions and the Case Studies - Some Conclusions.

CHAPTER THREE

Four Case Studies

1. Introduction

Four educational projects in Edinburgh provided the basis for a qualitative study of some working class participants in learning. The projects were selected for two main reasons. First, each project was designed to engage adults in educational activity who would normally have been uninvolved in the conventional world of post-compulsory education. Secondly, it was claimed that their organisation and philosophy were based on a participatory approach to learning in which the experiences or social context of the individual were at the centre of the learning process.

At least some of the ideas influencing the project organisers concerned the possible remoteness and irrelevance of much conventional adult education. Its organisation was often seen to exclude the learner from an active participation in the definition of what was to be learnt.

Three of the case studies have been subject to extensive discussion and debate in Scottish adult/community education circles and beyond. The Adult Learning Project in Gorgie/Dalry is one of the few examples of Freirean methods being the basis of a project. The Craigmillar Festival Society has evoked the interest of outsiders as an indigenous, 'local' community expression of educational activity in an area of acute multiple deprivation.[1] The Unemployed Workers' Course is of interest because of efforts by course organisers to develop a curriculum from intensive, unstructured interviews relating to people's perceptions of unemployment, family and social life, self-image etc. The fourth study is based on one element within the Craigroyston Curriculum Development Project. The CCDP sought to relate the resources and potential of a secondary school more centrally to the lives of children, young people and adults in a peripheral council housing estate in North Edinburgh. An experimental adult basic education project emerged in response to evidence of low levels of educational attainment among the adult population.

It is emphasised that this study attempts to interpret the significance of learning to participants (and some non-participants in the case of the Unemployed Workers' Course) rather than a more comprehensive analysis of each project. A study of their broader educational significance would have involved an examination of their historical, organisational, philosophical and pedagogic components.

Nonetheless, there is some attempt to place the interviews in context by providing a background to each Project. For example, the views of participants are compared with the objectives and stated educational philosophy of those responsible for the work. Similarities and differences are discussed in an attempt to refine the propositions.

The analysis of each case study thus follows a sequence of (i) comments on background and stated objectives; (ii) an analysis of the interview transcripts (plus the additional material from the 31 people interviewed as part of the recruitment phase of the Unemployed Workers' Course. These transcripts are analysed before the material from the later interviews); (iii) a summary of significant points in relation to the experience of participation within the projects at the end of each study. These findings are than related to questions raised in the literature review.

It is important to note that my own varied relationship to the four Projects may have influenced my perceptions. For example, I was an External Assessor to the Unemployed Workers' Course which enabled easy access to participants as well as tutors and sessions. Strong relationships were forged with some of the students - for example, two of them agreed to read pieces of their writing as part of a programme presented by me on the local IBA Radio Station - Radio Forth.[2] Similarly, I was professionally involved in adult basic education work in Pilton as Head of the Adult Basic Education Unit in Lothian Region at that time. Close contact was possible with tutors and students; frequent discussions took place with some of those more broadly involved with the Craigroyston Curriculum Development Project. In contrast, there had been little day-to-day contact with the Adult Learning Project in Gorgie/Dalry or the Craigmillar Festival Society. I was more of an 'outsider' in these two studies. Indeed, in the case of ALP there was some suspicion about my motives; project leaders were sensitive to criticisms made of ALP by Regional Officers; the request for interviews coincided with an application for an extension to ALP's urban aid funding. As one of the course organisers wrote:

> *'To be truthful I feel a certain reluctance to ask members of ALP groups to make themselves available for purposes which may not be clear to them. It would help me to help you if you could answer a few questions.*
>
> *1. What are the sorts of questions you propose to ask?*
>
> *2. What hypothesis if any are you testing?*
>
> *3. How will the information ALP members give you be used?*

4. Would you be prepared to feed back into the project the results of your research?

I very much hope that we will be able to go ahead and that we will learn through your research how participants view ALP.' [3]

These are legitimate questions for any researcher who may wish to examine a piece of work. They may also reveal a concern that work may not be understood or subject to cursory enquiry. Workers in projects of a short-term, experimental nature, in which there is a deliberate attempt to challenge conventional approaches to the creation and stimulation of learning may feel acutely vulnerable to criticisms from what can be seen to be a sceptical educational establishment. Thompson has noted similar problems in developing women's education on council estates in the Southampton area.[4]

To minimise these difficulties considerable time was spent with all the Organisers. The purposes of the research were debated at length. All the material, publications and existing research were extensively examined. There were some problems in that the extent of primary and secondary source material varied from one project to another. For example, there was relatively little background material on the Unemployed Workers' course while the other three Studies had already been subject to research or evaluation. To meet some of these difficulties it was agreed to provide a draft research report for organisers, tutors and participants. This was done and a series of seminars and individual meetings in Edinburgh took place early in 1984.

These discussions underlined the provisionality of the research findings. A lot of time is needed to establish a mutual confidence in research. There can never be a certainty that the words, viewpoints and insights recorded by the researcher have revealed the thoughts and feelings of interviewees. This underlines the importance of participants having an opportunity to discuss the material. These discussions have influenced the final form of the Chapter. This can raise questions of objectivity; a researcher will need to be aware of his/her impact on others and their impact on him. The 'Hawthorne effect' is a problem in all social research which is not easily resolved. It is important for the researcher to record all problems as they are noted; to utilise any experience he/she may have of similar contexts or interviews. The views of other people may also help in interpreting interview material. It was decided to utilise some of the techniques and methods adopted by Jones and Charnley in their Literacy Study as a basis for research. The stages in the process and its rationale are outlined below.

2. Methodology

The methodology chosen to engage in dialogue with participants has been defined as 'corroborative'.[5] The educational researcher's situation is comparable to that of an ornithologist or ethologist observing a bird within a particular species, scrupulously studying the bird's behaviour and describing it. An explanation of behaviour emerges from comparison with other observations in analagous social and ecological contexts. The student takes note of those characteristics which seem to occur in other situations. They may take on a particular significance in the development of explanation.

Similarly, an educational researcher can exploit his own experience, particularly in relating to students whose skill and confidence in expressing thoughts and feelings may be minimal; previous attempts by some adults to explain and reflect on experience may have been devalued, ridiculed or rarely attempted. In this sense an exchange of information, ideas and feeling becomes corroborative as the educator uses his/her experience of similar circumstances to understand problems in establishing dialogue.

The difficulties of establishing dialogue in which insights are shared and there is increased mutual understanding are complex. Dialogue may not easily be achieved between a confident interviewer and a diffident interviewee. The interviewee may feed the researcher what he or she thinks the researcher wishes to know, or place values on certain experience, for example schooling , which are thought acceptable to the interviewer. The subjective frame of reference becomes hidden and obscured. If, as the phenomenonologists argue, it is difficult to understand another's subjective world and the tools of analysis - words - carry with them their own ambiguity and nuance, it is of central importance that the researcher is aware of his/her effect on another.

There is no easy solution to this central problem in any study of human behaviour. Everyone has experienced situations of pain, doubt, anxiety or guilt which make us hesitant to reveal our experiences. Such awareness can sometimes be exploited as a resource in research; it may be possible to recognise in others responses which are familiar or known because they follow patterns which the researcher has encountered elsewhere. This may help in a mutual search for meaning and explanation.

Corroborative methods require careful, critical and considered use. It is tempting to take note of those views which equate most easily to a burgeoning theory or personal beliefs. All aspects of an interview should be documented regardless of how this might complicate a search for

a basis of theory or an agenda for action. It is important for the researcher to be sensitive to the comments of some social scientists that the essence of a scientific approach lies less in any particular methodology but rather in an openness to all comment, evidence and data.

A further central aspect of an 'ethological' approach is that the stages in research vary in comparison with a conventional scientific approach. A sequence of initial observation, hypotheses formulation, operationalisation, measurement and a refinement of theory may be inappropriate. A prime objective in dialogue is to establish what is of consequence to the participant; this might only be achieved through the establishment of empathy as a means to encourage the interviewee to explore, explain and clarify any ideas or feelings which are expressed. The intent is to elicit those factors which are significant to the interviewee. This will require encouragement, sensitive questioning and sympathetic listening. More conventional methods might risk imposing explanations which do not adequately incorporate the experience and consciousness of the subjects of research.

It is not intended to suggest that the researcher abandons any prior framework or a check list of points derived from initial observations or related research. It is difficult if not impossible, as some extreme phenomenologists seem to argue, to abandon all preconceptions on the basis that they are alien to another person's consciousness and may therefore distort any findings. It may be better to be aware of the provisionality of the researcher's ideas. It is important to regard research as a kind of dialectic in which ideas change as evidence is gathered methods are adapted on the basis of experience and concepts can become enriched as a result. A thesis should acknowledge changing perspectives in which the eventual interpretation of a piece of empirical work is the end-product of a dynamic process.

The stages in the study can be summarised in the following way:

i. Initial contact with project organisers and familiarisation with primary and secondary material and existing research. There was a body of existing evaluation and research in three of the Case Studies which helped familiarise me with their background. This was not the case with the Unemployed Workers' Project. I was though an external assessor to the Project. The Course was new and there was no previous analysis. This explains the absence of material to provide a background to the study in comparison with the other projects. Nonetheless, the project organiser has provided some background through previously published articles. The

ideas which were of influence in developing the course can be discerned in this work.

ii. Meetings were arranged in the Autumn of 1982 with students and organisers of the four projects to clarify the aims of the research. The researcher was questioned on a number of occasions concerning the benefit or otherwise of the research to the projects. Members of staff and students were involved in discussions and it was from such a contact that the idea emerged of preparing a radio programme around the writings of some of the students involved in the Unemployed Workers' Course; these writings had been produced as part of a Writers' Workshop which was an important part of the course. These collective and individual contacts may have helped to alleviate some of the initial suspicions surrounding the research and its utility.

iii. A specific suggestion was made that interviewees should represent varying aspects of involvement. A request was made that students should wherever possible be working class and have had minimal previous involvement in post-compulsory education or training. In discussion with Project Organisers, it was agreed that five people would provide a reasonable range of participants, although this does not imply any claim to broader representativeness. The following aide memoire was produced as the possible basis for discussion although it was intended to use this only as a guide for discussion and not to disallow other themes from being explored:

"Interview Check List

Note 1. The purpose of the study is explained; to understand more about adults who participate in some kind of learning; to help refine and develop methods and approaches to involve others.

2. The interview is begun by explaining the purpose of tape recorder. 'I'd like to ask you some questions to jog your memory, to talk about the things that really interest or concern you. I would like to record what you say, word for word. Anything you don't want recorded, just tell me. You don't need to answer my questions. You can talk about what you want, including things I haven't mentioned'.

1. Personal history: jobs, unemployment, age, origins, family.

2. How did the individual become involved?

3. Experience of schooling: personal history, prior involvement in adult education, clubs, social activities etc.

4. Did any member of the family, close friend etc. encourage the individual?

5. What is being done? Student perception of the learning experience. What is the desired outcome?

6. Role of the tutor; shaping of the process of learning; materials being used and why?

7. *Meaning of experience; confidence? Any changes in patterns of living - e.g. involvement in other social activities.*

8. *Perceptions of other forms of continuing education - where now?"*

It was intended that the interviews should focus on three areas: an understanding of initial participation: the experience of participation itself and its meaning in broader personal and social terms.

iv. During the interviews, careful note was taken of all the circumstances of the interview - place, time, interruptions, others in attendance as well as any tension or particular difficulties in conversation. A request was made to tape the interviews and no-one objected; this would support findings from other research[8] that tape-recorders are now such a common feature of contemporary life that they are normally entirely acceptable to interviewees in research.

v. A detailed analysis of the interview material from the 31 adults initially approached for the Unemployed Workers' Course was undertaken; this was compared with a separate study undertaken by the Organiser.

vi. The taped interviews were fully transcribed and studied alongside the transcripts from the 31 interviews used in the 'Unemployed' course. As an intermediate stage, it was intended to discuss the initial observation on the data with participants in all the projects but this proved difficult to arrange for personal reasons. Instead a draft paper was produced for a series of workshops/seminars/individual discussions held early in 1984. The transcript material and analysis has also been examined by a number of colleagues involved in similar kinds of adult education.

3. Adult Education in Scotland

A study of participation in experimental adult education in Scotland cannot simply be viewed through English experience and institutional assumptions. The distinct Scottish context may have produced a curious paradox which has been noted by a number of commentators.[9] In comparison with England, there appears to be a relatively underdeveloped system of formal adult education. In contrast there seems to be a number of small scale informal adult learning experiments which may provide examples of good practice worthy of wider replication. The Alexander Report[10] noted the historical weakness of adult education in Scotland; for example the 1924 Adult Education Regulations following the Smith Committee Report in 1919 did not apply north of the Border.[11] Equally, the commitment of Universities to extension work was considerably less.[12]

Nonetheless, the Alexander report considered that 'community

education' in Scotland could involve a merger of two traditions which might lead to interesting innovation. Adult education and youth and community work could cross fertilise in a way that would provide a specific Scottish service. Alexander assumed a potential for curriculum development in adult education whilst youth and community workers had outreach and informal educational skills. These could merge to provide a new coherent structure of community education in which the informal would blend into more formal learning:

> *'Social, cultural, recreational and educational activities for adults are so interrelated that any attempt to distinguish between them or to deal with one without regard to the others would be undesirable even if it were possible. This view of ours is reinforced by the increasing use of the term 'community education' to refer to the social, cultural, recreational and educational provision by statutory authorities and voluntary agencies, and through involvement in the numerous voluntary groups in the community.'* [13]

Local government reorganisation in the mid-1970s led to the implementation of some aspects of Alexander. The two services were merged although Alexander's staffing proposals to increase adult education personnel by some 200 were never implemented. Research would also indicate that there has been little evidence of the cross fertilisation that Alexander had hoped for. Field work seems to consist predominantly of informal, recreational activity geared to young people with little evidence of a developing innovatory system of adult education.[14] A major analysis of community education in recent years indicated that most adult education provision continued in a fairly traditional manner *'largely unaffected by outreach and community involvement':*

> *'.. many of the full-time professional workers in Community Education and Leisure and Recreation have not developed the educational orientations and skills necessary for the development of a continuum of related social, recreational and educational objectives.'* [15]

Therefore on the one hand conventional adult education appeared to continue in a highly traditional way; the large institutions in higher and further education have paid relatively little attention to the needs of adults or the concept of continuing education.[16] On the other, Youth and Community work appears to have retained its informal youth bias with little evidence of an expansion of adult learning to provide the continuum of related activity which Alexander had hoped might emerge. A concern for experiment and alternative approaches of the kind discussed in the four Case Studies may best be understood against a backcloth of

limited adult learning opportunities and a bias towards young people in most community education practice.

Case Study One: The Unemployed Workers' Course

i. Introduction: Background and Stated Objectives

The WEA South East Scotland District's initiative in undertaking the interviews with unemployed people and organising the subsequent course stemmed from a belief that existing work was either inadequate or inappropriate.[17] As with many other WEA Districts, University Departments of Adult Education or LEAs, attempts had been made to develop courses in Unemployed Centres or via Trades Councils, Citizens' Advice Bureaux and other agencies.[18] But as with other providers, questions were being asked surrounding the content and quality of courses and alternative approaches to provision were being explored.

It has been noted that there is little direct background material to place this work in context. The approach to the development of adult learning though can be traced to some earlier writings by the main course organiser.[19] There are three important assumptions within the approach which can be identified in this material. First, a rejection of what has been termed the 'distortive' concept of needs as a basis for curriculum development. 'Needs' should be but one element in a broader attempt to unravel peoples' interests, '... *what they think about their lives, their situation*'.[20] Secondly, a belief that 'working people' can think and that is is possible to invigorate an interest in broader concepts and theory from the practical and particular. Lastly, there has been a gulf between the practitioner (who is said to produce 'research' without any adequate theoretical grounding or analysis of in-built assumptions) and the theorist whose ideas may not have been subject to practical application and refinement.

In the first instance, Kirkwood takes issue with philosophers such as Lawson who may be placing 'education' on a 'cognitive pedestal' unrelated to the practical issues of everyday experiences such as a child's education or 'play, roads, housing ...'.[21] Lawson's analysis is said to be based on a false distinction between academic learning and people's cultural situation. In Lawson's view students play a relatively minor role in determining what is done since education is primarily an initiation into worthwhile states of knowledge, i.e. understanding the nature of publicly validated knowledge. Kirkwood challenges the idea that people cannot connect with or utilise complex ideas through reflection on the concrete and particular. Evidence is presented from the Women's

Movement and Welfare Rights courses to support this assertion.

The second element of unravelling *'aspirations, interests, preoccupations, conscience, creative potential'* through *'dialogue'* can be seen as a basis for the indepth interview approach adopted for the project. Unemployed people were to be contacted via a network of social workers, community educators etc; they were to participate in the creation of a course through sharing their 'consciousness' with those planning a course. Potential participants were to be central to the creation of course content.

The third idea stems from a belief that much 'community education'[22] lacks an adequate theoretical grounding or is concerned only with the localised and particular and fails to encourage systematic thought and enquiry.[23] It is claimed that practice becomes locked into narrow ways of working. Practitioners can remain largely unaware of the values, assumptions and potential within their work. For example, some educators may adopt a simple individual pathology view of social deprivation in which problems are located within the people of an area. A need for additional play space for children is justified according to a lack of stimulus in the home. Parents should cope better with their children. There may be little awareness of alternative explanations surrounding social organisation and structural inequality. It may be that people may feel powerless to influence events or incapable of helping their children. They have little opportunity for self-development when locked into unsatisfying work, unemployment or material poverty. Similarly, community educators may fail to grasp practical opportunities for more sustained learning which emerge in educative activity. The educator may lack the skills to encourage critical reflection on informal learning or wider experience. The adult educator should use practical experience as a basis for sustained learning.

The WEA in Edinburgh decided to organise a pilot course based on the 'needs and wishes' of a number of unemployed people agreeing to be interviewed.[24] The project was financed by the Scottish Adult Basic Education Unit (SABEU), Lothian Region, as well as the WEA itself.[25] Fifteen interviewers were recruited from a number of educational and related agencies. The potential participants were to be working class. All were unemployed and with 'little prospect of getting a job'. 90% fell into the unskilled and semi-skilled manual worker category, 50% men and 50% women. Their ages ranged from 21-65. No-one who had either been to or was eligible to attend University, College or Further Education with a full grant was involved. Interviewees were required at 'various levels of literacy' from difficulties in reading and writing through to 'fluency'.[26] They

were recruited from six sources - Citizens' Rights Offices (6), a University Settlement Literacy Scheme (8), Community Centres/Community Education Workers (8), Job Centres (5), WEA Writers' Workshops (2), and direct suggestions by interviewers.[27]

There was also a concern to ensure that interviewers should be compatible with particular interviewees on the basis of 'subjective assessment'.[28] It is assumed that such judgements were left to the main course organisers since there is no analysis of how this was done in the available literature. Interviewers were provided with extensive guidance notes for the interviews; there was a stress in these notes on the importance of the interviewee articulating matters of importance to them and that the guidlines should be followed with great flexibility. The interviewers were also asked to be precise about what the WEA *could* and *could not* offer. Thus, dressmaking and local crafts were for the local authority. There would be no necessary improvement in job prospects through attending such a course. The importance of a cognitive education was stressed - and some examples given of what might be done. The WEA could offer *'reading and writing at any level, through writers' workshops, to novels, poetry, plays, politics, economics, history, philosophy, psychology, trade unions, how to go about coping with unemployment etc.'*[29] It was stressed that a concern for the highly personal and particular is not necessarily incompatible with subjects central to the WEA's tradition. Participants *'need not be locked in practical particularity, but can and often do branch out into matters of general significance and multiple interconnectedness'*.[30] For example sociological or philosophical ideas might illuminate more immediate concerns and anxieties. In this work, there was no sense of 'teaching' being devalued as an activity in a search for a more participatory mode of learning. On the contrary, good tuition was to be a means by which personal experience might be exploited as a basis for intellectual development.

ii. The 31 Interviews

Interviewers were asked to explore a number of themes in a person's life surrounding feelings, memories and perceptions of important institutional and personal relationships which could be useful material for a course. Experiences of school, family, work and unemployment, health, expectations and self-image were to be covered.

The material from the interviews tended to follow this sequence, although some of it indicates greater flexibility in the range of areas which were discussed; in a small number of instances, the interviewers noted that they felt the interviews were not progressing well - it was

difficult to establish dialogue or the person was unenthusiastic about being interviewed. On some occasions specific reference is made in the interview transcripts to a lack of sympathy with the interviewee - more than once born of a frustration with the person's attitudes or unresponsiveness.

The transcript material provides a rich source of information. There are patterns in the lives of many of the interviewees. Participation in a range of social activities has often involved negative experiences which tend to produce low expectations and poor self-image. It is possible to suggest from this material that the experience of unemployment cannot simply be viewed in isolation. It may be part of a broader process of feeling powerless, incapable and unable to influence events.

It is interesting to analyse the material following the sequence in which issues were raised in the interviews. This begins with memories of schooling and ends on self-image. My own analysis was compared with Kirkwood's work. There is little variation in interpretation; indeed the content analysis has been considered legitimate by others who have used the material as a basis for subsequent tutor training.[31]

(a) Experiences of School

The overriding impression of school was a place of some unhappiness, memories of failure and worry which tend to intrude into discussions about adult education and contemporary experience. As one interviewer wrote:

> *'Clearly he is frustrated that he hasn't achieved more educationally; this perhaps shows when he starts confidently upon an argument or a theory (relating to the current state of U.K. politics for example) and begins to falter from lack of information or failure of nerve when it comes to developing a line of argument.'* [32]

In another interview when discussions began to include the possible element of any 'course', memories of school intruded in a fairly explicit way. An interviewee was asked how he might feel about subjects such as sociology and philosophy or 'writing creatively':

> *'I wouldn't really want to come and study any of the things that were mentioned, it sounds like school again ...'*
> *'But some of the other things, politics and history and so on, I wouldn't want to come to that. It doesn't sound very good.'*
> *'Philosophy? I've got me own philosophy, that's the main thing ...'*

Such a response was fairly typical. Perceptions of adult education are mediated through memories of school. As Trenaman suggested, adult

education is not initially conceived as a distinct entity from schooling. It is part of a system which appears to be of little relevance.

Some interviewees had positive comments to make about school - mainly with reference to a particular subject that was recalled with pleasure. There were also favourable recollections of individual teachers. In one instance a teacher appears to have been a surrogate mother as a result of a family breaking up. For no-one in this sample was school in general a happy experience. A sense of failure is a theme throughout the interviews; examinations are recalled as particularly traumatic. Failure tends to be explained in personal terms of shyness or withdrawal through lack of confidence. Many of these people were children lost in large classes, or as one person remarked, *'teacher didna want t'know':*

> *'School was alright sometimes but I didn't like it at all. I found it hard t'make friends ... I didn't have many friends at school - they all seemed to be paired off ... I was quite shy and self-conscious. I stayed off school sometimes but I wasn't bad. I never had the panel up at the door. It was just odd days I took off. I was too feared t'stay off long 'cos m'dad used t' go mad at skiving.'*

Where one person recalled some success in school, he was nonetheless *'a horrible wee devil'* and constantly in trouble with the school authorities.

Feelings of shyness or withdrawal in school were ofen compounded by constant interruptions to schooling either through family crises, ill-health or 'dodging'. Six people specifically recall long periods absent from school due to illness.

For some people, school was a source of literal pain or aggression. Nine people refer to the belt, violence on the part of teachers or hurt caused by fellow pupils. In one case, a teacher was remembered with anger:

> *'In the 2nd last year, I was taught by this guy who was an educational psychologist - he was a psychological hooligan and he made my life a misery for the whole year ... By the 2nd year in 2nd School I discovered I was being taught by academic thugs.'*

There are no examples in the transcripts of any subjects firing the imagination or experiences leaving a more positive, lasting impression. School was recalled as irrelevant; one person made a very pointed comment:

> *'They don't teach the right things - what they teach has no relevance when you leave school unless you continue in education or in a*

particular sphere. History - dates and places were an example, but this applied to most subjects ... '

The idea of exclusion, of becoming marginal in a social institution which can be important in affecting broader opportunity, is given detailed expression in this material. It may be legitimate to regard *'the school as a factory system producing success and failure, with a lot of pain and distress as by-products.'* Perhaps the system of exams is 'the most dangerous machine in the factory'.[33] The school appears as a coercive system in which authority figures may seek to regiment children into moulds with the belt as a physical sanction. School was a source of alienation rather than the basis of a broader social opportunity for these people. School can also be regarded as the single most decisive factor in shaping perceptions of adult education. Ideas of lifelong learning or continuing education appear irrelevant; adult education is not perceived as a separate entity from the dominant school system. There is a note of irony in one woman's brief excursion into adult education (she was attracted to a New Horizon's course for women) which reinforced memories of rejection and inadequacy:

'When she finally plucked up courage to go to the above class she did not complete the course because of illness. She did not know who the organisers of the class were. She felt as if others in the class were better educated than her and that they knew a lot of background information that she was unfamiliar with ...'

(b) Family

Problems within schooling were often associated with domestic difficulties. Sometimes absence from school was not a specific, conscious choice but resulted from family pressures:

'I wish I had had better opportunity but we had a lot of family problems at home so that also affects a child's schooling. Y'know I think that definitely holds a child back and I think that held me back too because you can't concentrate at school if you're coming home to do housework and all sorts of other things ...'

In three interviews, earlier family problems appear to be replicated in later life. Adult relationships have been unstable - eleven people had experienced marriage breakdown or unhappy personal relationships. Several women admitted to personal strains leading to problems with their own children. In one case baby battering was a source of deep anguish and regret.

These private problems may be exacerbated by the areas in which people live. The immediate environment seems to contribute to tension and stress:

'This area puts pressures on you. There's a lot of stabbings and road accidents ... You get on top of the kids for using bad words but it's not their fault ...'

A response may be to retreat further into self and the home. Many of the people live on large council estates and there is only limited evidence of any supportive neighbours. Material and personal problems seem to encourage a withdrawal from social activity and participation in anything beyond the immediate demands of the home and children.

(c) Work and Unemployment

Becoming unemployed has added to these problems, particularly in the sense of material deprivation or social isolation. The significance of work is recalled in extrinsic rather than intrinsic terms: work itself was a means to an end - greater material comfort, making friends or achieving some social status - rather than being a source of any deeper personal development. Two people recalled the alienating nature of work:

'I didn't like the drudgery. I used to say to myself ... Lemonade Factory - retire when I'm 65. Hope I'm not doing this all the time. Taking screwtops off bottles, smelling the bottle to make sure it had no chemical or paraffin, so it could be used again for lemonade. If it was not good - break it. I used to break a lot of good bottles just for the sake of getting into the fresh air ...'

'I started work in the Store... just filling shelves; it bored me t'tears. It was all right at first but I was there for over a year, I just couldna stand it any longer'.

These specific examples of the drudgery of 'work' are limited to two people; the general sense is of financial pressure to find a job or a loss of status and social contact from being out of work:

...'the type of job I'd want, probably in a shop like Woolworth's. I felt quite important at work. I just felt important having an overall on, I felt somebody. And I used t'go out at nights with the girls from work, that's how good it was.'

Unemployment restricts social contact, leisure activity and encourages apathy and withdrawal:

'He is frustrated but is getting used to doing nothing. He feels he is becoming lazy and is putting on weight and getting very unfit physically. "Work would ease my mind." '

Any blame for personal predicaments tends to be attached to self rather than broader political or social causes. While one person blamed Government policies, alongside 'rent' and the 'corporation' for his personal plight, there was no evidence of participation in 'Unemployed Centres' or any thought of action with others to question present circumstances. People had become resigned to financial insecurity, limited opportunity and isolation. At a political level, little could be done:

'I'd like to see them doing it but I dunna think there's the money t'do it. I mean I feel sorry for a lot o' they men ken that've worked all their lives 'n' then all a sudden they're redundant. It's a shame ... '

The Trade Union Movement is likewise seen as irrelevant. The majority of people appear to be suspicious of Trade Unions. There has been no contact with any Union since unemployment. The fact that people feel political, trade union or any collective activity would serve no purpose is a manifestation of their powerlessness, social isolation and loss of faith.

(d) Health

A retreat into self, inactivity and inconfidence can lead to ill health. Illness seems related to personal crises, marital breakdown or financial worries. 'Depression' is the most commonly expressed problem which for a small number has led to 'drinking' as a source of escape:

'I have been drinking too much. In fact I spend more on drink now than I ever have before. It's just depression... I just go on drinking to make up for it. It's a vicious circle in fact - the less money I've got, the more I spend it on drink'.

Or, as another person put it:

'One drinks for effect. It's a form of escapism. There's nothing I like better. Sitting alone in the house having a drink and meditating ...'

Twelve people refer to illness, physical and mental, as a recurring problem in their lives. Physical disability, asthma and mental stress are specifically mentioned.

A sense of well-being is dependent on how positively the individual views him/herself. The totality of experience seems to lead to self-denigration or a poor self-concept which in turn influences physical and mental health. Personal and social context cannot be divorced from the way we feel, the way we are. A retreat or exclusion from a participation

in life and its determination can be a source of ill-being.

(e) Expectation and Self-Image

Some researchers[34] have argued that the experience of unemployment produces a sequential pattern of reactions - beginning with shock and moving to optimism, pessimism and fatalism as time passes. It has been suggested that all unemployed people suffer from lower morale than those who are employed.[35] Other researchers[34] have related this to social class and have established a correlation between low morale, growing older and social class.

The Edinburgh sample consisted of people who had been unemployed for at least a year. Not everyone had retreated into inactivity and 'fatalism'. Four people had found some alternative source of social activity and stimulus. One woman was heavily involved in a local community centre; another did not label herself as unemployed and found some social purpose in family and domestic life. One young woman had 'discovered' a range of sporting activities as a substitute while one man thought of unemployment as a source of release from 'monotony'. These people were the exceptions among the majority whose expectations were low and self-image negative.

Certain people had found some compensation in other activities. They were no substitute for employment. One person had an interest in music and attended a numeracy class. They provided little compensation or alternative fulfilment:

'Depression's been with me for many years but I can handle it a lot better. When I'm really down I just think ... "Let it go to the bottom, it can only get back up." So I leave the whistles aside, lay off the music, plod on with the arithmetic, watch a bit of television as a means of escape.'

There is a strong theme of self-deprecation and associated fantasy. One woman at the age of 25 was resigned to find comfort through the medium of her children rather than through herself. She had become a being for others rather than for herself:

'I hope for a good life with my bairns. To have holidays. To bring them up with a lot more happiness than I've had in my life. I hope they'll achieve more than I've ever done ...'

Another person found some 'comfort' in a fantasy surrounding emigration:

'I want to leave Britain because I just don't see any future here, the country is finished ... I can't have any ambitions with the way the country is ...'

Nothing had been done to make emigration possible while there was disbelief that anything could be done to influence events *'the way the country is...'* The more fatalistic this person became, the greater the indulgence in fantasy.

Most people may have low expectations both in and out of employment. Passivity, inactivity and an absence of any assertiveness seem evident. As one twenty-year-old woman put it:

'Unemployment doesn't really put limits on me because the telly is my favourite past-time.'

Some social interaction which does take place seems to fuel personal anxiety. Relationships with the D.H.S.S. and other public agencies are referred to with pain and resignation. They contribute to a feeling of helplessness. The individual's relationship to public bureaucracy is one of subordination without any sense of power, or self-esteem in the way that Trenaman described. It may also be part of a pattern, an experience of class relationships, which he implied.

All thirtyone people were positively encouraged to participate in a course. Fifteen did so and of these thirteen remained 'effective students' throughout.[37] This may seem surprising given the degree of social withdrawal, poor self-image and low expectations of most of those in the sample. No clear explanation is offered in Kirkwood's analysis and by the stage of the later interviews it was difficult to disentangle reasons for continuing participation from initial explanations. Two tentative interpretations are offered which may relate to some evidence of successful recruitment elsewhere.[38] First, the interviewers were part of an informal network of social and community workers who in some instances knew potential participants personally. Indeed, in the case of the five participants interviewed separately, two had already become involved in a Writers' Workshop and a Numeracy course. The importance of identifying and using a range of 'networks' has been advocated by a number of adult educators.[39] Secondly, from general discussions with the participants, the interviews had been a source of encouragement. Their words, worlds, problems and concerns were treated sensitively. An analysis of the transcripts indicates that care was taken to encourage people when they may have felt ultra-cautious, nervous or diffident. Their views and personal biographies were treated with respect. A sense of sharing such personal and difficult experiences with another person may have helped lower the normal barriers to participation.

The course ran for 10 weeks, one full day per week. The morning session consisted of subject options - only two of which could be chosen.

The options were 'Human Relations', 'Tackling Problems', 'Politics and Sociology' and 'Women's Studies' before coffee; 'Brush up your Skills', a 'Writers' and Readers' Workshop' and 'Scottish Studies' afterwards. Although it was possible to relate some of the themes in the transcripts to these sessions, it became clear in discussion that there had been little time for systematic content analysis by tutors, including some discussion of the appropriateness of using very personal material in group work. The extent therefore that the course reflected a completely novel approach to recruitment and curriculum development can be doubted. For example, the interview themes and course proposals were not discussed with potential participants before the course began.

iii. Five Participants

The five interviews covered similar points to those in the 31 transcripts. Interviews took place on one day of the course and varied in length and quality. Two students insisted on being interviewed together, perhaps to provide mutual support; one participant was extremely reticent about revealing any personal information. A scribbled note on a piece of card was surreptitiously passed over.

'Linden, I don't think I could answer the personal questions, marriage etc., I think I would be a hopeless customer for you. I can talk about the course all right, I would rather not talk about the past.'

This is an example of nervousness in interviews which presented difficulties. Some questions 'touched' painful experiences which may have led to silence or a desire to talk about other things.

Three of the students were male, aged 62, 53 and 23. Two females: 27 and 19. The minimum period of unemployment had been one year.

It is important to note that the interviews took place during the penultimate session of the course. This gave students a sufficient basis of involvement to allow some conclusions to be drawn.

There are four themes which tend to recur; first, participants continued to be diffident about personal competence; secondly, perceptions about the extent of student participation varied according to the tutor and topic. There were varying levels of interest and involvement. All the participants felt anxious throughout about contributing to group discussion; thirdly, there was a continuing pessimism about the future. The course was valued but its impact was considered to be marginal (not only in terms of employment but also in raising confidence or changing personal circumstances). Finally, the course was thought preferable to normal, everyday routine.

Despite being praised for written work and favourable group comments, one student still commented that a piece of written work was *'received well although I didn't think it was that good'*. Another felt concerned about 'Maths': *'I did Maths but only once, I didn't enjoy it. We were told it would be put to us in an easy way, but I felt it wasn't - maybe it was just my fault'*. The tendency is for students to blame themselves rather than the tutor or course. Somewhat hesitantly the student commented that the sessions had 'seemed too rushed'. One student found the prospect of group discussion intimidating and tended to opt out:

'I prefer to listen rather than talk ... I don't know. I just prefer to listen. I've always done that - just listened to everybody and then thought about it when I got home ... I always keep on thinking of questions but I never ask them ... I didnae really talk. The rest of them did ...'

Lack of confidence and anxiety at appearing foolish in the group are common - reading and writing in a Workshop was a totally new experience for many of these students.

'Well, everybody was reading theirs out but I come from that well-known district Pilton and I thought I better not read it out because I had all the common words instead of big long words. I prefer to write stories and hand them in.'

Being in an unfamiliar setting and mixing with people from different backgrounds produced anxiety. The language of tutors could also appear intimidating.

Some students felt more involved than others. One student thought that *'you shouldn't really talk about your own personal problems'* which is probably more a comment on the student and a wish to avoid feeling foolish in the group than it is on the tutor or organisation. Another student felt that the Writers' Workshop allowed 'personal things' to be considered:

'... it just came automatically ... it just seemed to be a happy event, people participated. It was good to be among other people in the same situation - unemployed. I wrote poems there - I had never written before in my life.'

The approach of tutors varied; some were more 'subject' than 'problem' orientated:

'the man knew his job inside out. It didn't matter what subjects were spoken about; for he said his bit ... it was his subject.'

The Human Relations' sessions were well received, although two

students felt that others were participating rather than themselves - *'others jumped in - but not me'*. The sessions tended to follow a conventional pattern, with questions and discussion following a formal input by the tutor. This is not surprising given the anxiety both tutors and students must have been feeling. The use of more experiential and interactive modes of learning does not emerge easily without mutual confidence.

Although all the students felt 'good' at producing written work or reported increases in confidence, there was an air of awesome realism about some comments: *'At 53 years old it would take more than 10 weeks to be more confident.'* The future remained 'very bleak'; another student felt no discernible change in confidence, having felt somewhat peripheral to much that had happened in the course; the student thought that a deeper involvement was not possible since *'they didn't understand enough about it to ask any questions'*. It may be important to observe that set against such a backcloth of stultifying personal histories, even a relatively well-resourced, labour-intensive tutorial exercise might only begin a process of providing avenues to greater belief and self-confidence and to a deeper level of participation.

Nonetheless, compared with the emptiness of a normal day the experience was considerably valued. One student spoke for the others in a succinct and revealing way:

> *'Actually I feel quite sad that this course is going to end. What am I going to do on the Friday I used to come to the course? There was some reason for going out and now there is going to be a sort of "I don't have to get up, get dressed or do any writing". There's nobody there - it's just empty.'*

There is something of a paradox in a feeling of hopelessness for the immediate future being set against the beginnings of purposefulness discovered through the course. This may provide a basis for a more general conclusion about the Pilot project. A discovery of self-worth, confidence to begin to take decisions or a belief in acting to change circumstances, is hardly to be achieved by a ten week introduction to adult education in the absence of major national economic and educational initiatives. In sociological terms long term unemployment has been said to confer a 'negative master status' of 'powerlessness' on those who experience it and this dominant influence will not be quickly dissipated by a short-term involvement in education.[40] This is not to disparage such work, rather to assert the greater significance of other cultural factors in the lives of unemployed people.

iv. An Overview

There is material in this study to support the view that participation in learning should be understood as an element within the totalities of a person's historical and cultural being. There was evidence in the literature [41] that learning can be stifled by initial education and other social experiences. The meaning of learning is mediated through the consequences of social exclusion and personal deprecation. Memories of schooling continue to evoke strong feelings of self-doubt. The generalities of Trenaman's work are given substance and sharp relief in this material. There remains a doubt about Trenaman's conclusion that non-participation in adult education is an example of learning and education being devalued by working class people.

The relationship between social class and attitudes might better be explained by reference to negative influences within schooling rather than antagonism towards learning and education per se. The antagonism is born of specific experiences of particular institutions rather than expressed towards abstract notions of learning. It is not possible to reject or devalue what may never have been known.

There is considerable overlap between participation in learning, general social participation and the second proposition. Personal power and influence over events can be regarded as one aspect of a person's cultural context. For the people in this first study there is a theme of powerlessness and lack of control in relation to significant social and economic forces. It seems difficult for people to affect personal or social change. Lives appear to be dominated by social forces which are largely controlled by others. This cannot simply be explained by reference to external or objective factors alone, such as unemployment or material poverty. People define themselves as powerless and unimportant. They may feel unable to learn or that they have little to offer. They acquiesce in their marginalisation.

It is to be regretted that more direct use was not made of biographical material to develop multiple interconnections and conceptual links. There was a wealth of material from the practical and particular which could have been more fully exploited by tutors. It would have been interesting to evaluate the experience of using transcript material as viewed by tutors and students. The interviews provided an opportunity for tutors to engage participants more centrally in classroom activity; There was a chance to consider students' thought worlds more directly and how ideas might be used to illuminate patterns within experience. The use of the material could have been carefully documented; the degree to which discussion was enriched and further analysis encouraged

might have been more directly measured. The Case Study provided an interesting example of one approach to investigation and curriculum planning which was not fully developed.

Finally, a participant control in learning could not be easily achieved over such a short period of time given the perceptions of learning and education which people brought to the course. Time is needed to establish confidence, to find the strength to read a piece of written work or challenge a tutor's interpretation. Some confidence was being discovered by participants but this needed to be carefully nurtured. A democratic spirit in the classroom - in the sense of a respect for one's own potential to contribute, a confidence to participate and listen to others and a capacity to reflect and share anxiety - is a process to be learned and not one which emerged naturally from broader experience.

4. Case Study Two: The Adult Learning Project

i. Introduction: The Background and Objectives

The Adult Learning Project in Gorgie/Dalry (an inner city area of Edinburgh with a mixed social class population, including an increasing number of young professionals and a long established working class community) is the only Scottish adult education project to be based explicitly on a Freirean approach. It is probably the best-known example in the United Kingdom. It originated in an Urban Aid Grant application at the end of 1978 following the development throughout that year of a 'flexible locally based adult education programme'.[43] The programme was designed after canvassing local people on their interests and setting up courses through which these could be developed. Prior to the granting of Urban Aid, it became clear that *'while a more flexible system of subject-based courses for adults encouraged and enabled more people to participate in adult education, we were moving very slowly along the way of altering people's relationship to education.'*[44] This point was not fully explained but a decision was made to develop a programme of education based on the experiences of, and issues raised by people living in the area. Small education groups would be established. They would learn to analyse, reflect and act on themes which they had identified.

The Project Workers (there were three, funded through Urban Aid) expressed their raison d'etre in a clear and concise way:

'THE WHAT

We will be going round with people from the area to find out what it is like to live and work in Gorgie/Dalry and what major problems there are.

'We would hope to bring people together to look at these problems in detail using the information we have received from going round the area talking with people.

We would work with people to look closely at how they feel about their present situation. How it came about and how it can be changed. When people see the possibility of getting things changed they will work out together education programmes through which they will contin-uously learn from each other. More about their situation and what they need to know and do to bring about change.

THE WHY

We think people are frustrated. They have a lot to offer although they are not always aware of it and the situation as it is stops them from making a contribution.

We want to explore with people new ways of doing things in which they can be fully involved, deciding for themselves what they want to do and how they want to do it, without always looking to people in authority for a lead.

We believe that people have a right to control their own lives and by working together can think about their situation and decide how to change it ... We believe that people know a lot; and by talking and working together they can learn from each other.

We believe that people in the past made society the way it is today and it is people who can change it now and influence what happens in the future and if we do not take control others will take control for us.' [45]

This is a succinct exposition of some of Freire's ideas. There are three important assumptions which place participants at the centre of the learning process. First, reflection by participants on the social, cultural and political contexts of their lives is an essential element within learning; secondly, the idea of change follows a recognition of frustration and social contradictions; thirdly, people have been encouraged to devalue their capacity to control situations. Freire's central ideas have been transferred from North Eastern Brazil to a highly schooled, 'advanced', urban society in the belief that their relevance and practicality may be equally valid.

The basis of Freire's philosophy has been introduced in the literature review.[46] The importance of his teaching is that it unites aspects of all four propositions into one theory of pedagogy for those he calls 'the oppressed'. His ideas are a synthesis of a 'theology of liberation' and

Marxist notions of class exploitation. Freire is close to the position of existentialists such as Sartre[47] in that the person is a direct agent of his/her own liberation by acting and reflecting upon cultural constraints. Culture is also defined in its anthropological sense - it is nature transformed by the work, activity and creativity of people. The fulfilment of human creativity is naming the world - understanding and interpreting self and existence as historical entities. This is a uniquely human process.[48] People either create culture directly or it is created for them by others. It is either produced in 'dialogical relationships' with others - in which each supports the other in a search for understanding - or is imposed 'non-dialogically'; the imposition of a set of ideas by one person on others is not learning - it is invasion. The process of learning and its content are interdependent - in naming the world 'the oppressed' learn and change the world. It is not possible for those without adequate food, shelter, material necessities or abused by the dictates of others to learn without action on culture. Reflection and action are part of a necessary synthesis; the former can become what Freire calls mere 'blah' if it is unrelated to the constraints of existence while activism can be mindless and immoral without reflection.[49]

Disputes surrounding the relevance of Freire to inner city Edinburgh and a relative abundance of resources and workers in relation to participants produced tensions within the Community Education Department of Lothian Region.[50] Claims were made by Regional Officers that there were:

> *'various problems of understanding in relation to the Project... Some time ago we got a copy of the report issued by the project which did not impress us, both in terms of its quality, the numerous mistakes in it, and also some of the language which we found difficult.'*[51]

The difficulty of applying Freire's ideas in a very different culture was clearly indicated by the Project Leader in response to comments from the officers:

> *'we are all on difficult ground when we are trying something new. We believe the ideology can work in Gorgie/Dalry but we need the support and wisdom of colleagues to challenge our analysis and action positively and to sustain us ...'*[52]

The criticism focused in part on an alleged failure to implement the terms of reference of the Urban Aid application. Thus, the application had specified *'adult education courses leading to 'O' and 'H' grade examinations as well as the development of a management group.'*[53] It was claimed that these proposals had not been implemented. Further, it was noted that there had been problems in involving the 'parent ALP' - *'a*

community controlled, subject-based' project; in particular there is evidence to indicate that four women who constituted the core group were inadequately consulted. This is separately confirmed in the First External Assessors' Report.[54] The women were resentful *'that the new orientation had been imposed non-dialogically'.*[55] The project was also accused of 'self-indulgence' (presumably spending too much time theorising) and reference was made to American experience of uncritical and ill-informed applications of Freire's methods.[56] It was suggested that this might lead to much 'frustration'. The likely outcome in Gorgie/Dalry could be a failure to find an *'elusive proletariat'* through which the world could be transformed.[57]

It is interesting that recognition is given in the same document to the work in progress being undertaken diligently *'in an impressively methodical way'* and that *'the project is very different to other adult education projects (which) has made it necessary for the workers to develop a methodology which is a time consuming process'.*[58] The workers were anxious to develop mutual confidence as a team. They needed respect in the area in which they proposed to operate before moving into the stage of 'co-investigation', that is working with local people to understand any common themes from their experiences.[59] The 'instrumental and purposive' nature of initial training by the workers was noted by the external assessor, as well as the determination to explore the *'philosophical orientation of the project'* and to reflect on the educational and organisational methods *'for the tasks to be undertaken'.*[60] This was contrasted with ad hoc, unsatisfactory approaches in much community education where workers were either 'pitched in' or training appeared irrelevant to the practical demands of the work.[61]

Undoubtedly there were problems in relating to local people and developing the work. Initially, the Project Team was concerned to use known contacts in the area and to exploit their networks. This approach was rejected by Senior Management in the Community Education Area Team on the grounds that it might fail to reach many people and might produce unrepresentative groupings.[62] Gorgie/Dalry was to be broken down into smaller units, with an area of some 2,000 people being chosen as the first investigative unit. The project leader reported that 'interviews' and 'observations' were carried out in various places including work places, local group meetings, churches, leisure places and the clinic. Once data had been gathered through interviews and observations of life, a review was undertaken to identify broad themes. It is of interest that the external assessor notes that the co-investigators consisted of *'young*

lower professional people'.[63] What was missing from the group *'was the manual working-class'* both male and female of all ages.[64] The portrait of the area contained much material on working class life but working class people had not been participants in the *'co-investigation'*.

During this period the Project had changed location to shop premises on a main route into the City. This offered some potential to popularise the project. There was anxiety over the small numbers of people who were involved: the project was encouraged to be *'more aggressive, outgoing, morale raising'*[65] - less introspective and tentative over methodology.

Out of the process of co-investigation and decodification, two groups emerged in each of three topic areas - 'Education and Schooling', 'On Being Scottish', and 'Family Ties' with an overall theme of 'Power and Powerlessness'. The Groups met for two hours each week, either morning or evening. They were initially designed to run for six weeks although the Groups' work continued beyond this.[66]

ii. Five Participants

The five participants who agreed to be interviewed were an interesting mix; in some ways they were a microcosm of the Project itself - young unemployed professional people with some working class involvement. Two women were graduates (although of working class origin) - one unemployed, the other working as a cashier at a Film Theatre. Both were in their early 20s. Another woman had dropped out of an Art Course at a Glasgow College after completing 3 years and having been asked to repeat her third year. She was now married with two young children and any idea of recommencing her course had long since been abandoned. The fourth woman was in her mid-thirties, had left school at 15, worked as a part-time typist and had minimal formal educational qualifications. The only man had left school at 17 with six 'O' levels and one 'Higher'; joined the Civil Service, but left after a year. Since then he had done a variety of labouring jobs and at present was unemployed.

Two of the participants had become involved in ALP through friends; two became interested through notices or exhibitions in the 'shop' on Dalry Road whereas one person had been connected with St. Bride's Community Centre, where the Project had been previously based. She had become known to the workers and familiar with some of their ideas. The two graduates were undoubtedly looking for more fulfilling ways to spend their time; they had experience of adult education via a Writers' Workshop and a training course at a Citizens' Rights Workshop. Both felt they had skills to offer the project and had subsequently participated in

a Writers' Workshop and Skills' Exchange. One of the graduates offered to teach Russian (the subject of her first degree) and found herself running the Skills' Exchange; the other joined a Writers' Workshop which also developed as part of the Project. Both of these participants were dismissive of much conventional adult education; they were anxious to emphasise the importance of, and sense of equality within 'the ALP experience'. This was a common theme in all the interviews:

> *'Yes, that's why these people are drawn to the courses. The actual ALP shop itself can be seen to be very informal by anyone who happens to be passing and there is always something in the window to read to arouse people's curiosity. The informality is important because as soon as people think of Colleges and evening classes it is all very institutionalised - that's the difference with ALP, the openness of it all.'*

The other person felt that much conventional education had *'far too many divisions between the teachers and the taught':*

> *I think that school and what might be called acceptable forms of learning are just not relevant for some people because it makes them feel inadequate.'*

They considered the involvement of people with different levels of formal educational attainment as a source of strength within ALP; any other view was thought to be patronising or irrelevant:

> *'for instance, I don't feel superior when talking to, for example, someone of 45 who left school at 15 and then spent the rest of her life at home with the children. I don't find her inarticulate. The fact that I have a degree and she doesn't will not enter anybody's head. If these people have anything to offer they tend to express themselves adequately. Anything that any member wants to contribute is of value ...'*

There was some defensiveness in the response of one person to a similar question; for example, a doubt was expressed as to how much the area was in fact *'working class'* and in any case ALP involved *'a fairly good spread of people'*. What seemed to be of concern was that the educational quality of ALP might be neglected in a desire to question the social class basis of the Project.

The theory and practice of learning within ALP were important to all the participants. The man had hated school and everything connected with conventional education:

'Well, I didn't enjoy being taught. The teacher was the guy that was paid to be there, to suffer all the hassles and wipe the noses of the younger ones; it was just a job to them. There was no sort of communication between the pupils and the teacher.'

It had taken him some months to get involved with ALP. His understanding of adult education had been no more than that *'it was something like night-classes'*. His original approach resulted from *'a vague interest in learning to use a camera'*. Initially, he was uninterested in using the camera as a tool to analyse the area: *'I wasn't all that interested in what they said we would be doing which was a portrait of Gorgie/Dalry which sounded pretty boring.'* The experience of co-investigation changed his mind:

'I'm glad I started. Apart from the fact that I've now learned more or less how to use a camera, develop films and how to set up pictures; the projects that I've been involved in have all been pretty interesting. We weren't given strict projects. Nobody said "you will go out and photograph this ..." It was more of a group than a night-class really.'

The interviewee had obviously enjoyed these experiences; there was a marked contrast between his memories of schooling, the constraints of the Civil Service, being told what to do and his feelings towards ALP. Participation in ALP had involved a positive experience of learning and some redefinition of what learning could be.

Although another participant had known the workers from the previous base, she was still unsure whether ALP would be *'like your ordinary school where you were sitting with a teacher/pupil relationship'*. She discovered that it was quite *'different'*:

'I think they had it worked out. But you could speak about your experiences - it wasn't them telling you about things. They got people involved in discussions by showing pictures relating to the topic, for instance the one about Scottish History was a picture of the football match at Wembley when all the Scottish fans invaded the pitch.'

The Group had used Freire's method of 'decodification' to analyse material. This involves using photographs to represent issues and themes which had been identified in the co-investigation. In the case of the Scottish fans at Wembley this led to reflection on the stereo-typing of a national identity by a larger neighbour to the South. The 'stereotype' was often accepted by those being categorised - to question its historical and contemporary validity could be a basis of understanding culture

being imposed as well as a catalyst in learning.

The relationship in Freirean theory between observation, decodification, reflection and action, raises a central question in developing an understanding of participation. There is evidence in the interviews that the learning method - co-investigation and decodification - was a source of stimulation and ideas:

'I was part of the "Terraces" group which dragged on for some time - it was all to do with cars going into the terraces and children playing there. We've done interviews on the subject, had an exhibition, meetings and all sorts of things and it is amazing the amount of interest there has been in the issues.'

'I'm more aware of how the various sections of the community work. Also I'd never actually been back to school since I left so it was quite interesting to go back into a primary school and also I didn't even know the Gorgie/Dalry Festival existed although I had stayed there for years. Really, I became interested in the whole place rather than just somewhere to drink and somewhere to sleep.'

It is less clear how this produces a sense of related contradictions and action to change them. It is difficult to argue that some action in relation to a lack of play space can be used as evidence of 'men' acting on culture in the grand sense as used by Freire. There is no clear relationship between reflection, action and a broader political radicalism. The voices in the interviews were not of people becoming politically conscious in a radical sense. Rather they were those of participants discovering confidence, a break from the monotony of being stuck at home or being isolated and finding in ALP some outlet and purpose. The importance of ALP is defined more in terms of a participatory style of learning - a resolution of a 'contradiction' between 'teacher and taught'. Participatory learning was important to all five interviewees:

'I've been to two of the sessions when we went through the book 'Pedagogy of the Oppressed' - I thought it was interesting. I find a lot of what the author says is similar to some of the teaching in the New Testament, in some ways it helped me make what I believe practical.'

It is more difficult to find evidence of the development of a wider political 'conscientization' as defined by Freire. There is no one common view of 'oppression' or even whether it exists. At this stage Freire's strength and relevance seems to lie in his methods - less in his political prescription. Such a conclusion might of course be very

premature. If the project was to become more firmly established, it would be of interest to analyse how deeply 'political' learning might become.

Similarly, it was difficult to evaluate the extent of learning which had taken place. Whilst the methodology had been novel and provocative, there were problems in moving from the immediate and particular to a broader and deeper conceptual awareness.[67] One of the external assessors described some of the work as superficial.[68]

There were also continuing problems in recruiting people to ALP. The second external assessor was concerned about the failure to involve more local people in its management although 36 local people had been involved in the Groups, including a number of working class adults.[69] A later assessment (published in January 1982) explained some of these early difficulties in more detail - there had been an inexperienced team, a limited initial response from the local population, as well as antagonism and misunderstandings on the part of Senior Management. Questions were raised about the relevance of some Freirean ideas when set against the more conventional educational aspirations of some participants. There was a continuing need to extend the range of participants perhaps by using some of the members of the groups in an evangelical role.[70]

The theme of limited recruitment runs throughout all the assessments but the last one ended on an optimistic note. (This could be regarded as being 'politic' given the three year Urban Aid period coming to an end.) In the view of the third external assessor 'techniques and materials' had been refined and were now more relevant to a Scottish context; the team functioned remarkably well *'as a team'* and were striving to produce learning of the highest excellence for people gaining little from conventional adult education. Foster considered ALP had reached a possible 'take off' point in involving more people - qualitatively and quantitively.[71] At this point ALP had failed to engage the interest and commitment of large numbers of local people. The project may have been viewed as little more than a slightly unconventional educational initiative. For many local people it probably appeared as but one part of a larger world of 'education'.

iii. An Overview

Participants in this study were not all from the same social groups as those in the Unemployed Workers' Course. Some had substantial initial education and did not seem so deeply alienated. The five people were unrepresentative of the area; in this they reflected the relatively

marginal involvement of the manual working class.

Despite such social differences, all the participants were or had been unemployed. They had felt purposelessness and lack of direction. None had been satisfied with their initial education and they tended to view adult education through the mirror of their own schooling and college experience. Participation in ALP can be related to the first proposition in that the interviewees had experienced social isolation, feelings of worthlessness and monotony. They had found in ALP purposeful activity which fulfilled a broader need for social contact and legitimacy.

There was no strong sense of powerlessness among these people of the type noted in the first study. They did underestimate their potential to contribute to learning but were not overpowered by a sense of self-denigration. Some were already participants in other activities which provided a confidence and basis to exploit some of what ALP had to offer.

There is also some difficulty in explaining ALP in relation to Freire's concept of 'praxis'. There is some evidence from the groups that a focus on the local environment (as in the case of the Terraces Group) could animate learning. This process does not seem to produce self-generated learning or a political conscientization. Indeed some participants seemed more concerned with qualifications which might provide avenues to new opportunities rather than collective action.

What was most important to participants was the sense of dialogue and co-operation within ALP. There were feelings of genuine equality and mutual respect among participants. There appeared to be little or no distinction between the 'tutors' and 'students'. A participation in all aspects of programme planning - including co-investigation - brought alive perceptions of learning which had previously been unknown. Contrastingly, there was little evidence of transcending the immediate and particular and exploiting knowledge and concepts from other fields. Perhaps this can be achieved over a longer period of time. There may be a tendency to exaggerate the possible effect of a small number of sessions over a relatively short period.

5. Case Study Three: The Craigmillar Festival Society

i. Introduction - Background and Objectives

Craigmillar is an area facing considerable problems. It is one of a series of peripheral housing estates developed by the old City of Edinburgh Council which seem beset by a range of social, political and economic difficulties. It represents a part of the town which rarely

intrudes into the popular image of Edinburgh as a bourgeois city. It looks and feels depressed; its physical appearance is of housing decline, boarded-up shops, a graffiti of violence, neglect and dereliction. There are similar places and areas in many Cities; it is more noticeable in a capital city of relative wealth and considerable architectural beauty.

During the course of this research, the area was experiencing a particularly traumatic time. The Craigmillar Festival Society was in the process of finalising a document which represented a response to what it termed 'a community in crisis'.[72] As the subsequent Report noted:

> *'This Report ... was a response to alarm felt in the community following the burning of a local school. The concern was that this was part of a wider and more sinister situation that has been building up over the past eighteen months and following the mini-riots of 1981.'* [73]

The Society argued that the *'core of the community'* was breaking up, that *'resident and professional staff'* were *'alarmed'* at an escalation of *'incidents such as theft, break-ins, fire-raising, shop-lifting, drug and solvent abuse ...'*[74] There was general collapse of confidence in the area, with the school services under particular strain.[75]

Some members of the Society were heavily involved in producing evidence for these claims as part of their representation to local government for extra resources or to avoid cut-backs. For example, statements by Senior Local Government Officers, including the City's Director of Housing were quoted:

> *'One general point that can be made about all the estates discussed in the report is that vandalism is endemic, together with theft. This leads to complaints to the District Council regarding lack of security, etc. and contributes to the increasing number of tenants wishing to transfer out of these estates.'* [76]

The level of unemployment was estimated at twice the Scottish average and reductions in public expenditure were regarded as making the situation worse.[77] A catalogue of 'cuts' in the area had been compiled, which listed reductions in Community Education, Social Work and school facilities. Likewise the Society was facing its own crisis as a result of the termination of a grant from the European Social Fund which had meant the loss of 22 posts and the abandonment of a number of projects.

The nature of the CFS' response to a 'crisis' can be used to illustrate the Society's philosophy and participatory ideology. The Society

did not advocate a massive injection of public resources into the Community per se. Instead it called for the establishment of a corporate approach - *'a working partnership at grass roots level'* between local people and central government agencies.[78] The idea of partnership illustrated one objective of the Society: to engage local people in cultural, artistic and political activity as a key to the Community's well-being. A solution to Craigmillar's problems was seen to lie in local people themselves; this was to be achieved through a realisation of their own potential and confidence to participate on a wider political stage.

An earlier CFS document[79] explained in detail the ways in which urban regeneration programmes might be more successful if they adopted more democratic, participatory modes of operation. A corporate planning approach, with local people central to the process, was seen as a better way to administer local government services. Existing local government 'centralist' notions of corporate planning were regarded as inappropriate. The CFS model emphasised the local community as the key, with the community 'an action research' project involving *'everyday street discussion'* in a planning process:

> *'An active and informed community can establish needs far better than the most sophisticated outside research. (Besides the outside research is based on the thinking of 'outsiders' and cannot capture the essential thinking of Craigmillar 'insiders', i.e. the local residents.)'* [80]

The model places action on local problems by the local community as a basis for learning. Local people can learn about themselves, their community as well as the possibility and constraints of local power; learning and action are integrated via the goal of enriching community life through the participation of individuals in determining policy. This view of 'community education' has been strongly advocated elsewhere in the literature of Scottish adult education. For example, Forbes[81] has argued that it is one of the few ways to mobilise people living in inner City 'urban ghettos' into education. Planning decisions or the actions of local authorities have such a direct effect on local communities that people can be encouraged to participate in their determination. CFS's advocacy of the idea finally crystallized around the call for a Communiversity for Craigmillar.

> *'The aim of the Communiversity is to enable local residents to become self-confident, socially responsible, full participants in the community and larger society. It is a 'learning exchange market' with a partnership between people at all levels, learning from each*

other. It is building and linking up a 'learning network' or resources wherever they may be to where the need is. It is sometimes taking education out of the traditional institutions to where the people are or changing the institution to meet the people's need and ideas of education. It is a bringing together of people with a common interest, wherever they are, pioneering new ways of touching their creativity (often latent) giving it an outlet by providing resources to stimulate and encourage them to develop their full potential.' [82]

This statement relates learning to a fuller participation in a wider community. The assumptions within the CFS are those of a 'creativity' to be 'touched' in all people, that learning should be horizontally integrated with a broader range of social experience and that education should relate to people's needs and ideas.

The origin of some of these ideas may lie in the sense of personal frustration and anger at the absence of local resources felt by a founder member and its first and only Secretary, Helen Crummie:[83]

'Twenty years ago ... one of the children wanted to learn the violin; I couldn't afford to take him up to town and there was no teachers in the area. So I went to the school knowing that in some of the Edinburgh schools there were music lessons, so I asked here but the answer I got was it would take them all their time to teach the children the three 'Rs', never mind music.'

This experience produced anger and action: the people of Craigmillar always seemed to go without in relation to other areas of Edinburgh.

'I suggested to the Headmaster that we should have a festival in the area that would be a shop window for a lot of the talent in the area; and also give a different image of the area we lived in because it had always been given bad publicity ... that was the start of the Craigmillar Festival Society ... I got a lot of support from him and other local people including quite a few professors from the university to help us deal with everything correctly.'

Helen Crummie bears a quiet intensity and passion born of personal frustration (she was forced to leave school at 14 because of family financial problems), fuelled by a war experience of 'promotion' and achievement despite her background; she became active in politics (through the local Labour Party) and felt strongly about the *'image'* of Craigmillar. She was deeply committed to the idea of education as a means of working class advance through a personal experience of the uneven distribution of educational opportunity for her and many

contemporaries.

The concept of a Communiversity is not without antecedents. Horner[84] has noted American attempts to link University resources to 'deprived' areas of American cities, notably the Detroit Geographical Expedition and Institute (DGEI). This was an experiment by the black community of Detroit and some professional university geographers to build an institution which would link the University to the needs of 'disadvantaged blacks'. The genesis of the idea lay in the use of university resources to ameliorate the problem of severe urban deprivation.

The authors of the Craimillar proposals developed such an idea a stage further. While Universities, the WEA, local Colleges etc. might be relevant resources to utilise, the key to success was to enable local people to become 'self-confident, socially responsible full participants in the local community and the larger society'. The way to achieve this was:

'- *By establishing a team of people to work closely with the CFS Leadership in supporting a Steering Group together with all CFS and other community activists.*
- *By assessing what is already there in terms of existing learning groups.*
- *By searching for unmet learning needs.*
- *By finding the resources whether people or materials for these needs.*
- *By linking such resources with learning situations where appropriate.*
- *By running workshops on new approaches to learning.*
- *By using the existing communications systems to help encourage and stimulate community participation.*'[85]

By the end of 1982 the Society had a total workforce of 115 people. Money was provided by Lothian Region and the MSC. 72 of the employees were 'trainees' working in a variety of arts projects, including workshops in joinery/craft and painting. There were also community projects with the elderly, handicapped, young people and children. The Society administered a variety of buildings, including Advice Centres. It was under the management and control of local people. CFS estimated that it was in touch with an average of 500 people each working day.[86]

The Society is managed through a number of 'Workshops'. These serve as a business forum as well as 'activity' based practical sessions. The Workshops cover Planning, Arts, Communication, Education, Children and Youth, Social Welfare and Employment. They are composed of local people, professionals who service the area and who work for public authorities, local councillors, Members of Parliament as well as professional people

from outside the area who attend by invitation and/or interest.[87] The Society is resourced by a Consultant/Researcher employed as a Lecturer at the University of Edinburgh, who uses the Society as a vehicle for community work experience for University students. Much of the language of the CFS Reports has been influenced by a radical social/community work emphasis and a rejection of hierarchical and centralist structures of decision making. These are seen to make planning processes difficult to understand for local people - procedures are said to be obscured by a professional jargon which may mystify rather than illuminate.

ii. Five Participants

The suggestions for interviewees were made by the Society's Secretary. She wanted to find a representative range of people from different parts of the Society's work. All the respondents had become involved in the CFS through informal, voluntary activity; all had progressed to more substantial degrees of participation. This involved part-time work at a Nursery/Creche entered into (at least in part) to help resolve a personal difficulty; an involvement in the CFS Literacy Scheme as well as working as a volunteer with children and young people; participation in an Arts Workshop. (This subsequently led to the development of a passionate interest in drama and auditions for the Scottish Youth Theatre.) The final participant had been involved in a variety of workshops; in turn this led to enrolment in a number of training courses for work with disabled people. The person was now employed as a Community Education Officer outside the Region. Helen Crummie also insisted that she be interviewed since she felt that she remained 'a neighbourhood worker'.

The interviews proved difficult to arrange and the circumstances in which they took place were not ideal. One was held during a nursery/creche session which did not make conversation easy; another was held in the coffee break during a 'literacy class' which tended to impose pressures of time. Another took place in a large, cold hall after a number of abortive attempts to meet elsewhere.

All the interviewees had left school at the earliest opportunity - either through choice or circumstance; one male aged 20 got little or nothing out of school:

'No, I was never there. Now I regret it. I used to skip it all the time. I never liked school. The subjects were all right, it was just the school itself I didn't like.'

He had only been a *'part-time'* student since 13 but had some regrets because of unemployment:

'Every time I went to see about a job they were wanting 'O' Levels of some sort. I've no got any qualifications ...'

One 17 year old woman came from a Travellers' family (it would be absurd to apply the description 'child' to someone from such a background) and *'never went to secondary school'*. She had gone to a variety of primary schools *'but we never stayed in one place long enough'*. She recalled with pain the experience as an 'outsider' in a school in Newcastle:

'Sometimes they were good. I mean if you were on a site where a lot of the Travelling lassies went to school then you were all together. Once when we were in Newcastle I was the only Travelling girl to go to school and you felt terrible.'

An older woman was forced to leave school *'as soon as possible'* by family pressure. She described herself as the girl at the back of the class; she missed a part of secondary school because of an accident:

'I went to my secondary and missed quite a lot of school because of that and I didn't seem to fit in. When I went into the classroom I would take a seat at the back of the class - I wished I was invisible.'

As in previous interviews such memories influence current perceptions of learning and education. Words such as *'being afraid'*, a *'lack of confidence'*, *'I feel too stupid to learn now'*, seem to be part of the shared experience and perspective of these people. After some involvement in the Society, one person did take some hesitant steps into an adult class outside Craigmillar; unfortunately the experience was traumatic:

'Somebody talked me into going to a night class for art - we went down the Grassmarket to do some sketching; I was really scared. I was going to get on the bus and go home because everybody just seemed to be in their own little groups ... I was just afraid.'

What was their experience of CFS? Two factors were important to all five people. First, it was possible to become involved in the CFS in a very informal way as an initial step:

'I used to go to the Youth Club and I just started helping them out ... the kids in the After School Club get painting and that.' 'It was a girl who does a lot of voluntary work here, and when I was 15 I met her, she was going to the last night of the show's party and I thought that sounded good. Then about 7 weeks after that the drama started up so I went along and she introduced me to everybody...'

Secondly, whatever formal or informal mechanisms existed for counselling, guidance and advice, the Society was perceived as supportive. Organisers (the Drama Leader and the Secretary were specifically

mentioned) seemed willing and able to persuade or push people into doing things. One middle-aged woman, with a prior interest in politics, became interested in the Editorial and Employment Working Parties; she developed an interest in the disabled - particularly the mentally handicapped. She became employed as a part-time worker and was encouraged to attend a course at a College in Edinburgh (Moray House). This was in addition to having seven children, four of them adopted. Two of the others became involved in literacy classes through 'encouragement'. One person faced profound personal problems and found the organisation supportive; she was given responsibility for the creche and nursery which became a source of satisfaction and personal therapy.

Clearly, the Society enabled people to participate in a range of purposeful activities. The links between such informal learning and educational opportunities within the Society were less obvious. Thus the approach to 'literacy' seemed removed from the social and personal context of individuals. *'We would read books about crochet and knitting or 'work' on suffixes and prefixes - any kind of basic English really'.* The approach sometimes varied:

> *'One time we had a lesson about make-up and we were putting make-up on and that ...'*

Nonetheless, the relationship of adult literacy classes to the Society was uncertain. For people to exploit the society's structure and opportunities - certain skills, confidence and knowledge may be needed. There was no evidence that this problem had been considered in a relevant or systematic way.

The tutor responsible for the class regarded the comments over 'relevance' to be mistaken. In later discussions[88] one person did reveal that many more personal issues were discussed. This did little to alter the general sense that the curriculum failed to integrate the experience of participants or the culture of Craigmillar as much as may have been possible. There was no evidence of the immediate environment or the concerns of the Society being used as a resource in learning; in this sense 'literacy' did not illustrate the stated educational philosophy of the Society.

iii. An Overview

This study may be the weakest of the four because of the difficulties in obtaining satisfactory interviews. Time and circumstances made this problematic; in retrospect it would have been revealing to explore the precise relationship between participation in the informal, educative 'workshops' and the degree to which this may have changed perceptions of

learning. Similarly, although more tangential in the context of this research, the interaction between professional and local people in decision making could be usefully analysed; by exploiting 'participant-observation' techniques it would be interesting to know to what extent concepts, practices and procedures were 'demystified' to enable a full participation by local people who may have lacked knowledge, confidence or skills. To date no systematic analysis has been undertaken of this aspect of the Society's affairs.

The material does provide though further evidence of the need to locate the meaning of learning and change in a dynamic social context. Participation in 'workshops' for some of these participants was facilitated by a confidence developed through informal educative activity, such as working with young people. Similarly, there is a relationship between patterns of social participation and the degree to which people feel themselves to be of use to others - for example in the playgroup. This can also lead to an alleviation of personal problems and anxiety. A confidence is developed through social intercourse, a realisation of personal capacity which contrasts with the withdrawal into self and isolation experienced by some of those in the first study.

The participants in the CFS did share some characteristics with those interviewed from the Unemployed course. The idea of 'education' is still mediated through memories of schooling and feelings of unimportance are reinforced through unemployment. In some instances this has been ameliorated by either voluntary or paid participation in the Society's affairs.

The relationship between a belief in personal capacity to influence events and participation in learning can be identified in the interviews. For example, participation in the Scottish Youth Theatre became possible through involvement in the Drama Workshop. A confidence was born of positive experience and extensive support. A supportive framework within the Society was a means through which informal learning and an understanding and confidence to branch out into other activities became possible.

Nevertheless, cultural constraints were evident. As with ALP, CFS's finances were on a temporary footing and 'employment' was always a transitory phenomenon to be enjoyed while it lasted. The pressure of the financial crisis facing the Society and the uncertainty over the future pervaded the interviews. For example, involvement with the Youth Theatre had ended. Participation in fulfilling activities can be paradoxical in that it can illuminate the constraints of limited

social opportunity. The majority of people in Craigmillar may be part of the 'excluded' or marginalised - for a person who may experience something more positive this can become a source of increased frustration when it ends.

There is no apparent link between curriculum development in formal learning within the Society, Craigmillar and political action. For example, literacy was not part of a process of 'naming the world'. It tended to be unrelated to other aspects of the Society's work. There is no evidence to suggest that literacy was perceived, either by the tutor or students, as anything other than a discrete opportunity to improve basic skills. It was not part of a political education in which, for example, the constraints of unemployment were a basis for a wider development of consciousness. The conventional nature of the curriculum is interesting when contrasted with the general values of the Society. The 'Community' was to be the laboratory for curriculum development whilst self-assertiveness was a key to individual and collective realisation. There seemed to be no considered or deliberate integration between the activities being undertaken by people in other areas of the Society (such as the workshops) and the content of 'literacy classes'. This may reflect a broader problem in the application of the Society's philosophy. For example, the proposals for a Communiversity emphasised a need for a new approach to lifelong learning but excluded any analysis of how incidental learning might be integrated with more structured learning. Social and political courses are listed as future options but seem to be discussed in highly conventional terms. For example, there is no discussion of how the experience of participants might be incorporated into course content. In this sense the Society's philosophy can seem vague.

No firm conclusions can be drawn about the degree to which local people controlled the Society or their own educative activity. Encouragement was given to people to participate in the Workshops and this did lead to an awareness of other opportunities for some participants. The interaction between professional and local people in the Society's affairs would merit more detailed research. The processes involved in agenda preparation, discussion and analysis in some of these Workshops could be a useful source of information on the problems of developing democratic processes when knowledge and confidence may be very varied among participants. In the limited example of formal learning - that is 'literacy' - curriculum development and content seemed to be under the firm control of the tutor and not a result of negotiation.

6. Case Study Four: Adult Basic Education in Pilton

i. Introduction: Background and Objectives

There is a remarkable similarity in appearance between Pilton and Craigmillar. It is a peripheral housing estate in the north of Edinburgh which is suffering from a range of problems. Street after street contains either boarded-up houses or half-occupied blocks of flats with windows protected by steel 'curtains'. The area is a typically 'deprived' estate consisting of poor housing, a sense of physical decay and neglect. The catchment area for the secondary school was defined as having *'a high incidence of poverty, unemployment, vandalism, mental illness, crime, delinquency, alcoholism, large families and single parent children, child abuse, suicide, chronic ill-health and undernourishment'.*[89] In short, a pattern of deprivation which is not uncommon in parts of urban Britain in the early 1980s.

Pilton is a solidly working class area with a very large proportion of unskilled manual workers and their families. Owner-occupation is minimal (0.06%) while 88.34% of adults left school without any formal qualifications.[90] Unemployment is well above the regional average.[91]

One educational response to these social problems emerged in the form of the Craigroyston Curriculum Development Project. Financed by the Van Leer Foundation,[92] it sought to create a community school in the hope of removing *'alienation'* and *'adapting the school to the needs of the community'.*[93] Whilst the main focus of the work was to be with children and young people, it was intended to relate the resources of the school to adults and to bridge the gap between 'education' and 'local people'.

Although it is not the intention to provide a comprehensive analysis of the CCDP, there are assumptions behind the Project which should be noted. For example, it is assumed that the 'problems' lie within local people and their community - a statement of the individual/social pathological model of deprivation - rather than in local people's relationship to the broader distribution of power and resources within society. Thus many students within the school suffer from *'inadequate and unsupportive parents, inadequate socialisation and a lack of community consciousness'.*[94] People are personally or socially inadequate and the school's aim is to provide compensation. The problem lies within the local community and its inhabitants unrelated to the larger world outside.

The adult basic education dimension within the CCDP developed from members of a Learning Difficulty Working Party,[95] which consisted in the main of teachers, other interested professionals and some local residents.

They were anxious to secure a special unit for young people with 'learning difficulties' as well as a 'centre for community literacy and numeracy work' outside the school in vacant property in the centre of Pilton. Their ideas were not developed much beyond this. The interests of the Working Party co-incided with those of the Region's Adult Basic Education Unit, an arm of the Community Education Service which, as part of the process of refining a theory and practice of adult basic education was anxious to engage in some outreach work. Van Leer had resources to pay for such a project.

The relationship between the ABE Unit, the CCDP and local people has been subject to research by the Scottish Council for Research in Education who were interested in examining the processes involved in Community Education and a Community School attempting to collaborate.[96] It has been suggested that perceptions of what might be entailed in a.b.e. work varied enormously between the collaborating agencies. For example, important individuals within local groups were critical of the A.B.E. Unit's proposals for what was perceived to be a community development worker in an area already saturated with professionals.[97] These varying perceptions probably included the idea of adult basic education itself. For the CCDP little attention was paid to what this might mean. Their preoccupation was to establish a specialist unit. Some of those involved in a.b.e. in the Unit were concerned to promote a different practice from a simple concentration on the skills of reading, writing and numeracy unrelated to other social and personal issues. This may reflect a particular emphasis within adult basic education in Scotland. The differences are said to include its pedagogy being developed from issues of personal and social concern to participants. Literacy is considered to be a means to self-discovery, assertion and cultural awareness. It has been claimed that a.b.e. consists of far more than a simple amalgam of literacy, numeracy and 'coping' skills.[98] Some educators have argued that a.b.e. in Scotland may be less open to Keddie's criticism of 'needs' being 'imposed' by educators.[99] The literature of 'a.b.e.' in Scotland stresses *'as much a style of approach, based on certain attitudes as a field of learning':*

> *'Above all, it has to be responsive providing the learners with information or skills that are immediately useful and relevant. It is more concerned with confidence-building activities, encouraging personal and social development through the tackling of problems that people's experience of life has brought to their attention...*[100]

The policy document of the Regional Adult Basic Education Unit

implies a radical ideology and participatory style of learning. Three core concepts are presented:

'(a) Equality - a sense of genuine respect for another's integrity and the validity of their experiences. An avoidance of the teacher-taught syndrome; the educator is a facilitator helping to create the conditions in which adult people are able to accomplish things for themselves.

(b) Non-directive - a willingness to listen to the adult student, to modify approaches not merely at the beginning of learning but based on a continuing dialogue.

(c) Relevance - a curriculum orientated towards issues of adult concern ... a respect for many adult's ability to engage in sophisticated dialogue orally, whilst lacking confidence and achievement in other forms of self-expression.' [101]

Such an ideology goes beyond the idea of functional or coping skills; it seems to suggest that these skills are an element within a process of becoming more autonomous. Participants are central to curriculum development through a careful incorporation of their concerns into a learning agenda. By contrast the meaning of 'literacy' in the CCDP was never explained or it was assumed that the basis of 'literacy' was self-evident. A problem in analysing the practical implications of such varied perspectives is that a.b.e. practice in Scotland has not been subject to any extensive empirical research. The SCRE study was concerned with institutional relationships rather than an analysis of concepts in relation to the teaching-learning process.

The Project began in 1981. It involved an element of compromise in that the first priority of a new post in Adult Basic Educaiton would be the establishment of the Schoolhouse as an ABE Centre. The 'community development' intentions were still incorporated in the job description and Management Plan and these were to be implemented once the first objective had been achieved. By November 1982 an elaborate referral network for the Schoolhouse had been established, including social workers, the School and Community Education. The 'Third Floor Flat', as the base had come to be called, was in use on a fairly constant basis throughout the week.

ii. Five Participants

The five participants who were interviewed in the Schoolhouse were in the same group. They were taught by the ABE Worker with the assistance of a Volunteer Tutor. Lengthy discussions were held with the Group

to explain the purpose of the interviews, but the interviewees still approached them with great nervousness. All the interviews took place in a room in the Schoolhouse and two of the interviewees would only agree to be interviewed together. One person was especially nervous - he had attended a Special School and found the experience of being interviewed tense and perplexing. His oral skills were limited. In the content of the group he often retreated into isolated activity away from the main table situated in the middle of the room. The interviewees were four women and one man. The man was in his late twenties, while 3 of the women were of a similar age; the other was in her early forties. This made no noticeable difference to the way the group interacted since two of the women, including the older woman, were close friends and had chosen to attend the sessions together. The atmosphere in the flat was relaxed and friendly and the two tutors appeared to relate well to the students.

Their experiences of schooling were negative. Feelings of inferiority stemming from school were still important:

'There were people higher than me. Higher marks and that. Not them all, just some people used to take their certificates and all that. Well we never got offered that or anything. We never got the chance to do it.'

There was a history of illness and absence from school. One woman had been hospitalised for two years as well as moving from England to Scotland - *'it was all different from the English way of working, so that put me further back ...'* Another woman has been *'off for about three years ... I had an accident, I fell 50 feet.'* In a masterpiece of understatement she thought that such an incident had possibly *'put me back a bit'*.

These memories of schooling influenced perceptions of adult education:

'I'd spoke, I'd sort of made a joke of it "anybody fancy going back to school?" and it was "No we dinnae". I think it was a case of people might think we're ignorant, or stupid ... that was just for when you were young.'

Participants expected teachers to stand in front of a blackboard *'telling you how to work'*. They had been very apprehensive about 'literacy'. Most had made the decision to attend through the support of 'significant others' especially close personal friends or acquaintances. Not every member of the immediate family had been supportive. One woman recalled her husband dismissing 'school': *'If you didn't learn when you were 13/14/15 you're not going to learn it when you are 32.'*

The reasons for participation were explained in highly instrumental terms; these included form filling (one person had recently experienced a bereavement and found the process of dealing with the bureaucracy of the DHSS forbidding) and helping with a 'catalogue' as a way to supplement the family income. No-one had considered anything other than a solution to immediate problems and no-one perceived any other form of 'continuing education' relevant or appropriate. One woman did see an improvement in 'reading and writing' as a way to help her participate more effectively in the Pilton Central Association - a local umbrella group of community organisations:

'I used to write speeches and talk to various people about my personal feelings on Pilton and what was happening and how I felt ... I wrote one for myself but I didn't stick to it; I have just rattled on and said some things I didn't mean to say but I couldn't check them ...'

There were fleeting moments of personal assertion and excitement in the interviews. These seemed to dissipate quickly as self-deprecation and disbelief reasserted themselves. If the tutor praised anything, it was viewed sceptically:

'She said it was good but ... but the spelling I think was terrible'.

A conversation became animated as one woman described a story she had written:

'... I wrote a story, it was about a play that I seen about 4/5 years ago and it always stuck in my mind because in a way it was so funny and yet so sad, and I couldn't sleep that night, this story was in my mind and I wrote a couple of pages ... I put it into my own words, I had this vision of it because I had seen the play ...'

For a moment the person was absorbed in her story. Something had been done which was valued. This moment quickly passed. There was a return to self-doubt and references to *'appalling spelling'*.

The a.b.e. class had led to more confidence but there were no marked changes in patterns of life. *'Coffee mornings and that'* were less frightening and gradual increases in social activity were discernible. As with the participants in the Unemployed Persons Project it is easy to exaggerate the impact of a relatively small number of hours in the context of broader experience. Participation in anything other than the immediate family, the informal grouping at the school gate or the casual conversation on the street is the exception to prove the rule.

The curriculum in the Schoolhouse did not emerge from any 'dialogical' relationships. It consisted primarily of reading and writing in a highly

instrumental, mechanistic way. Students were encouraged to write but this seemed largely unrelated to group discussion or personal concerns. One woman felt *'more intelligent'* after having written a piece on abortion but this was exceptional. There was no obvious discussion surrounding schooling or the nature of the Craigroyston Curriculum Development Project - or no exploitation of the concrete and particular in people's everyday experience to provide a link to abstract ideas.

iii. An overview

There is a theme of 'tension' on this Study between the philosophy of the a.b.e. unit and that of the CCDP. The Unit was anxious to inculcate the idea of participatory learning in which the learning agenda incorporated the problems of living in a community such as Pilton. For other people 'literacy' may have been perceived somewhat differently.

These participants belonged to similar groups and cultures to people in the C.F.S. and the Unemployed Workers' Course. Schooling had been limited both in extent and quality. It still provoked feelings of inadequacy and worthlessness. Material comfort and employment were transitory phenomena. Family partners could be unsupportive towards a return to 'schooling'. To participate in learning was a kind of affront to one's status as an adult. Involvement in the scheme had led to some increase in informal social activity but there was only one case in which learning to read and write better had encouraged a more positive and confident role in local political activity. In this case, the participant was integrating her own learning with other ambitions without any assistance from the Schoolhouse.

The interviewees perceived themselves to be powerless to change personal or social circumstances. Expectations were low and learning goals were limited and narrowly instrumental. The poverty of Pilton, or the relationship of people to the broader CCDP, were never considered to be a basis for reflection. The political impotence of communities such as Pilton is mediated through people whose aspirations may be relative to the community and its institutions. Changes in perception were limited to some increased confidence to participate in informal social activity. While the importance of this should not be minimised, the curriculum did not though encourage a wider critical awareness of intra-family, community and more general intra-society relationships.

The students brought with them perceptions of learning largely determined by schooling. While the atmosphere was friendly and there were opportunities to discuss issues, 'real' learning lay in a practice of

reading and writing largely divorced from other experiences. A realisation of 'dialogue' is a problem for both tutors and students, all of whom can bring into learning assumptions surrounding participation which imply relative passivity and skills divorced from context.

The Project was at an early stage when the interviews were undertaken and the a.b.e. worker was fairly new. The extent to which participants were engaged in shaping the curriculum was limited. In a sense student and tutor expectations were narrow and the limited perceptions of each may have proved mutually reinforcing.

7. The Propositions and the Case Studies: Some Conclusions

The literature review had indicated that there were significant relationships between adult learning and culture. Survey research showed that adult education reinforced rather than altered the pattern of educational inequality.[103] Some of the detail of the interaction between culture and learning was less clearly perceived. It had been suggested that schooling, occupational frustration or exclusion from the formal economy might constitute a pattern of experience which influenced the way people perceived themselves and learning.[104] Learning and education, or 'higher values' might be rejected by those at the bottom end of the social structure. It is now clearer that there is a relationship between various forms of institutional experience, opportunity and individual consciousness. It is less clear that people can be said to reject 'higher values'. A process of rejection within institutions seems rather to have stifled any impetus to learn or any belief in personal capacity to contribute to others in any worthwhile sense.

There is also considerable evidence in this material of a relationship between powerlessness, withdrawal from activity and attitudes towards learning. Learning cannot be understood outside this psychosocial domain. The questions of relevance in working class adult education can be seen to be complicated by the meanings people attach to learning. There are a range of motives within learning which cannot simply be incorporated within one ideological framework. The findings may be similar to American research in this regard.[105] There are similarly problems in encouraging people to participate more fully in a definition of their own learning or in invigorating sustained programmes of learning in which culture becomes a means to intellectual development and/or political action.

i. Participation in Learning and Cultural Content

The interviews with participants in the four projects indicate the problems of developing adult education in urban contexts amongs those most alienated by schooling. There are many voices of the socially excluded in the Unemployed Workers' Course; a central element within this process of exclusion has been schooling.

Most interviewees recalled schooling in deeply negative terms; people felt that what was being done was irrelevant to them. They were cogs in a large 'system' which seemed to relegate them and their circumstances to the inconsequential. Some retreated in 'silence' or were lost in a large class. School was often perceived as a coercive system in which learning appeared unrelated to more immediate pressures of family or material proverty. It was a place for others - those who could 'learn' and exploit the rules more successfully. It was not the basis for any lifelong learning dynamic.

Illness, or family problems often compounded the negative influence of schooling. Frequent absence added to a sense of irrelevance and missed opportunity. Whilst there was criticism of schools, the major 'cause' of failure was seen to lie in personal deficiency. Interviewees largely blamed themselves for 'failure'. They had internalised the rules of social labelling in which they were considered to be inadequate.

The influence of schooling is only one element in determining a broader cultural identity. For many of the interviewees cumulative experience of 'failure', such as unemployment, has led to a retreat from social activity. A sense of fatalism can be said to have engulfed some people which may involve a withdrawal from almost all social contact other than within the immediate family.

A withdrawal into inactivity can induce escapism or fantasy. The world becomes dominated by television or thoughts of emigration. Some women have ceased to have any personal ambition - they have become beings for others rather than for themselves. One woman had lost faith in changing personal circumstances at the age of 25. She now lived for her children. She was resigned to being a servant to them rather than having a future for herself. 'Life' had already encapsulated the sum total of possibilities - all that remained was to strive for a better future for the children.

For some of the participants in CFS and the literacy programmes, involvement in learning or purposeful activity had led to other forms of social participation. The CFS allowed a gradual participation to take

place which could lead to wider achievement and confidence. Some of the a.b.e. students considered increased confidence to participate in informal activity to be the most important element within learning. This confirms the findings of Jones' and Charnley's research.[106] Whilst the importance of such affective learning should not be minimised, the degree to which such learning incorporated any major change in personal circumstances can be exaggerated. The dialogue with students revealed the continuing sense of material, relational and social constraints determining perspectives and limiting choice. Perhaps this is the major theme in the material. It may be possible for educators to exaggerate the significance of a limited programme of learning given the broader context of existence. Some participants were resigned to adult education as a compensation for unemployment and other losses of status rather than a means through which they might discover themselves and assert a more important role in society. Perspectives can of course change - one weakness in this type of research is the effect of participation in learning needs to be studied over time. A longitudinal study could usefully examine the impact of learning over many years. For those taking part in adult education for the first time 'what chance for ten weeks in 53 years?' was a poignant comment.

The case studies provide evidence to support the need to analyse participation in learning as part of a person's cultural context. It was noted in the literature[107] that the act of participation is often treated as a discrete educational activity in some way unrelated to a person's general experience and opportunities. There is a tendency to discuss participation in learning as primarily a technical concern in which sociological questions concerning the social origins of opportunity are often disregarded.[108] For example, analyses of participation can be dominated by questions of location[109] or the improved presentation of a service[110] rather than set in a context of 'concrete' social circumstances which may constrain what is possible or limit what seems meaningful. There is only minimal analysis of the broader cultural setting of adult learning. It is suggested that one way to improve a theoretical understanding of adult participation in learning may be to exploit socio-psychological theories and philosophical perspectives which have been concerned with such issues. This provides the basis of the next Chapter.

ii. Power, Influence and Social Context

As in the literature, there is a considerable overlap between the idea of learning being mediated through general social experience and a sense of power and influence to alter personal and social circumstances.

Most people in these studies have concluded that they are largely powerless to influence external events and that theirs is a role of passive acquiescence. The traditional instruments of working class change - such as Trade Unions or the Labour Party - are seen as distant and irrelevant. Where discussion about unemployment does take place there seems to be an acceptance that little can be done to improve the situation. People are suffering but Governments are largely impotent to act. A political economy of large numbers being unemployed is a reality to be endured.

A sense of powerlessness intrudes into, and is influenced by, a dependence on state or local government agencies for financial support. Contact with DHSS or local authorities involves compliant role relationships in which the individual struggles to obtain the maximum permissible. The language is not that of a group denied access to material wealth, rather of a passive acceptance of poverty which is at least ameliorated by the 'dole' or supplementary benefit. Positive help by those in 'authority' is good fortune rather than something to which a person may be entitled.

The transcript material provides evidence of a pattern of subordination and powerlessness in social relationships which intrudes into adult learning. A social context of limited choice, a struggle to survive, or an isolation from participation in the economy limits or determines perceptions of what may be possible. Education as a possible resource is primarily perceived through memories which are themselves redolent with failure or personal 'deficiency'. It is not therefore surprising that a basis for a dialogue in learning is slow and difficult to achieve since learning is primarily something 'done to people' by those who know.

iii. Social Relevance and Working Class People

The CFS and ALP were concerned with the development of socially relevant learning and action. The Adult Learning Project was most explicitly committed to the identification of 'contradictions' within participants' lives which could form the basis of a curriculum and political action. This was not how participants primarily perceived or valued the process. Their commitment to ALP resulted from a close involvement in programme design, development and evaluation and the sense of equality which pervaded the work. In some sense, 'dialogical relationships' within ALP had redefined learning. Some participants had changed their views about learning and the degree to which education need be a passive experience for a student. What tended to be absent from the interviews

was evidence that the particular and concrete - for example, a lack of playspace for children or parental exclusion from influencing processes within schools -had led to a sustained interest in, and understanding of, sophisticated ideas and knowledge. Careful, systematic study, born of an acknowledgement of the relevance of learning to the realisation of change was not evident. Participants were primarily engaged in a series of ad hoc initiatives - skill exchanges, writers' workshops, etc. - which though of value, had not succeeded in uniting political action with substantial learning or conscientization.

Similarly, the CFS sought to use the local community as a basis for learning. There is some evidence to indicate that the various workshops were important in encouraging people to engage in a range of activity. There was little sense of a devolved 'corporate management' of the community by the community being realised. In part this was a result of confusion about how to develop learning. The relationship between learning and informal 'educative' activity was uncertain and largely unexplored. In the literacy class, the context of a 'community in crisis' seemed divorced from the content of classroom activity. Tutors and students may have carried with them assumptions about learning into the 'classroom' which tended to limit its social relevance. The participants in the a.b.e. project in Pilton tended to perceive learning in conventional terms. There was no reflection on learning itself or a consideration of personal and social relationships within Pilton. Learning was divorced from 'naming the world'.

There were also examples in the material of goals in learning which were highly instrumental rather than born of any broad socio-political relevance. Instrumentality might include helping to administer a 'club' more successfully or read to a child.

In all the Projects, part of the difficulty in linking learning to socially relevant themes may have been a difficulty faced by tutors in moving from traditional subject bases to the use of autobiographical material. This seemed to be the case in some aspects of the Unemployed Workers' Course. Another difficulty may be that students perceive learning as largely socially irrelevant - concerned with initiation into subjects rather than an integrated process of personal and collective realisation and assertion. The difficulty of utilising experience as a basis for sustained learning should not therefore be surprising.

iv. Participant Control of Learning and Institutions

Participant control within learning is not easily achieved. ALP and

the Unemployed Workers' Course did indicate ways in which participation might be extended which may be absent from most formal adult education. Mee and Wiltshire's study illustrates a 'service' approach to the development of adult education.[111] Adult education is a series of courses to be delivered to people. It is not a deliberate attempt to share control, decisions and to exploit student consciousness.

In the case of ALP, the Freirean inspired process of 'co-investigation' and 'decodification', for example in the context of 'the Terraces', - was a stimulus to learning. Participants enjoyed a new approach to learning in which problems were collectively identified. An involvement at all stages of the planning and execution of a curriculum helped to produce a sense of equality among all participants.

In the Unemployed Workers' Course, it was less certain that the material from the transcripts had been used to engage people quite so direcly in programme definition. Some tutors were able to enliven learning through exploiting some knowledge of the transcripts but this is somewhat different. In this sense, an opportunity may have been lost in the course.

The transcripts provide frequent examples of a 'banking concept' of education. Students perceived themselves to be the depositories of a teacher's knowledge. Some tutors may have been unconscious partners in this process. Students expected the teacher to be 'at the front', 'chalking on the board' providing knowledge to fill empty vessels. Some tutors seemed to define learning in narrow mechanistic terms in which the skills of communication were divorced from a personal attempt to interpret self and the world.

The idea of each person as a full participant - in which each has experience to bear as evidence - and in which knowledge is both enriched and enlivened as a result may not be easily achieved. Past practice and the negative influence of schooling may sometimes present barriers for a distinct and different adult education.

REFERENCES

1. *For example, see C. Elphick: 'Non-formal Education, An Introduction to the Debate'. A.R.E., June 1981, pp. 8-9.*
2. *At the time of the Project, I was presenting a series of programmes on Radio Forth exploring issues in adult education.*
3. *Letter from ALP Project Leader to Linden West, 8.11.82.*
4. *For an essay which provides examples of similar problems faced by experimental, 'radical' approaches, see J.L. Thompson: 'Work in Progress - A Report from Southampton' in 'Learning Liberation!'. Op.Cit. pp.148-195.*
5. *A.H. Charnley and H.A. Jones: 'The Concept of Success in Adult Literacy', Op.Cit. pp.44-45.*
6. *For example, see P.L. Berger: 'Pyramids of Sacrifice, Political Ethics and Social Change'. Op.Cit. for a substantial exploration of this problem; particularly pp.135-158.*
7. *For example, see A. Schutz: 'The Phenomenology of the Social World', Heinemann, 1972.*
8. *For example, the research of Charnley and Jones with literacy students.*
9. *See, for example, L. Bown: 'Participation in Learning - for Power or Powerlessness', Op.Cit.*
10. *Scottish Education Department: 'Adult Education, the Challenge of Change', Op.Cit. p.3.*
11. *Ibid. p.4. para 11.*
12. *Ibid. p.5.*
13. *Ibid. pp.1-2.*
14. *See for example an article by N. McLean and I Martin: 'Community Education, What are we playing at?', 'Community Education', SCEC, Edinburgh, Spring 1979, pp.9-13.*
15. *D. Alexander and T. Steward: 'An Educational Perspective on Community Education in Scotland', 'Scottish Journal of Adult Education', Vol.5. No.3. Autumn 1981, p.13.*
16. *Also the recent major enquiry into tertiary education in Scotland only made passing reference to adult education in its appendix. Council for Tertiary Education: 'Review of Structure and Management : Report of the Committee on Structure and Management', Edinburgh, Oct. 1981.*
17. *C. Kirkwood: 'Some Unemployed Adults and Education': 'A Report on 31 interviews with unemployed men and women carried out in Edinburgh in the first quarter of 1981', WEA, S.E. Scotland District, 1981. p.i.*
18. *Note the comments of A. Charnley, M. Osborn and A. Withnall: 'Adult Education and Unemployment: a Review of Existing Research in Adult and Continuing Education', Vol.IX, N.I.A.E., 1982.*
19. *C. Kirkwood: 'The Concept of Community', 'Adult Education', Vol.51, No.3, 1979, pp.145-151.*
20. *Ibid. p.148.*
21. *Ibid. p.147.*
22. *'Community Education' is used in the sense defined by Alexander.*
23. *Kirkwood's criticism of the theory and practice of 'Community Education' in Scotland is supported by a number of other educators. As one example see: D. Alexander and T. Steward: 'An*

23. *Cont.*

Educational Perspective on Community Education in Scotland', 'Scottish Journal of Adult Education', Vol.5, No.3, Autumn 1981, pp.1-13.

24. *C. Kirkwood: 'Some Unemployed Adults ...'. Op.Cit. p.i.*

25. *Ibid. pp.i-ii.*

26. *Ibid. pp.33-34.*

27. *Ibid. p.34.*

28. *Ibid. p.34.*

29. *Ibid. p.34.*

30. *C. Kirkwood: 'The Concept of Community'. Op.Cit. p.147.*

31. *The Transcripts have been used for training full and part-time tutors within the WEA who have been interested in educational activities with unemployed people. I am grateful to Colin Kirkwood for allowing access to this material and agreeing to its use in this way.*

32. *In this particular interview, the comments were summarised by the interviewer rather than transcribed verbatim.*

33. *C. Kirkwood: 'Some Unemployed Adults, etc.', pp.2-3.*

34. *For example, R. Harrison: 'The Demoralising Experience of Prolonged Unemployment', Department of Employment Gazette, April 1976.*

35. *See A. Charnley et al: 'Adult Education and Unemployment', Op.Cit. p.12.*

36. *W.W. Daniel: 'A National Survey of the Unemployed', PEP, October 1974.*

37. *C. Kirkwood: 'Some Unemployed Adults ...', Op.Cit. p.36.*

38. *I am thinking of Lovett's advocacy of a 'networking' approach to recruitment; he considers this to be an appropriate method of operation in inner city contexts; see T. Lovett: 'Adults, Community Development and the Working Class', Op.Cit. pp.122-143.*

39. *Ibid. pp.122-143. Thompson makes similar points in 'Learning Liberation', Op.Cit. pp.148-195.*

40. *For a survey of these ideas see I. Bryant: 'The Educational Needs of Long-term Unemployed Adults', 'A Report for the SED', Department of Adult and Continuing Education, Glasgow, October 1982.*

41. *See Chapter Two, pp.31-32.*

42. *Ibid. pp.*

43. *Gorgie/Dalry Adult Learning Project: 'First 3 Months Report', 17 September to 19 December 1979, p.1.*

44. *Ibid. p.1.*

45. *Ibid. pp.1-2.*

46. *See Chapter Two, pp.44-47.*

47. *See Chapter Four, p. 133.*

48. *See P. Freire: 'Education: The Practice of Freedom', Op.Cit. pp.3-20; also 'Cultural Action for Freedom', Op.Cit. pp.51-83.*

49. *P. Freire: 'Pedagogy of the Oppressed', Op.Cit. pp.60-95.*

50. *The ALP Team were formally attached to one of the Edinburgh Community Education Area Teams. This team was responsible to a Regional Directorate although there was a Central Unit with a responsibility to provide advice, research and support throughout the Region.*

50. Cont.
Tensions were fairly strong between some officers of the Central Unit and the Area Team and Project Workers.

51. Letter from Community Education Central Unit to Senior Community Education Fieldworker, 3 April 1980.

52. Letter to Central Unit, from Senior C.E. Fieldworker, 16 April 1980.

53. Central Community Education Unit: 'Comments on the ALP Project', 1980, p.1.

54. C. Kirkwood: 'Report of the External Assessor on the ALP in Gorgie/Dalry covering the period October 1979 to April 1980', WEA, p.6.

55. Ibid. p.6.

56. Central Community Education Unit: Op.Cit. pp.1-5.

57. These observations were based on the work of B.O. Boston: 'Paulo Freire, Notes of a Loving Critic', in J.M. Grabowski (Ed.): 'Paulo Freire: A Revolutionary Dilemma for the Adult Educator', Occasional Paper No.32, ERIC Clearing House on Adult Education, Syracuse, New York, 13210', 1972.

58. Central Community Education Unit, Op.Cit. p.6.

59. C. Kirkwood: 'Report of the External Assessor', Op.Cit. p.2.

60. Ibid. p.2.

61. Ibid. p.2.

62. C. Kirkwood: 'The Second Report of the External Assessor on the ALP in Gorgie/Dalry, April 1980, to September 1980', WEA, p.3.

63. Ibid. p.3.

64. Ibid. p.5.

65. This is confirmed by another external assessor. See R. Beesley: 'Report of the External Assessor on the Adult Learning Project in Gorgie/Dalry, July 1981'. Wester Hailes Education Centre, p.3.

66. Adult Learning Project: 'First Booklet', 1980.

67. Ibid. p.3.

68. R. Beesley: Op.Cit. p.3.

69. Ibid. p.3.

70. P. Foster: 'ALP, January 1982, Report of the External Assessor on the Adult Learning Project in Gorgie/Dalry', SABEU, 1982, p.5.

71. Ibid. pp.10-11.

72. Craigmillar Festival Society: 'Craigmillar, A Community in Crisis', CFS, November 1982.

73. Ibid. p.1.

74. Ibid. p.1.

75. Ibid. p.1.

76. City of Edinburgh District Council: 'Report of Director of Housing on Peripheral Housing Estates', Edinburgh, October 1982.

77. C.F.S., Op.Cit. p.3.

78. Ibid. p.11.

79. C.F.S.: 'Communiversity: A Concept in Community Learning', C.F.S., April 1980.

80. Ibid.

81. J. Forbes: 'Community Education and Lifelong Education', Scottish Journal of Adult Education, S.I.A.E., Vol.5, No.3, pp.23-32, Autumn 1981.

82. C.F.S. 'Communiversity: A Concept in Community Learning', Op.Cit.

83. One of the interviewees was Helen Crummie. This material is from an interview at her home in Craigmillar, December 1982.

84. D.J. Horner: 'Towards a Concept of the Community University', Community Education, SCEC, Summer 1978, pp.13-18.

85. C.F.S.: 'Communiversity'; Op.Cit.

86. C.F.S.: 'Craigmillar, a Community in Crisis', Op.Cit. p.5.

87. C.F.S.: 'Communiversity ...', Op.Cit.

88. Notes from a discussion, Craigmillar, April 1984.

89. H. Mackenzie: 'The Craigroyston Curriculum Project: Secondary Education in the Inner City', Centre for Urban and Regional Research, University of Glasgow, Discussion Paper No.4, December 1981, p.10.

90. Ibid. p.11.

91. Ibid. pp.10-11.

92. The Bernard Van Leer Foundation was the major source of financial support for the Project. See H. Mackenzie: Op.Cit. p.17.

93. Ibid. p.18.

94. Ibid. p.9 and pp.18-19.

95. Ibid. p.22.

96. A. Peacock: 'Evaluation of the Craigroyston Curriculum Development Project, The Appointing of an Adult Basic Education Worker', Discussion Paper IV, Scottish Council for Research in Education, Edinburgh, June 1982.

97. Ibid.

98. Ibid.

99. See P. Foster: 'Adult Basic Education', SABEU? August 1980.

100. Neil Keddie: 'Adult Education: An Ideology of Individualism' in J. Thompson: 'Adult Education for a Change', Op.Cit. pp.58-61.

101. P. Foster: Op.Cit. p.2.

102. Lothian Region A.B.E. Unit: 'Adult Basic Education - Philosophy, Policies and Priorities, Edinburgh, March 1982, p.11.

103. A. Peacock: Op.Cit.

104. See Chapter Two. pp.31-32

105. Ibid. p.37.

106. Ibid. p.34.

107. Ibid. pp. 39-40.

108. Ibid. pp. 39-40.

109. Ibid. p. 40. I have in mind the problems raised by Percy (K. Percy et al: 'Post-Initial Education...' Op.Cit.) of disentangling the organisational barriers to participation in adult education from more general attitudes in society towards education.

110. Ibid. pp.47-49.

111. See Chapter Two p.36.

CHAPTER FOUR - TOWARDS A THEORY OF PARTICIPATION IN LEARNING

1. Introduction: A basis for theory - context, content and process in learning.

2. The first proposition: participation in context.

3. The second proposition: participation in learning, power and social determinants.

4. The third proposition: the content and nature of learning.

5. The fourth proposition: processes within learning - control and organisation.

6. A theory of participation in learning.

---

1. Introduction: a basis for theory - context, content and process in learning

A theory may be regarded as an attempt to interpret patterns of behaviour observed in empirical research, as a refinement of a problem or philosophical idea and thus a means to increase understanding. It is a way of making sense of disparate experience, of relating patterns and common tendencies within situations and seeking to explain them. It is a provisional statement within a context of existing or new knowledge surrounding a problem which may highlight particular directions for further research or analysis.

The analysis of adults participating in learning has identified a number of issues surrounding the context, content and processes of learning. These include the relationship between learning, cultural context and constraints on people within certain social groups; the possibility of learning being more meaningful to people in the 'inner-city' if culture - work, family, unemployment, social opportunities - is used as a basis for curriculum development; whether learning can best be secured through processes which devolve control among participants and involve sharing responsibility for what is done. The issues transcend the 'territory' of any one academic discipline - they raise questions which could be examined sociologically, psychologically, philosophically as well as pedagogically.

A theory of participation in learning may require an integration of ideas from a range of academic disciplines. Various approaches to the relationships between learning and culture, well-being and personal opportunity, curriculum content and the organisation of learning should be incorporated within its framework. A theory will need though to include more than this; a redefinition of learning may be required above and beyond the provisional suggestions made in Chapter One.[1] This will raise questions surrounding interpersonal behaviour which cannot be excluded from discussions of learning or education. There is no clear consensus about what should be nurtured in the name of adult education - it is a focus for disputes surrounding personal and social behaviour, individual needs and social requirements, as well as the relationships between dominant social interests and the nature of what is taught. The researcher/educator cannot insulate him/herself from such conflicts; he/she can only identify what seems to be of value in personal and social development according to explicit criteria and the consequences which stem from this. A theory of adults participating in learning cannot exclude ethical problems of how people do, and should, relate to each other if learning

is to be facilitated within the classroom and beyond.

Such a wide and complex set of perspectives renders any theory both provisional and partial. This Chapter consists of some socio-psychological, sociological, philsophical and pedogagic ideas which are used to illuminate and develop the four propositions. There is a need for further interdisciplinary and multi-disciplinary research into the personal and social dimensions of learning. There is a requirement for further discussion of the values which may underlie practice; methods need to be developed and refined to evaluate progress in intellectual or social terms using quantitative and qualitative techniques. These problems are considered further in the penultimate section of the last Chapter.[2]

2. The first proposition: participation in context

In the first proposition it was suggested that participation in learning can only be understood within a broader pattern of cultural experience. It was noted in the literature review that a substantial amount of contemporary research focuses on the specific aspect of participation in learning or formal education without reference to cultural context.[3] Further, there has been only minimal incorporation into such research of the idea that 'reality' can in part be regarded as a product of individual construction; it might in part be explained according to the meanings people attach to it. In this sense, institutions, social phenomena or behaviour cannot simply be analysed according to their external characteristics. They should also be examined in relation to what has been called the 'social construction of reality'[4] the way individuals think and feel about them.

Similarly, it was noted that the literature concerned with locating learning within a wider culture requires more rigorous empirical validation.[5] A theory of participation in learning can flow too uncritically from specific socio-political theory or ideology.

It is suggested that the analysis within the two previous Chapters has revealed two important themes in relation to the first proposition. First, that the context of participation should in part be understood in highly personal, psychological terms. An individual may interpret the experience of learning in such contexts primarily according to affective learning criteria or emotional significance; relative confidence, self-respect, social contact, purposefulness and social validation may be of prime importance. The development of cognitive skills or conceptual awareness could be subsidiary to this psycho-emotional need. This will be incorporated into a socio-psychological theory of learning.

Secondly, such a theory should be located within a sociological analysis of the effects of exclusion from socially valued activity such as paid employment or intrinsically rewarding activity. This will be combined with a discussion of the concepts of power, control and social determination in the second proposition to suggest the possible relevance of the idea of alienation to the personal and social circumstances of some of those in the inner city or the council estate.

At a personal level the transcript material illustrated the relationship between poor self-image, withdrawal into social isolation and a loss of confidence. Some interviewees (with particular reference to the 31 transcripts) had completely withdrawn from any social activity other than to meet the most basic of needs. They were locked into depression and purposelessness. In part, this was 'ameliorated' by escapism through the use of alcohol, anti-depressants or an indulgence in fantasy. People thought of themselves as valueless and belittled themselves. If self-denigration can be conceived as primarily social in origin, it is also important to note that many interviewees were active participants in the process. Psychological ill-being is in part self-induced. Those who had taken a step into learning were often sceptical of what short courses or adult education could achieve.[6] Continuing unemployment had reinforced a sense of personal and social worthlessness which permeated all aspects of the self-concept and was not easy to dispel. Small steps into learning were considered inconsequential when set against the dominant status of unemployment. Where participation was considered to be important, people spoke in terms of confidence,[7] a discovery of self-worth or value elicited from the way in which they considered organisers and significant others treated them.[8] Within ALP, the most important experience was a discovery of personal worth and opportunity born of the organisers' treatment of participants.[9] Relationships were supportive and contributions respected.[10] Participants felt free to comment, and to make suggestions without fear of reproach or being made to look foolish. The ALP workers strove hard to give practical expression to the ideal of dialogical relationships. A contribution in group discussion was never too short or insignificant to be dismissed. One element within the criticism made of ALP by an external assessor was that a concern for the quality of inter-personal relationships may have become over-indulgent when set against a need for evangelism in the wider community.[11] Although the five interviewees from ALP were better educated than many of those in the other Case Studies and had other social outlets, the significance of ALP to them was articulated in highly personal, affective-emotional terms.

It could be an alternative to drink or isolation resulting from unemployment or lack of social contact.

The importance of confidence, the need for social support and a disbelief in personal value were manifest in the Unemployed Workers' Course.[12] Participants found it difficult to accept that their writing might be worthwhile and of interest to a wider audience.[13] Within the Writers' Workshop and discussion of the idea of a radio programme[14] participants needed constant reassurance that they were being neither patronised nor indulged.

A possible correlation between health, purposeful social activity and the importance people assume others attach to them has long been central to socio-psychological theory. For example, psychologists have observed that retirement can evoke retreat and depression as a result of a loss of occupational status.[15] The humanist school of social psychology has suggested that the individual has a potential for constant self-development, an innate drive to a state of optimum maturity which has been called self-actualisation.[16] There is some uncertainty within psychology concerning how this might be defined. There is though empirical evidence from psychotherapy, brain injured soldiers, psychoanalysis, studies of creativity and child psychology, that the absence of some tendency to 'growth or self-perfection' can induce various kinds of illness.[17] It is suggested that such criteria as 'superior perception of reality', greater autonomy, freshness of appreciation, 'more democratic character structures' may be empirically correlated with healthy personal development. Learning and growth can be seen as prerequisites of individual health. Some psychologists[18] have asserted that human beings have a natural inclination to learn; they are curious about their world but this can be blunted by negative social experience.[19] The frustration of a natural potential to learn can produce ill-health, insecurity and retreat. A person loses confidence and belief in his/her capacity to make sense of new and disparate experience; psychological dis-equilibrium can be explained as a result of a person's innate drive towards learning and self-actualisation being frustrated. It is unnatural not to learn.

Such a 'humanist' theoretical framework involves some conceptual difficulties, It is uncertain that a drive towards self-actualisation can be quite so easily tabulated according to a hierarchical structure of being, needs and drives as some have suggested.[20] Nonetheless, there is increasing empirical evidence to support the general idea. Such a socio-psychological explanation can be developed further by exploiting a theatrical metaphor. Personal well-being might be correlated with

forms of social activity in which the individual performs a role which is considered to be of value and through which he/she can achieve 'actualisation'.

It is recognised that drama, ritual and routine are an important component within a person's socio-psychological identity.[21] 'Drama' can be defined in terms of novelty, importance and the possibility of action. Ritual can be distinguished from drama in that social action is predictable and familiar. Routine is a pattern of behaviour which is barely consciously considered since it has become such a common feature of living. A child's tantrum might initially be considered to be drama, but can quickly become routine as ways of coping with it are developed. It may well be that both ritual and routine are important components within psychological well-being. Drama may be an equally necessary element.

It has been noted that lifelong education theorists have suggested that the extent and pace of social change is an important reason for learning to be considered as a lifelong necessity.[22] It was recognised that change itself is not psychologically dysfunctional; rather at the root of psycho-emotional disorder may be constant alterations to social and personal circumstances over which the individual has little sense of control. This may be a negative way of expressing an important idea. It can be argued that people require a degree of novelty, difference and opportunity as a stimulus to action. They need an audience through which their performance can be validated. If the individual is relegated to the 'wings' of a broader social drama, does not understand the action or there is no role to perform, novelty and learning may be removed from experience.

Drama can manifest itself in many forms in human behaviour. (For example, at one extreme it has been suggested that nervous breakdowns or schizophrenic disorders can precede new levels of spiritual insight or understanding.[23]) An individual's definition of novelty and learning will vary. The core idea is that an understanding and integration of socially valued experience contributes to personal development through increased self-awareness and greater psychological well-being. Conversely, to be excluded from 'drama' or subsumed in routine may produce the opposite. The people in the Case Studies struggled to find a valued role (or had assumed there were none available) and felt unable to identify how they should respond. They needed support in any action. Ritual and routine had become dominant, opportunity and valued alternatives seemed unavailable or illusory. Self-worth had little chance to develop in the

absence of valued activity legitimised by a larger audience. The 'drama' could become one of retreat rather than an experience which might animate the mind and emotions.

The idea that learning and growth may be necessary to personal well-being might be insufficient as a basis for a theory to explain the shared experience among groups of people such as those in the Studies. There might be a need to incorporate a sociologically based explanation of how cumulative social experience becomes unconducive to the development of learning. A possible approach may lie in perceiving social interaction as forming a pattern of subordinate social relationships in which groups of people feel collectively devalued. They may share experiences which encourage low expectations and minimal self-belief. Recurring patterns could be identified in the interview material which included experiences at school, in the family, local community, work, political activity and other relationships. Schooling in particular was an institution in which everyone had felt devalued. It remained a major source of reference for interpreting 'learning' and 'education'. Schooling permeated discussions of adult learning and personal ability. In school, children were the objects of 'education' in which they were taught or 'set' a range of subjects. Knowledge was firmly compartmentalised into the lessons of the timetable. The purpose of schooling was seen to be in learning subjects as a means to compete more successfully through passing examinations, gaining certificates and institutional rewards.[24]

Many of the people in the Case Studies represent the failure of a social institution, associated with the promotion of learning. They were often at the *'back of the class'*[25] and other students *'had higher marks'*[26] Pressing family or personal problems were thought to be irrelevant to 'learning' or to the main purpose of the institution.[27] Schooling was for some a source of personal pain and humiliation; teachers seemed remote, authoritarian figures who had the power to wield the sanction of corporal punishment. People remembered conformity within schooling being rigidly enforced; as pupils they were conscious of a separation into 'successes' and 'failures'; the rules of social labelling were internalised by the interviewees - the school's verdict held an historic and continuing validity. To those in this sample that verdict was negative.

Many of the interviewees had troublesome childhoods which compounded these problems. Parental separation, family upheaval or an enforced responsibility for a younger brother or sister were part of shared experience.[28] Personal uncertainty and insecurity intruded into 'schooling' if only through periods of absence or illness from school.[29] For some, schooling

appeared irrelevant to more pressing personal and family needs; escape could be found through truancy, a retreat to the back of the class or passive acquiescence.[30]

The problems faced by many families appeared to be exacerbated by the areas in which they lived. For example, the local environments of Pilton and Craigmillar were those of violence, rootlessness and powerlessness which seemed to permeate more personal and family concerns.[31] The areas 'got to people' in that the physical expressions of dereliction, neglect and hopelessness intruded into the individual and collective consciousness and were replicated in human experience. The extent of material deprivation, feelings of hopelessness, financial insecurity and widespread unemployment were part of a common culture through which conversations about learning and wider opportunity in life were filtered.

Many interviewees had been in employment although 'work' was felt to be transitory - it was 'good' when it was available but in no sense an entitlement. Participation in the formal economy in some ways paralleled other institutional experience. It was a sporadic, temporary phenomenon which held no permanent value other than the extrinsic rewards of greater material affluence. Where 'work' was discussed it was recalled as a time of drudgery, boredom or frustration.[32] Any 'rewards' lay in social contact, or some degree of relative independent status. 'Work' was valued as a means to an end[33] - there was little opportunity to exercise any responsibility, major decision making, discriminatory skills or imagination. Work on the 'production line' in the lemonade factory was stultifying; some variety could be introduced by breaking the 'good' bottles as well as the 'bad'.[34]

There was no evidence of political action or combination with others being considered as a way to change personal or social circumstances. Governments, political parties and trade unions were seen as either largely powerless to effect change or were regarded with hostility and irrelevance.[35] Political relationships were primarily those of social dependency on welfare bureaucracies. There was no sense of entitlement to adequate social security payments or support from local government; rather there was a passive acceptance that it was good fortune to get what one could.

These institutional and relational experiences can therefore be interpreted as part of a pattern in which people become excluded from socially valued activity - learning or work - and appear to have little control over key social forces which affect them. On the whole people appear to acquiesce in what is done to them. They see themselves as either incapable of learning or 'lack ability'. Failure is explained in terms of

personal inadequacy. This identification of social marginalisation as part of a ubiquitous cultural experience for some social groups can be developed further. It can be related to the idea of power. A belief in personal or collective capacity to induce change may be an important element within learning. This constitutes the basis of the second proposition.

3. The Second Proposition: Participation in learning, power and social determinants

It has been noted that there is considerable overlap in the analysis of the literature and Case Studies surrounding the first two propositions. A sense of powerlessness in relation to events may interconnect with the pattern of social exclusion and the absence of 'drama' and growth.

The idea of powerlessness can be understood by considering the concept of power. Its definition has proved difficult within social science but it can be regarded as an aspect of social relationships. In this view power is not a simple attribute accruing to a particular person or position. It refers to subsets of relationships among social groups or between them in that the behaviour of one group may in some circumstances depend on the behaviour of others.[36] In this sense, 'power' refers to relationships of control or dependence between or within social groups.

The transcript material is full of evidence of socially dependent relationships. Important decisions surrounding personal opportunity are dependent on the decisions of other people. One aspect of the teacher-pupil relationship within schooling can be identified as that of power; memories of control-dependence permeate perceptions of learning. Since 'schooling' and 'learning' are barely distinguishable in the phenomenonology of the interviewees, assumptions about relationships between 'teachers' and 'learners' are transferred into perceptions of adult education. These perceptions are those of deeply dependent relationships in which 'teacher' is a source of control and legitimate authority. It may be that a fear of this particular form of dependency reappearing may conflict with the notion of self-theory in adulthood.[37] Every adult will have ideas about him/herself which provide some comfort and sense of personal legitimacy. This might be a struggle for a better life for 'the bairns'. For those in the sample these may be expressed diffidently or barely comprehended; to admit that there is a need to learn may be seen as a further threat to what little status is left in adulthood.

The dimension of power could be discerned in the relationships between tutors and participants in the Case Studies. Participants assumed

that learning was a passive process; the 'teacher' would deposit 'knowledge' into the student. The student's role was to consume a set of rules, ideas and evidence presented by the teacher. The 'teachers' and organisers were considered to be part of a group whose function was the dissemination of knowledge. Their power derived from an ownership of knowledge. These assumptions were particularly noticeable in the a.b.e. schemes in Pilton and Craigmillar. Reading and writing consisted of techniques and content to be dictated by the tutors.[38] Relationships at a personal level were friendly and equal but contrasted with the roles entered into when learning took place. The form and content of learning were decided by the teacher; participants never thought to question such dependent relationships. These were assumed to be part of a natural order.

The Adult Learning Project and Unemployed Workers' Course involved more considered attempts to solve this 'teacher-student contradiction'. It has been noted that autobiographical material in the Unemployed Workers' Course was not exploited to the extent that it might have been and thus one possible route to a demystification of learning was insufficiently explored.[39] The idea of personal experience being used as evidence within learning may have helped to disseminate power among participants. The organisers of ALP had to struggle with the limited definitions of learning held by participants. A fuller participation in learning may not simply be achieved by stressing the potential of all to contribute to the development of ideas, knowledge or skills. It may also involve acknowledging the dimension of power within social relationships. One important achievement in ALP was that possible problems inherent in teacher-student relationships were openly discussed and some strategy devised to try to minimise them. It can be argued that the major achievement of ALP was to accept the existence of 'power' within learning and to seek to disseminate it among all participants.

The concept of power is interrelated with a belief in 'a potential to influence events'. Most interviewees considered that personal and social circumstances were largely beyond their own control. The possibility of finding work was increasingly remote. The utility of training or educational programmes was not obvious to them. Assessments about the state of the local labour market, personal educability and a poor self-concept combined to produce disbelief that change was possible either through individual or collective action. Consciousness was constrained by a range of factors. Power resided in others. The major dimensions of life were determined by other people or uncontrollable social forces. The

idea of power and consciousness being socially determined is central to the second proposition. The word 'determined' is used in a particular sociological sense.

For some sociologists 'determinism' has been taken to mean that a person's consciousness, identity and social relationships are expressions of a person's role in the process of production.[40] This 'structuralist' view has been challenged in that it relegates human identity to a dependent content of fixed economic or technological abstraction.[41] Determinism has been redefined in terms of social relationships setting limits, exerting pressure; there has been a move away from the idea of a central predicted, prefigured base to personal identity and consciousness to a more dynamic model of identity in which the specific activities of people in social or economic relationships can vary.[42]

Such a theoretical debate can only be noted in this study but the post-structuralist concept of determinism may be useful in developing the second proposition. It suggests that perception, choice and opportunity can be thought of as culturally determined. Perception is not a simple product of an isolated human intellect but may be circumscribed by the assumptions, beliefs and attitudes which are shared by people in similar circumstances.

Opportunity and choices within the inner city or Craigmillar and Pilton are quantitatively different from those experienced by more dominant social groups. At the very least, this can be measured in terms of access to high status occupations or patterns of consumption. The actions (or inaction) people take cannot simply be understood in terms of individual personality. They are located within a specific cultural milieu which includes forms of political and social relationships. The individual is in part a product of social and power relationships which can reinforce opportunity or compliance. He/she may be a manager or worker, local authority housing official or tenant, teacher or student. Opportunity and choice are in this sense socially determined; there was little opportunity or choice for the people in the Case Studies. They had few chances to participate in socially valued activity.

The exploration of the first and second propositions has therefore raised some interrelated ideas. People in the Case Studies tend to belong to social groups in which learning and growth could easily become frustrated. They were excluded from socially valued or inherently valuable social activity such as intrinsically rewarding work. Lives

were dominated by routine and lacked 'drama' to stimulate intellectual or emotional development. More general social experience, such as schooling or work, led individuals to believe that they had little to offer other people; their creative and intellectual potential remained unrealised. People felt powerless to alter their situations which were in part determined by cultural constraints and dependency on other groups for material support or 'work'.

It is to be suggested therefore that participation in learning can only be understood as one element within patterns of social experience. The meaning of learning cannot be analysed as a discrete, isolated phenomenon. The initial significance of learning for participants can best be explained as an affective process; confidence is needed to 'find a voice' and the personal support of tutors or organisers is crucial to this process. Social validation is needed from peers and tutors. Many people may be experiencing varying states of psychological ill-being in that their capacity to learn and grow has been constrained. Such a condition can be described as alienation. A perspective on the concept of alienation may be a useful way of summarising the ideas developed in the propositions. The concept is derived from a sociological critique of the nature of work in capitalist society. Work was an activity to be defined by others and could exclude intrinsic rewards. The worker might gain little creative, intellectual or emotional satisfaction. A person's potential had become divorced from a dominant activity in his/her life.[43] The concept has been developed beyond this; it has been applied to refer to states of powerlessness, meaninglessness, isolation and self-estrangement in highly bureaucratic, formal organisations.[44] Common to the various uses of the concept is a contradiction between what a person does and what he/she may be capable of doing. People are locked into a state of being or doing which estranges them from what they can become. In this sense the idea of alienation can be related to the states of disharmony and ill-being noted in this study. Harmony and well-being may depend on learning and growth in which there is an opportunity to experience drama in the form of new stimuli. If drama is controlled and understood by participants it can lead to personal development. This may be close to the existentialist idea that life lacks meaning if a person is not engaged in unfolding his/her powers and by productive living.[45] There is a common distinction between actuality and potentiality. There is a shared awareness of a gap between what a human being is, what he/she might like to be and what he/she could be. A person's alienation may be rooted in his/her intellectual, creative and emotional potential being

denied; the individual becomes locked into what 'is' according to other people's definitions or by cultural determinants. Non-participation in learning can therefore be seen as a dimension of alienation; a person may deny his/her capacity to develop or to grow. Participation in learning may be thought of as one element within personal and social assertion in which greater personal harmony and control over events might become more possible.

4. The Third Proposition: the content and nature of learning

Most of the interviewees in the last Chapter defined learning and education in conventional terms. Adult education was indistinguishable from schooling - a system which consisted of 'knowledge' codified into 'subjects' to be 'taught'. Adult education was considered to be largely irrelevant to the problems and pressures of living. There was no obvious link between learning and solutions to pressing problems. The content of learning was defined by teachers, organisers and others with 'knowledge'. There was little or no place for the individual to participate in its formulation.

In contrast it was suggested in the third proposition that a curriculum for working class people could most successfully be developed if it was directly related to personal, social and political experience. People in the inner city or on the council estate faced a range of problems which it was necessary to understand if personal or collective development was to take place. Learning was to be regarded as a process of interpreting the nature of social constraints or 'contradictions', understanding them and their possible susceptibility to change.

Note has been made of the criticism that some conventional adult education may indeed mirror the practices which predominate in initial education.[46] Discussion of the idea of participation is often narrowly confined to comparatively tangential questions surrounding choice of material within given 'subjects' or the relevance of 'interactive' teaching methods. A subject, as distinct from problem-posing approach to adult education, characterises most existing practice; (the association of 'learning' with 'subjects' within school may compound the feelings of irrelevance many people have towards adult education). It does not follow that problem-posing and subject-based learning need necessarily be dichotomous. To present the former as an alternative to the latter might oversimplify the problems of curriculum development. There may be no one single or simple alternative route to 'conscientization' for working class people.

For example, there are problems in applying problem-posing learning of the type advocated by Freire. Freire's pedagogy stems from a view of learning in which people act on nature or culture to transform 'contradictions'. Learning is part of a process of social transformation for the 'oppressed' in which they cease to be 'beings' subsumed in history and discover their historicity. They become conscious of forces which constrain or condition them and take action to begin to shape their own identity. They become 'conscientized'; people are able to explain problems according to theories of causality and not magical explanations; they realise that ideas need to be grounded in practical experiment; they become open to new experience and more autonomous people.

North American experience indicates that there are practical problems in applying Freire's ideas.[47] There may be tensions in his writing between world divided into the oppressors and the oppressed and the complexity of people's roles and opinions. A man may be both oppressed - as part of the urban poor - and an oppressor in his relationships with his wife. Interpretations may differ towards what constitutes a 'contradiction' or the desirability of action to change it. Groups of intellectuals or political radicals may discover that the poor may not be susceptible to a dialectic of personal discovery and social transformation in the way that they may have supposed. The experience and methods developed in literacy programmes in third world cultures may not be simply transplanted into a first world, schooled society.

The ALP experience provided evidence of this. There were difficulties in developing a sustained content within learning from the codification of experience and identification of 'contradictions'. Participants found the use of pictorial or graphical representations of culture useful as a catalyst to discussion. This did not though seem to produce radically different perspectives, which the organisers were striving to secure.[48] Some codifications provoked intense discussion about national identity, cultural invasion and the idea of a 'culture of silence'.[49] A photograph of a group of 'mums' waiting outside the iron bars and large gate denoting the entrance/exit to the school waiting for their children to emerge from 'learning' was deeply symbolic.[50] Whilst this encouraged valuable discussion there was little evidence to suggest that it provided the basis for a wider exploration of cultural symbolism or any sustained learning. Political conscientization may be slow to emerge but there was little evidence of a broader 'praxis' being realised through specific courses. One woman thought that Freire's writings confirmed her basic Christian beliefs rather than being the source of any deep self-

questioning and reappraisal.[51] Participants explained ALP in terms of changing perceptions of learning and a discovery of personal confidence rather than any more radical process. There was little or no desire to act on a political stage. 'Photography' became less a technique to operate a camera and more a way of capturing and reflecting on images of the local community.[52] A supportive egalitarian atmosphere generated confidence in social interaction primarily at a personal rather than a political level.[53] The development of learning is best explained through reference to the considered way in which participants were involved in all stages of programme development and the value placed on what people did by the organisers. The quality of dialogue and inter-personal relationships was the major characteristic of the Project rather than a breakthrough in the generation of a 'political' curriculum. Likewise, there was no evidence of sustained intellectual development. Whilst 'codification' encouraged reflection away from the concrete and particular, it did not seem to induce a desire for deeper and more sustained study or research. Problem-posing learning seemed to generate initial excitement and animated discussion; there was little or no sense of people engaged in a significant interpretation of their own culture or ways to transform it. The organisers found it difficult to encourage students to undertake more demanding activity. A part of their anxiety over 'signposting'[54] related to a lack of an innate dynamic which would have made their own roles less prominent. An exploration of self, culture and 'contradictions' was not easily translated into practical, self-sustaining and more demanding learning.

This may indicate that the problems of developing alternative curricula have been over-simplified. For example, the Freirean 'model' assumes a particular relationship between learning, collective action and political radicalism. The concept of learning is primarily developed from a conflict model in which learning is a tool in the emancipation of an oppressed or submerged class. It is possible to develop the ideas and evidence in this thesis into a theory of class relationships defining experience and personal opportunity. It does not follow that there is a clear link between 'problematising' culture and political radicalism. People in socially marginalised groups may come to recognise that some political theories may illuminate, and thus help them explain the constraints which surround them. At some stages within learning it has been noted[55] that other factors may be predominant. There may be a prime need for support, validation or purposeful social interaction. To discover a personal 'historicity' or a role in a wider political drama may require

time, space, confidence as well as sustained intellectual effort. It is not easy to find these resources or to pursue learning in such a way given the pressure of more immediate problems. Further, note has been made[56] that some adult educators equate learning with particular forms of class or feminist 'consciousness'. It is assumed that the 'voice' struggling to find form and expression is of a specific ideological hue. Ironically, this contrasts with the range of views held by project organisers. For example, the ideological positions of those in the Liverpool Project varied from the reformist to revolutionary.[57] It would have been useful to have explored the particular ideologies of project organisers in the Case Studies in more depth, but there was no indication of a simple unity of view or easy consensus. Similarly, sociological and historical research into the development of class consciousness, solidarity and shared political radicalism is primarily based on studies of industrial workers. Their recognition of common problems, conflicts of interest and shared 'consciousness' is located within the experience of the organisation and processes of production.[58] There is relatively little empirical or historical research into the relationship between political attitudes, class identification and the more nebulous concept of a local geographical community or sub-groups within it. It is far from clear that 'unemployment' or a 'shared' neighbourhood constitutes a sufficient basis for an alternative, radical cultural dynamic. Conversely it has been argued by feminists[59] that the women's movement provides a good example of a radical approach to curriculum development, and political conscientisation. A close examination of the evidence tends to suggest a more divergent range of aspirations, goals and beliefs about learning. It was noted that some women wished to gain qualifications for jobs or more formal types of certification as part of a process of self-assertion.[60] There appeared to be no irreconcilable contradiction to them between knowledge born of self-analysis and culture and more conventional routes to understanding. There is evidence to suggest[61] that participation in particular projects can 'radicalise' many women in that there may be a growing awareness of the cultural origin of their problems and its susceptibility to change. What is less clear is that this produced consensus on action, or a common theory through which to 'name the world'. It has been admitted that political as well as other responses could be diverse.[62] The idea that problem-posing learning produces a clear unanimity among the 'oppressed', or a common definition of what this might mean has not been established in action-research. Similarly, to suggest that all forms of subject based learning are a route to 'domestication'

seems misplaced. Freire accepts a role for 'experts' and a relevance for sophisticated ideas developed within some subject boundaries. He recognises that 'experts' should not dominate discussion or assume that their view is more valid than those of other people; rather the role of the 'expert' is that of a resource to illuminate aspects of a problem. Such a view is not far removed from what should be good practice in all adult education.[63]

Whatever approach to content development in learning is chosen, there are difficulties in animating learning for those at the margins of society. There is no simple or single alternative methodology which can be used to stimulate learning. The encouragement of learning among people who lack confidence may depend as much on the attitude and sensitivity of a tutor as it does on whether content is problem-posing or subject-based. There is evidence that learning can be made more meaningful if it relates to the world as it is perceived by potential participants; to organise 'content' according to conventional subject maps of knowledge may carry the risk that adult education is assumed to be irrelevant to 'problems'. Likewise, a failure to exploit participants' own experience as an element within curriculum development is to devalue the potential contribution to be made by all participants.

5. The fourth proposition: processes within learning, control and organisation

The fourth proposition was concerned with the control and organisation of learning. It was suggested that adults might learn better if they were able to determine and control the content of learning programmes. Such control should be democratic or dialogical; an element within personal liberation would be a realisation that participants have valid experience and knowledge to offer to others. They are not empty vessels. The learning process would become an interchange between equals. The roles of tutor and student can be shared by all people within a learning group. Initially, these ideas were combined with the notion of 'independent learning'; individuals might control their own programmes completely independently of any formal institution. This control over content could often best be secured through alternative, independent modes of working which were seen to constitute a new 'generic movement'.

There is a considerable overlap between these ideas and those developed through the first three propositions. For example, the control and organisation of learning may in part depend on the meanings people give to what is being done. If people feel powerless or have become

progressively marginalised it may be difficult for them to accept easily alternative and more assertive roles. People might need confidence, knowledge, collective support and learning skills (for example the ability to listen or to exploit the spoken and written word) before a fuller participation becomes possible or they can revalue what they are able to offer to others. Many of the interviewees had been children 'at the back of the class', defined themselves as failures and continued to devalue their abilities. 'Learning' was identified with past failure rather than any future potential. To be praised for a piece of written work or oral contribution was treated suspiciously. The process of personal re-evaluation was slow and difficult.

The Case Studies revealed an important paradox in relation to a realisation of participant control. Most participants expected tutor-student relationships to replicate what they had known in school. The tutor or organiser was the source of knowledge, ideas or validation. To challenge these assumptions required careful planning and the integration of participants at all stages of learning. Fuller participation could not simply be secured through curriculum relevance or an egalitarian ideology. Dialogue and mutuality depended on the educational coherence, actions and sensitivity of Project organisers. In this regard, the Case Studies provided a varied picture.

The Craigmillar Festival Society illustrated the confusions and incoherence which can surround practice. It has been noted in the introduction to the Case Studies that community education in Scotland is often associated with informal educative activity unrelated to more formal types of learning.[64] The two elements are rarely considered as interdependent by many community educators.[65] In the CFS learning tended to be associated with particular and discrete activities in the 'classroom' and only incidentally connected with the broader concerns of the Society. Whilst the ideology of CFS was based on a local community discovering its own creativity and potential to act, the control of literacy or the community was firmly in the hands of professionals . A possible contradiction was not recognised. The importance of literacy students making decisions about their own learning or using their own culture as a source of ideas was not recognised. Literacy was a means to read and write better rather than a more comprehensive, participatory experiment. The idea of the horizontal integration of learning with the problems and possibilities of personal existence was not considered. There was a further paradox revealed within the theory and practice of learning within CFS. The Society demonstrated a capacity for a locally generated

and managed organisation; it provided informal, socially purposeful outlets for people; its critique of 'education' denigrated the absence of a democratic, co-operative learning tradition unrelated to crises within local communities. Despite this the provision of education was considered in conventional terms. The formal dimensions of learning can be locked into the assumptions behind 'schooling' even when alternative approaches are claimed. The development of participant control within learning will require a solution to these problems .

Similarly, the Unemployed Workers' Course had been developed from the premise that education for unemployed people should relate to people's needs, wishes, problems and potential. This involved time and energy being spent both in contacting a range of agencies and undertaking in-depth interviews with potential participants. This process was to be a means through which there might be a closer link between course content and the personal and social experience of unemployed people. It has been noted that transcript analysis uncovered a range of assumptions and patterns within the thought-worlds and experiences of participants which could have been used to negotiate content and shared decisions over what was to be done. An opportunity for a fuller exchange was missed.

Contrastingly, participant involvement at all states of the ALP process ensured some redefinition of learning and personal ability. There was a strong belief that ALP was controlled by all participants; there was still evidence to suggest that it was difficult to encourage some people to take initiative and generate their own ideas for the Project. There was a heavy reliance on the skills and dispositions of the organisers who seemed able to encourage greater self-respect and belief among participants.

The relationship between participant control and independence from formal institutions has not been as fully examined in the thesis. The Liverpool outreach work was conducted under the auspices of the WEA and the organiser considered that a WEA Branch structure enabled a degree of participant control to be combined with access to a wider resource network.[66] Women's education in Southampton appears to have involved some conflict between the idea of participants defining, controlling and evaluating their learning and the conventional role of a University Department in the validation of academic standards.[67] This issue is explored further below.[68] The Case Study material provided examples of conflict between field workers and Senior Management. It was somewhat unclear how much the conflict within ALP, as a prime example, resulted from the mistakes and problems encountered in the early phases or structural antagonisms between field workers and management.

To identify participant control within learning with the idea of 'independence' as discussed by Tough or Brookfield seems largely irrelevant to the cultural contexts examined in this Study. The metaphor of a 'hidden iceberg' could be more perceptively applied to social structures in which personal potential has remained unrealised and frozen. Similarly, it is difficult to identify the relevance of learning webs, directories or other 'independent' modes of working to the world of the inner city or council house estate. A realisation of shared control within learning depended on the extent and quality of intervention by educators. It resulted from a willingness to engage participants in experientially based challenges to their prior assumptions. Learning was not a natural part of an undiscovered world. Dialogue was not an automatic feature of tutor-student or student-student relationships. The problems of control and independence in learning have been too divorced from culture. There has been an absence of detailed practice and evaluation of specific ways in which participants in learning can become more involved, in control and thus revalue themselves and their potential to shape their own learning.

6. A theory of participation in learning

A theory of participation in learning should incorporate a range of related dimensions. Specifically these include the interactions between learning, identity and personal and cultural context as well as a rationale for more participatory forms of curriculum development. A theory should also encompass a consideration of aspects of interpersonal behaviour and social organisation which might best induce personal growth and co-operative learning. The influence of culture is central to such a theory. Learning is best regarded as one element within a person's or social group's shared experience which is culturally determined. Culture shapes the way a person thinks and feels or 'constructs' reality with others. A disbelief in innate ability cannot simply be ascribed to psychological dispositions; it is a result of socialisation processes which may have been deeply miseducative. A theory of participation should therefore integrate the personal and social. Learning is conditioned both by a person's psychological state as well as structural and institutional forms which can frustrate or facilitate potential. The development of a fuller participation in learning can in turn be analysed according to processes at an individual or small group level which most encourage personal autonomy as well as forms of social organisation which enable more people to

control, rather than be controlled by, culture.

As a preliminary stage it is necessary to reexamine the definitions of learning and education which were provisionally suggested in the first Chapter.[69] The refinement of the four propositions has located learning within a socio-psychological, organisational and inter-personal framework which produces a need for substantial amendment. The study has revealed the necessity to consider adult learning both normatively and empirically. Definitions should incorporate some identification of what is with some awareness of what might be. Learning in both senses should be viewed holistically; it cannot simply be reduced to a separate component within experience or social organisation. At a personal level, the frustration of learning may cause or effect a broader socio-psychological state of withdrawal, retreat and self-denigration which constitutes ill-being. Conversely, learning can be a means to a more fulfilled, self-determining person. Socially, learning can be 'frozen' within a pattern of constraints and compliant relationships. Alternatively, it can be one way to understand and control important cultural forces which impinge on a group or an individual. The elements within an holistic model of learning can be tabulated as follows, using context, content and process as a convenient taxonomy.

i. Context

(a) Learning constitutes an aspect of human behaviour which should be considered as a continuum. At one end is informal, educative activity; at the other learning which is deliberately planned and organised within or outside an institutional framework. The development of formal learning can only be understood as part of a pattern of casual, accidental, random learning and general experience for the individual or group. The totality of experience can arouse curiosity, initiative or their opposites. The educator's prime concern is to ensure that formal learning is positively integrated with informal learning and general experience.

(b) Learning is socially determined to the extent that social relationships and the distribution of power and opportunity can facilitate or frustrate its expression.

(c) Learning is in part a function of social roles in the sense that these can provide or frustrate experience of novelty, stimulus and change in ways which can be controlled and understood by the individual.

(d) Learning is a *necessary* and distinctly human characteristic when conceived of as an activity possible to an intelligence capable of making reasoned choices, directing or controlling impulses with

a capacity to reorder in a conscious way the social and personal context of existence.

ii. Content

(a) Learning is an integrated intellectual/creative and emotional experience in which success in the former may be dependent on well being in the latter, or vice versa.

(b) Learning may be considered as an induction into existing knowledge or a creation of new ways of seeing. Its focus can be as much self and personal experience as an understanding of a particular body of established thought. Learning is dependent on the degree to which new insights are successfully assimilated into prior experience.

(c) More formal learning focuses on a clearer appreciation of systems of thought and methods of enquiry. The prime characteristic of adult learning is a pursuit of critical, rational explanation (including an awareness of the possible constraints of rationalism) combined with a sustained search for meaning, intelligibility, integrity and personal fulfillment.

(d) More formal learning should include the idea of progression, which can only be fully understood at a subjective level as part of an inter-related process of self-realisation, greater personal autonomy and intellectual development.

iii. Process

(a) Where adult learning shades into education it is best facilitated when there is constant negotiation surrounding the planning of objectives, content, and a co-operative approach to learning and evaluation.

(b) Adult learning is facilitated when the learner's experience is deliberately integrated into educational programming and a devolution of power within the group is specifically planned and developed.

(c) Adult learning is encouraged when the person shares a sense of responsibility for what is done, and if his/her contributions are valued.

(d) The processes of learning should facilitate greater personal control to enable the person to perceive him/herself as a self-educator. This will include specific encouragement to formulate his/her own objectives and the identification of techniques to ensure that he/she becomes more talented and efficient in pursuing them.

The definition of learning has therefore changed considerably in the thesis. The first statement asserts the indivisibility of experience in human consciousness and its capacity for good or ill; the second under-

lines the social location of learning and that culture can determine its expression or frustration. Learning is now considered to be both a necessary as well as a distinct human characteristic in the context of i(d) based on the humanist idea of progression, development and fulfillment being essential elements within positive living.

The content of learning is dependent on the successful integration of experience at different levels - either between the intellect and feelings or in discovering new ideas and developing one's own. Learning can only take place if the person can positively incorporate new with past experience. Education is primarily a subjective experience to be understood through changes in the self-concept, within social relationships and general behaviour. The quality of the learning process is dependent on groups of learners sharing responsibility. Content should be negotiated as much as methods. The desirability of devolved decision-making, shared responsibility and the need for a supportive environment illuminate a central feature of good adult learning. A search for personal explanation, integrity, creativity or understanding depends on the quality of inter-personal relationships within learning. The ideal of greater autonomy in learning should not be confused with isolation or independence from other people. To learn may include insights which underline human inter-dependence and the stimulus from purposeful, supportive and structured interaction with others. Personal validation has both a social as well as a personal domain. It is not contradictory to state that a realisation of greater personal autonomy, well being and conscientization depends on the quality of social interaction within the learning group.

Therefore at the centre of a theory of participation in learning, whether at the level of the informal group, the adult class or more general forms of social organisations may be a necessity for more democratic or 'dialogical' forms of human interaction and organisation. 'Democracy' can be defined in varying ways. It is often identified with procedures through which a given polity choses between competing elites for power. This can be defined as an anatomical or structural model of democracy.[70] Democracy is associated with sets of constitutional arrangements, forms of franchise and questions of accountability. Such a model is translated from the level of the state to more localised situations such as the school or factory. These become miniature polities. For present purposes an alternative definition of democracy is useful which identifies processes rather than structures.[71] It is concerned with skills and procedures, attitudes and psychological qualities within human groups which can best ensure a co-operative experience of learning. The skills and

procedures of dialogue and negotiation are related to the democratic ideals of people being encouraged to make their views explicit in a search for reconciliation and compromise. 'Dialogue' depends on particular forms of personal disposition, attitudes, skills of reciprocity which best secure shared decisions, mutual understanding and the identification of relevant content and methods within learning. ALP provided a good example of 'dialogical relationships' where all participants had discovered opportunities to be both teachers and learners.[72] This achievement is in contrast to monologue and silence which may characterise some conventional teacher-student relationships. Adults may learn best when the roles of teacher-student are interchangeable and participants realise a potential to teach as well as learn. The student may discover greater self-worth, despite a stigma of illiteracy, poverty or the lack of specific knowledge. The tutor is released from a role as the source of all knowledge and authority. He/she is more easily able to learn.

The ideas of dialogue and reconciliation imply particularly high levels of mutual toleration within a group. There needs to be shared sensitivity among participants. To join a coffee group or to take responsibility within a play-group can be a significant experience of affective learning for an individual. An adult who may aspire to take an 'O' level or to secure a qualification for a job is to be respected as much as any other person. A tutor or organiser may regard political action to be more relevant to the group or individual. More conventional aspirations can easily be disparaged; this can induce silence or retreat within the learner. The choice of an 'O' level may not seem appropriate but the reasons may be deeply hidden within a person's phenomenology. The views and aspirations of participants need to be respected in a search for meaning and intelligibility by those with particular 'authority'. The problem of understanding the thought-worlds and cultural realities of other people underlines the necessity for a tutor to encourage self-awareness and reliance within participants. It may be easy to induce silence or sycophancy in the most diffident and insecure. At the centre of relationships within learning should be a recognition of individual uniqueness, 'historicity' and a right to choose. This belief is central to the ideals of dialogue and democracy. Likewise it should be central to a theory of how adults might best participate in learning together.

The importance of 'dialogue' and democratic values at the level of the learning group can be related to the broader problems of existing

forms of social organisation and the assumptions which may underlie them. The socio-psychological and cultural analysis of 'non-participation' in 'learning' indicates that the facilitation or frustration of learning is part of a wider cultural problem which cannot be simply solved by the actions of the educator. There may be a tendency to exaggerate the significance of small scale adult education projects; they are located within a cultural milieu which may render many initiatives inconsequential or at best tangential. To encourage adult learning and wider educational opportunity may require a range of political and social politicies which seek to extend individual and group control over social and economic forces. The rationale underlying many existing organisations or the actions of 'authority' may be quite different. It may stem from theories of scientific management surrounding organisations or the delivery of 'services' which concentrate control, decisions and learning opportunities within élites. At present alternative, democratic theories of social organisation are rarely considered and practical experience of them is limited; the possible relationship between more democratic forms of social organisation and learning is unclear. There may be a parallel to be drawn with the state of practice and research within adult education. Practice can stem from a class conflict model or feminist critique of society. Similarly the state of organisational theory can be locked into ideological conflicts - those surrounding the control and ownership of material resources - which similarly oversimplify the relationships between power, opportunity, organisation and learning.

There may also be a curious parallel between the need for a clear theory and practice on the part of course organisers to ensure a quality of participation in learning and the role of other 'professional' groups. The research has indicated that there may be minimal evidence of a self-generated political response among many people locked into un employment and/or material poverty. There was no evidence from the case studies of any widespread collective action. Political apathy and lack of response was rather a dimension of collective and personal alienation. There may be a need within policies of economic and social regeneration to encourage local people to reflect on what can be done and to share control and thus learn from action. This involves an explicit recognition of the problem of power and the need to disseminate it. The quality of intervention, as in the adult learning group, may determine whether the actions of professionals are perceived as a 'cultural invasion', and thus induce a further retreat into silence or its opposite.

The animation of learning within the inner city or among the socially marginalised can therefore be seen to depend on the beliefs and practices of those who may provide new resources or work opportunities. Actions may be authoritarian or dialogical. Material welfare, 'work' and a solution to poverty may be necessary but are not sufficient pre-requisites for wider expressions of adult learning. The next Chapter explores ways in which social policy, planning and organisation can focus on such qualitative concerns. There are ways in which many unemployed people might be incorporated into programmes of economic regeneration which mirror the practice of the good tutor in the learning group. It is suggested that a wider participation in adult learning will require a clearer refinement through 'action-research' of those qualities and organisational forms which best secure dialogue and its dissemination more widely throughout society.

REFERENCES

1. *See Chapter One pp. 8-10.*
2. *See Chapter Five pp. 174-177.*
3. *Chapter Two above pp. 31-36.*
4. *P.L. Berger and T. Luckman: 'The Social Construction of Reality', Penguin, 1971.*
5. *See Chapter Two, pp. 43-48.*
6. *See Chapter Three,*
7. *Ibid. pp. 83-111.*
8. *Ibid. pp. 91-95.*
9. *Ibid.*
10. *Ibid.*
11. *Ibid. p. 91.*
12. *Ibid. p. 84.*
13. *Ibid.*
14. *Ibid. p. 70.*
15. *For example, D. Bromley: 'The Psychology of Human Ageing', Penguin, 1974, p.239.*
16. *For example, A.H. Maslow and C. Rogers. See A.H. Maslow: 'Motivation and Personality', Harper and Row, 1954, and C. Rogers: 'Regarding learning and its facilitation' in 'Freedom to Learn', Merrill, Columbus, Ohio, 1969, pp.157-166.*
17. *A.H. Maslow: 'Toward a Psychology of Being', Van Nostrand Reinhold, 1968 pp.23-27.*
18. *C. Rogers: Op.Cit.*
19. *Ibid.*
20. *See the analysis by J.W. Shaw: 'The Personal Imperative' in R. Ruddock: 'Six Approaches to the Person', Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1972, pp.126-154.*
21. *An important essay which develops this idea is by J. Morris: 'Three Aspects of the Person in Social Life', in R.Ruddock: 'Six Approaches to the Person, Op.Cit. pp.70-92.*
22. *See Chapter One pp.12-14.*
23. *See for example, R.D. Laing: 'The Self and Others', Tavistock, 1961.*
24. *See Chapter Three, pp. 76-78.*
25. *Ibid. pp. 76-78 and 83-85.*
26. *Ibid.*
27. *Ibid.*
28. *Ibid. p.p.78-79.*
29. *Ibid. pp. 76-78.*
30. *Ibid.*
31. *Ibid. pp. 101-103.*

32. *Ibid. pp.79-80.*

33. *Ibid. p.79.*

34. *Ibid.*

35. *Ibid. p.80*

36. *I am thinking of the kind of analysis of 'power' developed by R.A. Dahl in 'Modern Political Analysis', Prentice Hall, 1970; such theorists have attempted to locate political analysis within social processes (rather than simply describe characteristics of institutions) and to apply systems theory to 'politics'.*

37. *See J. Rogers: 'Adult Learning', Open University Press, pp.36-38 for a discussion of this.*

38. *See Chapter Three pp. 96-112.*

39. *Ibid. pp.86-87.*

40. *L. Althuser: 'Essays in Self-Criticism', New Left Books, p.86.*

41. *See R. Williams in 'Base and Superstructure in Marxist Cultural Theory', New Left Review, 83, Dec.1973, pp.3-16.*

42. *Ibid. p.4.*

43. *K. Marx: 'On Alienation' in T.B. Bottomore and M. Rubel (Eds.) 'Karl Marx, Selected Writings in Sociology and Social Philosophy', Penguin. p.177.*

44. *See in particular R. Blauner: 'Alienation and Freedom: the Factory Worker and his Industry', Phoenix Books, 1967.*

45. *E. Fromm: 'Man for Himself', Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1949, pp. 39-50.*

46. *See Chapter Two p.36.*

47. *Ibid. pp.46-47.*

48. *See Chapter Three pp.95-96 above.*

49. *Ibid.*

50. *Ibid.*

51. *Ibid. p.94.*

52. *Ibid. p.93.*

53. *Ibid. pp.95-96.*

54. *Ibid.*

55. *See pp.125-128 above.*

56. *See Chapter Two pp. 43-48.*

57. *Ibid. p.44.*

58. *I am thinking of the sociological tradition represented by researchers such as J. Goldthorpe et al: 'The Affluent Worker: individual attitudes and behaviour', Cambridge University Press, 1968, as well as E.P. Thompson's massive study in which he interpreted class as a process in which people created their own institutions and solidarity as a response to economic conditions; E.P. Thompson: 'The Making of the English Working Class', Penguin, 1968.*

59. *J.L. Thompson: 'Learning Liberation', Op.Cit.*

60. *Ibid. pp.146-195.*

61. *See Chapter Two p.45.*

62. *Ibid. p.52.*

63. *See L.R. West: 'The Tawney Legend Re-examined', Op.Cit.*

64. *See Chapter Three pp.71-73.*

65. *Ibid.*
See also a relatively recent analysis by D. Alexander, T. Stewart T. Leach: 'Community Education, Leisure and Recreation: Policy Organisation and Provision in Three Scottish Regions', produced for the SED which tends to confirm this view (June 1984).

66. *T. Lovett: 'Adult Education, Community Development and the Working Class', Op.Cit. pp.146-148.*

67. *J. Thompson: 'Learning Liberation', Op.Cit.*

68. *See Chapter Five pp.168-174.*

69. *See Chapter One pp. 8-11.*

70. *For a discussion of this, see C. Pateman : 'Participation and Democratic Theory', Cambridge University Press, 1973.*

71. *Ibid.*

CHAPTER FIVE : SOME IMPLICATIONS

1. Introduction: Theory and Practice.
2. The Social Context of Learning.
3. Participation and Curriculum Development.
4. Existing Agencies and Experimental Work.
5. Research and Evaluation.
6. Conclusion: Participation, adult learning, values and alternative futures.

---

1. Introduction: Theory and Practice

From the outset, the objective behind this research has been two-fold. First, there has been an attempt to develop a clearer understanding of the experience of participation in learning for those 'at the bottom' of the social structure; secondly, it was intended to identify practical ways in which adult learning opportunities could be developed. The theoretical analysis has located adult learning needs and demands, including the meanings given to them, in specific cultural contexts. Participation in learning is best understood within a framework of more general social relationships, opportunities and the distribution of power within a given society. In particular a theory of participation in adult education has at its core the idea that interpersonal relationships and more general social organisation can determine both opportunities to learn and the meaning of learning itself.

Some of the ideas developed in the last Chapter can be more easily applied to the practical problems of organising adult education than others. Engaging students more deeply in defining their own learning may be difficult given the assumptions about teachers and students which people have. Nonetheless, there are specific suggestions which can be made in the development of learning programmes to encourage critical reflection, choice, support, co-operation and a deepening experience of participation for those who may be most diffident about personal ability. It is possible to suggest a curriculum model which incorporates ways to disseminate the control and planning of educational objectives. Learning methods can be identified which allow a closer integration of informal educative activity with sustained learning - doing with thinking. The Chapter also examines some possible roles for existing adult education agencies in developing different approaches to learning. Such development may be difficult given the organisational, political and financial frameworks in which many educators operate.

A further problem is the degree to which adult learning on any substantial scale can be developed in the context of a particular social structure and educational system. Learning is closely identified with schooling, personal failure and inability. It is not surprising that some people in the inner-city or on the peripheral council estate are reluctant to board the educational train or perceive educators as irrelevant to more immediate and pressing needs. It may be that the nurturing of learning in such contexts requires a willingness to experiment with more democratic forms of institutional organisation as much as any redistribution

of work opportunity or material resources per se. Paradoxically, as within ALP, this probably requires a degree of leadership, signposting and willingness to experiment in the devolution of power and control by those with power. A political and educational commitment by those who may have control of local resources can be thought of as a key element within a strategy to develop adult learning. These problems are a major theme in the section below.

The suggestions contained in this Chapter include the idea that all parties within learning should try to understand the motives and assumptions on which it is based; the educator needs to be open about questions of control and what he/she perceives to be the purpose of learning. The student needs to be drawn into a dialogue through sharing responsibility for what is done and being encouraged to find a voice to give words and meaning to experience. A learning exchange might only be possible if those with least confidence begin to feel valued, useful and relevant. There may be nothing so practically useful in the development of learning as a dialogically based theory.

The penultimate section consists of an examination of problems of research and evaluation in work of this kind. An approach to both may have parallels with the participatory paradigm of learning which has been developed in this study. Indeed research and evaluation could be used to enrich learning for all participants if particular methods are adopted.

The final section relates the thesis to broader debates surrounding adult education and training. To what extent are contemporary trends conducive to the development of adult learning opportunities for socially marginalised people? It has been noted that particular approaches to recurrent/continuing education may place training and existing labour market needs as an absolute priority in a search for economic growth. The approach to participation in some adult training/education may be in marked contrast to the ideas in this thesis. There may be parallels between the reactions of those at the beginning of the Century against a narrow instrumental/vocational approach to workers' education and the concerns identified in this research.[1]

2. The Social Context of Learning

It is clear that participation in adult learning reflects wider socio-structural inequalities. For example, those people who 'succeed' within existing educational systems may in turn have access to high status occupations, power over resources and intrinsically rewarding activity which can provide a motivation and rationale for continued learning.

Conversely, some of those who leave education at the earliest opportunity may be the most vulnerable to exclusion from participation in the labour market; at best they may have access to low status occupations in which rewards are extrinsic - social contact or relative material affluence - rather than intrinsic to 'work'. Intellectual, creative and emotional potential can become socially frustrated. Further, people such as those in the Case Studies were objects of change in the sense that their lives were largely determined by other dominant groups. There was little opportunity or confidence to share control over important social or economic events.

The theory of participation in learning has identified a close relationship between the development of more democratic processes within social relationships and the stimulation of learning. This is in contrast to existing forms of social organisation - such as the division of labour - which are based on different assumptions. Advanced industrial society has spurned increasingly refined and technically complex hierarchical divisions in which power, skills, opportunity and rewards are unevenly distributed. Whilst industrial society may also have nurtured alternative cultural and democratic aspirations among sections of the working class and sympathetic intellectuals,[2] this has made relatively little impact on social organisation. Possible interconnections between democratic processes, a devolution of power and management within work or the provision of local 'services' and learning have remained tangential in educational or organisational theory.

In part, the reasons for this might be explained by reference to the possible failure of social experiments in other countries or the absence of a body of empirical evidence based on alternative forms of social, economic or educational organisation. There is evidence to suggest that inequality and hierarchy continue within those societies which claim a degree of social control over industry or more democratic forms of organisation.[3] In Yugoslavia, 'industrial democracy' may not have reduced dependence on experts or changed the structure of work compared with capitalist economies.[4] The British evidence from co-operatives or the experience of Scottish ship workers[5] is, as yet, insufficient and unclear. What can be suggested from British experience[6] is that attempts to devolve power, control and management in isolation from integrated educational programmes are likely to fail. There may be parallels between some ideas in Scottish community education, for example an emphasis on practice, action and incidental learning and experiments with industrial democracy. Theories of community education or industrial democracy may exaggerate

the extent to which participation itself is a sufficient basis for learning. There may be a devaluation of the need for people to have certain knowledge or to think in detail about what is being done, and to develop the necessary study, research and interpersonal skills. An individual may need time and space to understand what is being done and intellectual confidence to formulate his/her own opinions. To minimise the importance of intellectual effort and sustained learning to make sense of new experience may be to propagate both a delusion and a denial of an opportunity to learn.

At present the organisational basis of industry or public authorities is sustained by theories of scientific management . These assume an oligarchical system of control and decision making. The planning and organisation of work or the delivery of a 'service' is seen to be complex and most appropriately controlled by a cadre of highly trained managers or professionals. By definition they are best equipped to decide the optimum forms of work organisation or service delivery according to particular definitions of profitability or efficiency.[7] Most systems' theory and management science is behaviourist in orientation in that the worker is conditioned to perform well through an environment controlled by management or the attractions of external rewards such as higher pay. The consumer may be regarded as irrelevant to the management and delivery of local authority services. These are best organised on a similar hierarchical basis. There is relatively little research into experiments with more devolved management systems or a wider involvement of 'consumers' in the definition and delivery of local services .[8] There are some examples from industrial organisation of small scale 'collective contract systems'[9] in which groups of workers decide the structure of work and its organisation for themselves; there is minimal research into ways in which local authority services such as housing management could be devolved to tenants and the implications for adult learning. At present, some limited experiments are taking place within housing estate management but the educational implications remain unclear.[10]

It would be interesting to examine how a devolution of management could be integrated with the provision of specific learning opportunities. In what ways could learning be organised to ensure the development of marketing, financial and inter-personal skills? A range of structured opportunities would be needed which enabled people to develop their confidence to think critically or to improve basic skills.

ALP was too small scale and tangential within the contexts of most participants' lives to form any firm conclusion about the relationship between control and learning. Change within more dominant institutions could involve deeper challenges and more significant experiences. This theme has been developed in some of the literature devoted to the educational implications of industrial democracy.[11] It has been suggested that previously disadvantaged participants in work may become better placed, informed and confident through increased responsibility. For example, within a devolution of power, opportunities might be provided to understand the basis of some accountancy systems. Alternative approaches to accountancy could be considered. Traditional cost/benefit analysis may enter labour as a cost whilst pollution or the exploitation of non-renewable resources are omitted. The rule defining capacity of dominant groups may be open to challenge as workers understand the assumptions within existing approaches and challenge them. The processes of democracy and learning might provide a mutually reinforcing dynamic. Both may be revalued as a result. In a related way it is possible to conceive of different approaches to urban regeneration programmes in contrast to some highly paternalistic and prescriptive methods used by planners.[12] The purposes behind alternative methods would not be simply to devolve power and influence to local groups or individuals who may be directly affected; it would include co-ordinated opportunities for people to learn about the options and resources which might be available to them. At present, local groups such as the CFS are marginal to the centres of control over resources or the management of key areas of peoples' lives such as housing or schooling. The role of CFS was primarily that of a suppliant for the local community to 'local' government agencies. Whilst there may continue to be problems in involving some of the most socially withdrawn in such activity, an opportunity for local control and the identification of learning opportunities which seem immediately relevant could provide a clearer incentive for local people. It could also provide an entry into systematic learning for such people. Some of the opportunities and problems will only be more satisfactorily understood through actual experiment and extensive research.

Such attempts at the 'horizontal integration' of learning may imply a different and more devolved approach to the co-ordination of education with other community activities than has, as yet, been considered. There are a number of reports which have been concerned with the co-ordination of adult education with other services. Local

and national development councils have been identified as one way to integrate adult education into economic activity or more general social policy planning.[13] Problems of power, the ethos, practice and attitudes of professional groups have been excluded from such analyses. It may be important to incorporate within the training of those who seek to 'serve' local communities some understanding of the nature of learning and its possible relationship and relevance to a range of urban problems. The position of professionals having responsibility for important decisions can be compared with the organisers of ALP. They sought to disseminate power and decision making within learning. Learning and control were co-operative activities. The roles and assumptions adopted by some professionals may evoke retreat and 'silence' among inhabitants of the inner City or the housing estate. Professionals might merely issue 'communiques'. A discovery of co-operative responsibility and learning may require time, resources and commitment by professional groups if local people are to participate in a reinvigoration of their communities.

There is little evidence that the training of professional groups within fields such as local government, key service agencies or potential sources of employment such as the M.S.C. is concerned with such issues. The management of services seems to be considered in highly conventional ways. The models of corporate management introduced into local authorities during the 1970s were centralist in assumption and accepted pyramidical structures of power as a means to greater efficiency.[14] Discussions of corporate management rarely transcended a narrow concern for a tighter co-ordination of management funtions at a senior level. Whilst 'consultation' became a vogue word within education, housing or planning policy, its prime purpose was to inform 'consumers' about the complexity of decisions to be taken by others and to ensure that 'their' views were not ignored. There was little attention given to the processes through which local people could become more actively engaged in the management of schools, housing estates or the determination of local plans.

The problems of establishing dialogue between experts and local people were not considered. It was assumed that local people needed to learn *from* and not *with*.

It is possible to imagine the ways in which a planner or housing official could become more knowledgeable about a local community through outreach work or using informal community work techniques.

There is little chance of access to the informal group or 'street corner discussion' using traditional approaches . A professional might become skilled in ways of codifying aspects of 'culture' and encouraging people to interpret it. Group leadership skills might be of use in informal discussion. A knowledge of teaching techniques and methods to maximise learning could be useful in workshops such as those of C.F.S. At present the sociology of management and organisations or the relevance of adult education may be neglected in professional training.

It might be difficult to develop alternative approaches to the training of a range of professional workers if this remains under the control of sectional interests.[15] Training and the preservation of power and status may become entangled. Proposals to disseminate power more widely within the definition and practice of social policy may be seen as a threat by some groups. Professionalism is often associated with a monopoly over decisions within social relationships. Conversely, some professionals might regard a fuller participation by people in a reinvigoration of local communities as a logical and necessary element within urban planning. There is a need for a body of practice to be developed and thoroughly researched before these ideas can be refined further.

3. Participation and Curriculum Development

An important concern in the research has been to define approaches to curriculum development which relate more directly to the problems and experiences of people such as those in the Case Studies. The conventional curriculum in adult education often appears indistinguishable from that of schooling despite claims of 'student-centredness' and responsiveness within adult education programming. It has been argued that there is a need to challenge the predominant banking concept of knowledge and an association of learning with schooling. Participation in adult learning may be made more unlikely or will be devalued if it simply replicates the form and content of the school curriculum. There should be a considered link between the consciousness, experience, personal and social circumstances of participants and curriculum planning within adult education.

The development of alternative practice may be difficult. There was an attempt within ALP to derive a curriculum from the 'codification' and 'problematisation' of experience. This did not seem to generate

sustained learning or a political response according to Freire's ideas. Nonetheless, the ALP organisers recognised the likely irrelevance of conventionally delivered 'subjects' in the inner city as well as the need to relate a curriculum to the experiences and culture of participants. Problem posing education produces a need for inter and multi-disciplinary strategies. Individual experience cannot simply be interpreted and responded to through a conventional subject map of knowledge. Similarly, the role of teacher and learner can become redefined as students positively revalue their capacity to provide evidence and ideas. Learning as a process has been described as 'holistic'; it is a label for an interrelated process of intellectual discovery, self-awareness, social and personal well being. This cannot be achieved without a careful incorporation into curriculum planning of the subjective experiences of participants. The educator may need to challenge student assumptions that personal experience is either worthless or irrelevant. Learning can best be nurtured if students are full participants at all stages of curriculum development. This is not to assume that all people can equally contribute; rather that people have a range of unique experience and potential to offer to enrich the process. The concept of a curriculum can therefore be modified. It is no longer simply a body of high status, 'publicly validated' knowledge to be understood by the students. It becomes a process through which collective knowledge is shared and extended and greater individual and group authenticity is secured.

It is clear from some of the case studies and the literature that curriculum planning often excludes students. For example, within adult basic education, a problem and solution can be predetermined by the teacher. Adult basic education is frequently located within a literacy, numeracy and life-skills matrix. The possibility of intellectual development may be neglected; the nature and causes of illiteracy itself may remain unanalysed. A person's intellectual potential and culture become divorced from the improvement of 'skills' if the teacher adopts a posture in which he/she assumes to know the problems a student faces and their cause; this can discourage a student from constructing his/her own explanations. A participant may retreat further into a 'culture of silence'. The educator carries a heavy responsibility to indicate the provisionality of all theories and knowledge and that central to all adult learning should be a search for personal explanation.

Other approaches to curriculum planning within community education may neglect the importance of systematic study. Formal learning may be insufficiently integrated with incidental learning. The Craigmillar Festival Society was based on an informal, participatory learning ideal in which personal creativity could be unlocked through purposeful social participation. Whilst CFS' literature stressed the importance of more organised, structured learning, the nature of such learning and its relationship to informal activity were unclear. Literacy classes were concerned with the development of basic skills with little evidence of critical thinking being encouraged in an explicit, planned way. The curriculum of the communiversity was to be determined by 'experts' with minimal involvement by members of the Society or the local community. The formal dimension of learning was ironically cast in a highly conventional mould.

It is therefore suggested that the first stage in curriculum planning should be to consider methods to involve potential participants in revealing their thought worlds and experience. A curriculum should be planned to ensure a close relationship between a person's cultural context, informal educative opportunity and the content of learning. The core principles within such an approach can be summarised as (a) a search for relevance through dialogue and negotiation; (b) the integration of critical thinking and communication skills within a problem-orientated rather than subject based approach; (c) co-operation rather than competition in learning; (d) collective evaluation of a curriculum in which participants play a central part.[16]

These principles can be developed into a curriculum model which may be used to guide practice. It is not intended that such a curriculum should simply be replicated; rather it delineates an approach to curriculum development to illustrate specific ways of translating principles into practice. There are suggestions about how dialogue and negotiation can be secured; specific strategies to integrate critical thinking and communication skills; ways of encouraging co-operative learning and collective evaluation. The objective behind such a curriculum is to engage potential participants in determining a learning agenda; control over content and organisation is devolved - participants are encouraged to identify and develop specific skills and knowledge to enable this to happen.

Initial contact with a possible network/befrienders/professional workers in an inner city area or council estate.	Training of an adult education team (and desirably) committed fellow professionals and academics in interview/interpersonal skills. Possible use of a University/College as a 'Training' resource throughout a Project.
Interviews with an agreed 'target sample'. Themes to be explored; 'Living in the local community'; 'Unemployment/Work'. Changed social/leisure patterns/spending habits; inter-family and interpersonal relationships; experiences of schooling, housing, local 'bureaucracy'. Health. The identification of key local issues; lack of local facilities, jobs, inadequate housing/ maintenance, lack of play space. etc.	Codification of material; decodification/thematic analysis by the team. A provisional identification of action, research and learning proposals; an identification of the work which might be needed to prepare a report or underline a piece of research to prepare a 'case'. Specific suggestions re sources of information; people who might be interviewed by participants. Definitions of relevant communication skills - approaches to writing, reading, editing, oral presentation, numeracy; planning of time and study; techniques of study.
Negotiation of a Possible Course/ Plan of Action/Agreed Strategy. Definition of a possible local Action Plan. Discussion of ways to prepare a report on the local economy or a strategy for developing employment opportunities. (The precise objective will obviously vary according to the target groups in the 'area'.)	A course/agreed strategy. This might involve a collective project in which individuals agree to act together. Group work might revolve around related issues - for example, exploring the theme of 'unemployment' or the nature of 'work'. Individual research could include interviews with individuals - their experiences of unemployment and their aspirations. What local job opportunities might be developed and what skills would be needed?

Libraries or other sources of information could be exploited as sources of information. Small group/ individual tutorials would focus on approaches to the use of evidence; how logical argument can be developed; development of communication skills - oral and written presentation; numeracy/statistics; reading skills - scanning material, note taking etc.

Production of a Report: A Job Strategy(?)/A Plan to improve a local service(?). An identification of an agreed plan to publicise and gather support for proposals. The identification of necessary campaign skills if considered appropriate.

Participation in other social activities/adult education.

Evaluation of the Project

Tutors: Collective identification of objectives and evaluation of each others' work through team meetings; assessment of teaching methods and materials. Examination of student feedback in relation to project objectives. Attendance at each others' sessions using a checklist - to examine the extent of individual participation; relevance of discussion in relation to tutorial themes. Assessment of success in exploring what was intended in any session, and use of systems (for example a list of objectives) to relate objectives to achievements.

Students: Tutors to produce short statements of objectives to discuss with students. Students to be required to complete short questionnaires - eg. 'What do I hope to gain from this project?'. Student assessment of progress through group discussion and individual questionnaires (which might cover the extent of student involvement, clarity of presentation etc.)

Individual tutorials with students. Use of individual assessment sheets, eg. skill grids.

A possible Evaluator-Tutor?[17] In-depth interviews - before, during and after a Project; this would involve an attempt to assess increases in confidence to take decisions. (For example more systematic use of time; participation in some other course or activity; a more active experience of making decisions to allow more time for personal concerns.)

- To provide feedback to all participants/tutors on all aspects of this process.
- Changes in self-concept
- Development of learning skills, knowledge and ways to exploit data or resources.
- Presentation skills - oral and written communication.
- Use of questionnaires to ask students what questions they thought they should be asked.

The ideas behind this model contrast with many conventional assumptions in adult education. Discussions of curriculum development often assume that content is predetermined by educators. Behavioural objectives are identified and success is defined in terms of how far they are realised. The curriculum model is an attempt to democratise all aspects of a programme from its conception through to final evaluation. The initial 'outreach' phase can involve contact being made with groups, or individuals using a networking approach of the type discussed in some inner-city or working class adult education projects.[18] Participants in the Unemployed Workers' Courses were recruited in this way since conventional methods of advertising might attract more confident or better educated people. The identification of a clear target group is important in that this should determine the recruitment methods to be employed. The use of 'befrienders', that is individuals having the prior confidence of potential participants, may be useful. People may be suspicious of 'educators' and their motives. (It may be that local people can be involved at this stage - for example, those who have already participated in educational activity or who are community activists. This will necessitate careful planning by a team since a local community will be a complex matrix of political interests and motives which may or may not be compatible with a project's objectives.) The initial interview seeks to establish important influences in an individual's consciousness and experience as well as some attempt to define ways in which adult education might be relevant. It also provides an opportunity for the interviewer to be open and explicit about assumptions underlying a particular project. The statement produced by the ALP team was a good example of one approach to this.[19] It is to be expected that some interviews will be unsuccessful; some interviewees will see little or no relevance in any form of social action or learning regardless of the advocacy of the interviewer. The material in Chapter Three contained examples of people who had retreated into escapism, fantasy or drug abuse to the extent that any suggestions for alternative personal action would probably have been rejected.

The detailed transcript material from interviews provides the basis for the team to plan a possible curriculum in more detail; recurring themes/problems/possibilities can be identified. In turn, these can be related to the resources available to a project or institution. It may be desirable to specify some specific objective - the preparation of a local report or plan - since participants may need

a clear focus and the 'project' some basis for collective action. The strategy of preparing reports also allows for a varied approach to learning - for example the use of experiential methods. Participants can learn to make full use of a local library or to exploit information which may be available in the local and national media. Some experience of similar curriculum development[19] suggests that the idea of a report can be a useful way to focus on specific objectives and to achieve co-operation through an agreed division of labour. It can also be helpful to participants in assessing their own learning needs. A development of basic skills, confidence to use documents, the practice of preparing a case are not abstracted from concrete action but are a means to secure the realisation of mutually agreed objectives. Successful curriculum planning requires a precise definition of these - for example, the stages involved in the production of a report, to enable discussion to take place on how an individual can develop understanding and skills to maximise his/her contribution.

Within the model, the development of critical thinking and communication skills are an integrated part of the project and tutorials. For example, participant definitions of a problem may be contrasted with those of the local media or the statements of local government agencies. The use, misuse, adequacy or inadequacy of evidence can be scrutinised. Individual tutorial or small group work can be arranged for all participants to improve a range of written and communication skills. Tutorials might include help with reading and writing or a consideration of approaches to reading - how texts can be scanned, notes taken and self-assigned questions used to test whether material has been understood. Such individual/small group tutorial/counselling activity might best be arranged at separate times and for all participants to avoid a 'basic education' stigma being attached to some participants, whether by themselves or others. Small groups can be a useful means through which oral or written presentation of an argument or case can be practised and developed. Underlying all these techniques is a desire to establish a sense of co-operation in learning in which participants may realise that others face problems, anxiety or self-doubt as much as themselves. Learning need not be considered as an individualistic, competitive activity in which one pursues a course in isolation from others. Rather, each participant is seen to contribute to a mutually agreed programme and is supported by fellow participants as well as tutorial staff. Teaching and learning may come to be redefined; they are no longer the distinct activities of 'teachers'

and 'students'. Each participant can be regarded as a contributor and receiver, a teacher and learner.

The final element is evaluation. Evaluation is regarded as part of the processes of curriculum development and learning rather than being considered in some way distinct or separate. It is often assumed to be the exclusive property of tutors or institutions (for example, University Departments may use evaluation to uphold 'standards') rather than an exercise to be undertaken collaboratively. The nature of evaluation in adult education more generally is uncertain and there is no clear body of established practice or techniques to draw on.[20] There is some dissatisfaction among adult educators with evaluative techniques which relegate the student to a marginal role - for example in determining what should be evaluated and why. The problems of evaluating learning as defined in this thesis are discussed further in the penultimate section of this Chapter. At this stage, since learning is defined as primarily subjective, it is insufficient to seek to quantify changes in observable behaviour alone. A student's 'construction of reality' and how this changes over time should be equally important. Students can be involved in a constant scrutiny of objectives as the project unfolds; their experience of tutorials and project work as well as the more general impact of participation in their lives can be carefully recorded.

In this sense, students can be thought of as evaluators as well as teachers and learners. Evaluation ceases to be the exclusive concern of the tutor. Students gain understanding and some control over what is being done. The discovery of confidence to make suggestions or to challenge a particular approach can be an important part of learning. Similarly, the role of tutors is changed in the model. They operate as a team rather than in isolation. They could make observations of each other's teaching, including strengths and weaknesses. Clearly, such comment and criticism could present difficulties since tutors may be more used to working in relative isolation. A lot will depend on the strength of team relationships and the extent to which dialogue, mutual confidence and collective responsibility exist. Discussion can identify aspects of a project or teaching which need to be strengthened; in this sense shared evaluation between tutors can become a means to co-operative learning. Questions can be asked about which teaching/learning methods are proving more or less successful. Strengths and weaknesses within the team are discussed and action can be agreed on.

Specific training requirements can be identified for the team. A supportive environment may be as crucial to dialogue within the tutorial team as in the adult class. Successful learning and changed practice can be seen to depend on the extent to which problems are shared and learning needs are sensitively addressed.

An essential element within the team's evaluation is to incorporate feedback and structured comment from students. Suitable methods need to be identified to enable students to evaluate objectives, methods and change. A possible approach might be: first, extensive discussion between tutors and students of objectives. Initially, students are likely to be diffident and uncritical. To enable them to play a more prominent role, short questionnaires could be used to identify their hopes and aspirations. For example, students could be asked to say what they hope to achieve from a project; they could then be invited to assess a course's development through the use of checklists. Aspects could be assessed on a scale from 'very useful' to 'not so useful'. Sociograms might be exploited to measure the extent of group interaction. Self-assessment sheets might be used to test the success of a particular presentation. Student evaluation within groups could be complemented by feedback from individual or small group sessions where the less confident may be more willing to comment.

Similarly, indepth interviews can be a continuing part of the process and not simply a way to identify initial themes. Such interviews could identify changing perceptions of self, other students, tutors, the project, personal abilities as well as wider social relationships and confidence to act. For example, evidence might be uncovered of a more conscious, considered approach to making decisions; these might include giving up smoking or discussing a child's progress with teachers at a local school; finding time and space to pursue personal interests, for example, to participate in some other form of adult education. Short questionnaires might again be helpful to gather information of this kind.

The extent of such an approach to evaluation might indicate that a member of a tutorial team should be given responsibility for its co-ordination and the production of reports for internal and external use (for example, for a parent body or funding agencies). This raises the problem of objectivity since the evaluator can be seen to have a vested interest in the project. The problems are analogous to those of the researcher in this area. There may be no simple solution other than to note the methodological and relational difficulties which can stem from a person being seen to be 'outside' the worlds of tutors and students.

A comparative stranger may find it difficult to gain access to innermost thoughts and feelings. Problems of objectivity in research are discussed further below in the context of action-research, participant observation techniques etc. There are no easy solutions to the problem of ensuring objectivity in evaluation or research.

Such a curriculum model incorporates specific ways in which participants can be encouraged to share control over their own learning in all its various forms. From inception to completion of specific tasks the student is engaged in a dialogue surrounding what is being done, to what effect and with what success. In this process, personal ability and learning may come to be redefined and general behaviour altered. The organisation of a curriculum should mirror the objectives of adult learning. Practice should closely relate to theory. Theory is devalued if it is too divorced from practice and vice versa. A more specific knowledge of good practice will only emerge as practical experiments are encouraged and findings disseminated. This raises the question of current organisation and practice within adult education, the role of providing bodies and the extent to which financial and political frameworks are seen to encourage such experiments. The resource implications of some curriculum development may seem forbidding to the isolated adult educator in an area of urban stress.

4. Existing Agencies and Experimental Work

Such approaches to curriculum development may imply considerable change in the organisation and practice of existing adult education agencies. A conventional, predetermined, subject-based curriculum often appears irrelevant to people locked into social marginality and material poverty. Similarly, some distinctions between liberal and vocational adult education can appear anachronistic given the displacement of large numbers of people in the inner city and the unskilled working class from participation in the formal economy. It may be more appropriate to define ways in which some of the values of 'liberal adult education' can be incorporated into more general educational and social policy. It has been suggested that in advanced industrial societies, the introduction of new technologies may require proportionally less labour. There is a possibility that sections of the population might be excluded from employment for substantial periods of time. This raises acute problems surrounding the nature and distribution of work and leisure, social status and the distribution of material rewards, power and powerlessness. In turn these factors will affect the

extent of adult learning. Adult education agencies themselves are located within, and mirror, a culture which can be said to constrain as well as provide opportunities. Some understanding of this context may be a prerequisite of coherent practice and a willingness to change.

Where adult educators have attempted to develop new approaches to adult learning among 'non-participants', these have sometimes produced conflict over content, standards, evaluation and the role of institutions. For example, within University Responsible Bodies questions have been asked of the standards and academic credibility of some women's studies provision.[21] It has been conventionally assumed that academics are the custodians of standards. University level work should be assessed according to specific and accepted criteria such as written work or other evidence of increasing intellectual development. Participants themselves may seek validation from within their own group rather than from criteria which are seen to be imposed from without. Standards of written work may be relatively unimportant compared with growth in personal confidence, assertiveness or a revaluation of personal roles in relation to partners. The importance of written work or other material is defined in the context of its significance to an individual or group rather than a set of external standards per se. Similar difficiulties have been noted in University provision for unemployed people. One University Department has sought to engage working class people '*living in absolute and relative poverty and dependent on state benefits*' in adult education.[22] The University was willing to see experiments in '*counselling organisational and co-ordinating roles*' within such programmes,[23] but required evidence that standards were appropriate to those of a University Department. A possible contradiction was suggested between a University's definition of appropriate provision and the educative desirability of groups controlling their own learning.[24] These problems are not new in University adult education. MacTavish's famous Oxford speech challenged the exclusive right of a University to determine what should be learned.[25] 'High status' knowledge could simply consist of ideas which reflected the interests and assumptions of 'a ruling class' without reference to philosophical or moral questions. A subject such as economics was seen to involve a divorce between highly technical issues surrounding for example, supply and demand in a given economy and philosophical questions concerning the purposes of production. 'Oxford' had as much to learn from the perspectives and culture of a submerged class as it might have to teach. Curriculum planning of the type outlined in the last section

raises questions about the nature, organisation , quality and purpose of knowledge. There has been a debate within adult education over its purpose and form that may have become polarised.[26] Knowledge is either publicly validated and rigorously tested according to agreed procedures or it is piecemeal and anecdotal.[27] Alternatively, knowledge is a product of particular forms of culture in which the domination of a ruling class or one sex over another is supported by the nature and content of an educational curriculum. Education is an element within socialisation and the cultural reproduction of social inequalities. These approaches to the content and nature of knowledge may be unnecessarily dichotomous. It is difficult to accept that all knowledge which has been generated within other social groups can simply be reduced to forms of cultural oppression. Conversely 'high status' knowledge can be seen to contain in-built assumptions and values which need to be identified. Knowledge should not simply be categorised according to its origin or how it has been developed. Personal experience or a piece of poetry can be as illuminating as a complex theory. Both may be necessary if a person is to discover a sense of historicity.

Particular forms of knowledge do present problems of presentation given their complexity. There may be difficulties in explaining some concepts to people who lack either mathematical or other specialist knowledge. A crucial role for a University Department of Adult Education can therefore become one of assisting *'in the re-interpretation and presentation of specialist knowledge into forms which, after proper evaluation, are considered suitable.'* [28] This may beg the question of what is meant by 'proper evaluation' and 'suitable'. Nonetheless, there is a role for a University Department in translating complex ideas developed within a range of disciplines into forms which may be comprehensible and thus help to illuminate the cultural contexts of specific groups. Popularisation is in itself a specialist task. A University Department might legitimately be involved in experimental work. Curriculum development could be seen as a laboratory through which epistemological problems are examined, sophisticated ideas popularised or approaches to evaluation refined. Can problem-posing education generate alternative ways of organising knowledge? For example, can ideas of 'cost' and 'benefits' in accountancy, the nature of organisational theory or approaches to management 'science' be integrated with humanistic concerns stemming from the specific material and cultural constraints which many people face? In what precise ways

can the problem of change and progress in adult education be more adequately understood by exploiting techniques of measurement or research developed in social science? The problems of learning for many of the people in this study will not be resolved simply by exercises in abstraction alone but through involvement in understanding actual programmes and the way people experience them.

For some practitioners sustained learning and cultural relevance can best be reconciled and secured through an increased network of WEA Branches.[29] In inner-city Liverpool, the project organiser was in little doubt of the educative value of greater participant control over learning and curriculum development through the mechanism of a Branch. This was possible because of the WEA's tradition of Branch autonomy: *'the WEA is the only body where it is possible to think in terms of workers' control over educational resources.'*[30] 'Control' was important since it was assumed that problem or issue-based learning might provoke conflict with established educational institutions or other sources of power. Constraints could be imposed on adult education activity if it was under the control of a local authority which might become an object of political challenge.

The tradition of branch autonomy and involvement in curriculum planning does provide one approach to the organisation of learning. Participation in a branch can help in the development of personal organisational skills, provide experience of committee work, discussion, and nurture a tolerance towards different opinions. Co-operation and mutual support within learning can be encouraged. The WEA's ideology has constantly stressed the educational value of branch activity. A particular branch can have the benefits of access to a wider WEA/University/Local Authority resource network without necessarily losing control over programme planning. The possibility of WEA/University activity being extended within the inner-city or council estate will in part depend on the priority given to adult education at a national and local level by policy makers. It has been noted in a major study of 'barriers' to participation[31] that the biggest problem may be the generally negative attitudes to adult learning among the population and a political climate in which adult education has a low priority. For the isolated adult educator, whether employed by a Responsible Body or a local authority, financial constraints, centralised administrative systems and methods of payment can compound his/her problems.[32] 'Classes' may need minimum numbers of students or to generate

sufficient income to pay for themselves. Projects such as CFS or ALP were dominated by problems of short-term funding. Adult educators may have inadequate administrative and clerical support and be locked into routine tasks which deny time and space to develop alternative approaches. It is doubtful though whether a simple increase in aggregate monies devoted to adult education would be a sufficient basis for alternative development of the kind suggested above. This study, as well as the P.I.E. Research, has indicated that the action of educators can often be based on theoretical incoherence and questionable practice. There may be insufficient awareness on the part of practitioners of the lack of any *system* of adult education. A system has been taken to mean an agreed sequencing of the existing different levels, types and modes of learning.[33] The lack of clear theory and practice or 'a system' may merely illustrate the marginal importance placed on the sector in policy planning or resource allocation. It may also underline a need for greater inter-agency co-operation and collaborative initiatives in which expertise in materials development, residential study or outreach work is combined.[34] The P.I.E. study identified the Open University as a 'high status' agency which could co-ordinate or facilitate such endeavours.[35] Little can be achieved given the existing regulatory framework of adult education or by the adult educator acting in isolation. It may be that the scale of structural unemployment in inner-city areas will persuade national funding agencies or particular local authorities to experiment in curriculum development and integrated practice of the kind suggested in this study.

If development is possible, some adult education agencies might usefully re-examine their existing assumptions. For example, a conventional approach to liberal adult education may be insufficient in communities where intimate webs of occupational status and material stability have been undermined. It is necessary for local people to reflect on the economic problems of their community but this might best be secured through some complementary action to secure new forms of occupational opportunity and material security. The ideals of liberal adult education were formulated at a time when the achievement of full employment seemed less problematic. Paid employment was the basis from which other action might stem. There was less pressure surrounding opportunities for paid work. The concerns were to revolutionise its nature and to challenge narrow utilitarian perceptions of 'education' for working class people. A person was reduced to being an operative

who required only basic skills and degrees of functional competence; there was a demand for a broader based curriculum for working class people. The liberal adult education movement was in part a reaction against this narrow instrumental view of learning. A participation in education through the tutorial class was considered to be a training ground in self-government, critical awareness, independence of judgement and skills of self-expression which were denied to large sections of the population.[36] Toleration, co-operation and learning within adult education were seen to provide an experiential basis for a wider socio-political and democractic revolution in which the working class would be a prime agent.[37] 'Work', in the sense of paid employment was available; the problem was to transform its meaning and social organisation through informed action.

In contrast, communities such as Pilton and Craigmillar provide striking evidence of a breakdown in the post-war consensus surrounding full employment. There may be less confidence in national macro-economic management as a means to secure fuller employment. It may be that locally initiated, co-operative and service orientated economic activity and job creation can provide some alternative forms of economic and community regeneration. The ideals of liberal adult education should be nurtured within such experiments.

The Craigmillar Festival Society provided a possible model for such an integrated experiment. Job opportunities were created through the 'Workshops' in varied activities. These included the provision of facilities for young people, play groups, nursery education, recreational/craft/or skill training. CFS had become the major local employer in a range of service related occupations which were of direct benefit to the local community. While formal learning had an uncertain relationship to informal activity, purposeful 'work' provided a context through which decision making, critical awareness and personal control could be nurtured. The Society provided an alternative source of personal legitimacy and relative material security. The development of more formal learning might become more possible in such a context.

This raises the problems of organisations such as CFS operating within the existing framework of local government. CFS depended on short-term funding and local authority support. It may be that organisations such as CFS could provide a vehicle for experiments in devolved management to secure economic and social regeneration. Aspects of learning - such as critical awareness, independence of judgement,

skills of self-expression - may seem more relevant when related to informal activity or a specific 'workshop'. For those in control of local resources, including education, there is a need to rethink the relationship between control, informal and formal learning opportunity.

5. Research and Evaluation

This study has revealed weaknesses in participation research and the evaluation of learning. Both research and evaluation should be developed beyond either observations of external behaviour, surveys of attitudes or the determination of objectives which exclude what may be most meaningful to participants. There is some overlap between the concerns of research and evaluation in the field. They can be distinguished by regarding the prime purpose of research as being to add to a body of knowledge which may or may not have practical application. The focus of evaluation is more directly to provide feedback and information in relation to specific courses or projects; it it more practically orientated. Nonetheless, both the researcher and evaluator share a common problem of understanding subjective experience and how it relates to observable behaviour. There is much work to be done to refine techniques to understand this inter-relationship more satisfactorily.

The Case Studies underlined the limitations of some conventional research methods. The interviews were 'one-off' and the research design enabled only limited feedback from interviewers and tutors. It is difficult to establish a deep level of mutual understanding through restricted encounters of this kind. Time may be needed to establish trust; the purpose of research will need to be extensively explained and this will also take time. One-off interviews are insufficient as a means to establish mutual confidence and a common language through which personal thoughts and feelings can be discussed. A longitudinal study would have been of greater value. Some quantitative measurement of change in observable behaviour could have been correlated with subjective changes in the self-concept, confidence and meaning over time. For example, changes in leisure activities, reading habits or general social participation could have been measured. This could have been combined with interviews designed to illuminate the meaning of these changes to learners.

Similarly, the nature of evaluation in the case studies mirrors

its uncertain status in adult education more generally. Methods to integrate the identification of observable behaviour and subjective experience are largely unavailable. Evaluation is often derived from curriculum theory and practice which exclusively focuses on intended learning outcomes. The processes of human growth and change are reduced to a series of predetermined objectives and how far these have been realised. Evaluation has been thought of as a synonym for a narrow form of measurement.

Evaluation, like research, may best be considered as a dynamic process which involves changes in the way learning is perceived. Objectives can change as learning takes place for both tutors and students. The nature of learning cannot be understood through the identification of a set of prior objectives which has excluded student perceptions. There are too many variables, unexpected outcomes or influences at work to reduce adult learning to a simple measurement of predetermined indices. A useful perspective on this problem has been provided by Stenhouse:

> *'Education enhances the freedom of man by inducting him into the knowledge of his culture as a thinking system. The most important aspect of the knowledge mode is that one can think with it... a structure to sustain creative thought and to provide frameworks for a judgement ...*
>
> *Education is successful to the extent that it makes the behavioural outcome of the student unpredictable.'* [38]

As in the curriculum model, to understand such unpredictability will require a combination of quantitative and qualitative techniques. Quantification can identify the indications of major change. Qualitative evaluation can seek to interpret its meaning in dialogue with the learner. 'Objective' methods can uncover basic data, numbers, quantities and achieve some measurement . Phenomenologically inspired research will explore the inner worlds of perception, consciousness and meaning.

A number of research methods developed in sociology and psychology may help in developing this work. 'Action-research' has been defined as *'aiming to contribute both to the practical concerns of people in an immediate problematic situation and to the goals of social science within a mutually acceptable ethical framework.'*[39] One recent piece of research has involved 'action' - by initiating learning among

unemployed adults using a range of recruitment and development strategies - and seeking to measure and analyse the results. The interpretation has involved three aspects: first, a concern for processes - an attempt to understand these through interviews and reports from tutors and students; secondly, historical - by adopting a 'systems approach' which takes into account the interaction between the programme and other relevant structures over time. These have included local authority policies and practices, the availability of resources and the attitudes towards learning of participants. Thirdly, the use of detailed case studies which have focused on minute particulars. There is no claim to general validity; rather by illuminating specific experiences a contribution can be made to a wider search for theory and explanation.[40] Action-research techniques could be applied on a wider scale. It might be possible to undertake a study of the impact of adult education programmes within a particular locality over a number of years. A particular inner city area or council estate could be chosen; the research methods would involve recording and seeking to measure, where possible, a changing social system. An adult education /employment programme would seek to develop educational and wider role opportunities. Events and experiences could be recorded during the period of intervention. There may, for example, be resistance to change and a struggle for control over resources. A pattern of power relationships could be mapped and analysed - for example those between local authority administrators, programme organisers and participants. Changes in objective behaviour and subjective meanings could be explored. These might include participation in political action - perhaps through parents becoming involved in identifying their children's learning needs - and a growing awareness of parents' entitlement to influence what happens in school. There might be a detailed examination of the relationship between informal activity - for example a new opportunity for paid work which requires degrees of informal learning and training - and participation in education. In what specific ways can informal learning needs become translated into adult education? What forms of provision, location and methods can best facilitate 'horizontal integration'?

Action research of this kind could be enriched or supplemented by the use of representative case studies in a particular community as well as methods of participant observation. A major socio-psychological study pioneered the use of case histories of a representative sample to determine particular personality types in the context of

their life experience.[41] The life history of adults will reveal learning opportunity and frustration at various stages. It might be possible to relate this detailed evidence to the socio-psychological theory of an innate drive to self-actualisation. The hierarchical formulation of needs - the functions of the body, security, social relationships and self-realisation could provide some framework for the organisation of material and an analysis of particular needs in specific circumstances. A state of ill-being could be understood within an empirical and theoretical framework in which security and social relationships are undermined or are frustrated. A life study might be interpreted as a pattern of restricted roles presented to the individual and his/her family. The consequence of compliant relationships, the absence of occupational opportunity and the presence of material stress might provide the detailed empirical basis for a more substantial sociologically and psychologically inspired theory of learning.

Participant observation might also be useful within such research. The researcher will need to be accepted at a personal level if intimate details of a person's history and thoughts are to be revealed. This might best be done if the researcher shares the experience of learning, teaching or living in a particular community. A detached, 'objective' researcher may appear to lack sympathy and empathy with the problems faced by local people or educators trying to devise new opportunities. Undoubtedly, participant observation methods raise problems of objectivity since the researcher becomes submerged in the 'object' of study. There may be no easy answer to this problem in educational or social research. The researcher's credibility will rest on the degree to which he/she empathises with people whilst disregarding his/her prejudices, likes or dislikes, hopes or fears in the accumulation of evidence. The researcher must also be aware of the effect of his/her personality or personal values on others. To participate in educational research, particularly among socially marginalised groups, is as complex a process as the development of learning. It is necessary to empathise with the cultural frustrations of people whilst retaining intellectual and analytical detachment. It is difficult to combine an examination of peoples' subjective worlds with academic rigour. Such difficulties make it more rather than less important for further major research to be undertaken.

6. Conclusion: Participation, adult learning, values and alternative futures

Participation in learning has been understood as an aspect of social experience and personal opportunity. The meaning of learning can be regarded as a product of institutional experience and the extent to which this has encouraged a belief in personal ability. The concepts of learning and education have been defined as a core element within a personal or collective search for understanding, creativity and authenticity. The development of adult learning will in part depend on the willingness of adult educators to experiment with new approaches; equally, it will depend on new approaches to local democracy and job creation in which there is a willingness to channel more public resources into communities such as Craigmillar and Pilton and to allow more local control over their use. There is, as yet, insufficient integrated practice and research devoted to programmes of this kind. We need to know more about the problems of curriculum development or the extent to which experiment may be accepted by dominant groups. The researcher is seeking to observe a complex social system which has political, social, as well as educational dimensions.

The view of participation in learning as one element of 'culture' has parallels with the development of workers' education at the beginning of the century. Participation in adult education was not simply to be valued in its own right. It was an opportunity for working class activists to equip themselves to participate in political, trade union or social activities as a means to achieve major social change. For example, the 'tutorial class' was a microcosm of the more egalitarian, cooperative society which fired the imagination of tutors such as Tawney.

There were, of course, widely divergent views over the purpose and nature of education; these reflected ideological positions ranging from a conservative fear of revolutionary change to revolutionary beliefs which challenged capitalism. Most of those who helped create workers' education, the WEA and the tutorial classes though were united in a reaction against narrowly instrumental views of education. Education could not be reduced to narrow functional literacy or the requirements of the labour market. It is to be noted that contemporary debates may similarly illustrate the relationships between educational values, ideology and a wider society. The displacement of a substantial proportion of semi- and unskilled jobs from the economy raises ideological and practical problems for the educator. He/she

needs to be clear about the purposes of education, how and why it is organised, particularly when operating in contexts of social stress; the literature reveals that educators themselves reflect a range of ideologies which influence how problems are perceived and solutions are arrived at. If problems are defined according to the 'needs' of a particular economy, the nature of adult learning may be considered simply in terms of ensuring an adaptable and better trained workforce. Contrastingly, if problems are seen to stem from the powerlessness and marginalisation of large groups of people, adult learning may be concerned with the discovery, articulation and achievement of alternative and more purposeful states of being. A theory and practice of adults participating in learning cannot exclude competing values, interests and ideologies. Learning and education are at the centre of wider conflicts surrounding the purpose of social and economic activity, the nature of social organisation and the extent to which particular forms of work or organisation can, or should, encourage wider individual and collective control and learning. The organisation of learning for adults cannot be seriously analysed outside this broader cultural framework. Some theorists are more explicit about this than others. For example, one influential school of thought explains the 'retardation' of the British economy as much in cultural as economic terms.[42] It is argued that the classical factors of supply - capital, labour and natural resources - were available in twentieth century Britain while demand in overseas markets was 'growing'. The failure to realise potential is explained by the accommodation of a new bourgeois class into a traditional social and cultural matrix;[43] industrial change was thought to be 'disreputable', social evils within capitalism were emphasised and there was an overriding concern for the quality of life *'in preference to the quantitative concerns of production and expansion'*. A 'liberal culture' stifled aggressive marketing and economic expansion. There had been too much stress placed on the cultivation of the intellect, and the evils of capitalism and too little on the encouragement of the entrepreneur and responsible behaviour at work.

Such an analysis has direct implications for the organisation and content of learning. Skilled labour has been scarce in some sectors of the economy at a time of increased and long term structural employment. Vocational educational packages may be needed to develop particular skills as well as attitudes which are conducive to 'economic efficiency'. For working class children and adults behavioural

modification and affective learning are seen to constitute an appropriate curriculum since the conventional academic curriculum is inappropriate.[44] Likewise, the bias in favour of adult training/vocational education[45] can be justified on grounds of economic 'need'. The traditional adult education sector may at best be seen as irrelevant within such an ideology; at worst it can be thought to represent a part of a 'liberal culture' which has produced economic retardation. The way a problem is defined influences possible solutions. People need to behave in ways which are more conducive to economic growth. The relationships between power, material security, occupational purposefulness, social organisation on the one hand and learning and well being on the other are tangential in such an ideology. The development of alternative adult learning opportunities of the type analysed in this thesis will therefore be problematic. There is a need for a wider understanding of these issues among educators, other professional groups and those in positions of power who may be disaffected by some existing approaches. A wider body of practical experiment may not simply increase an understanding of how participation in learning and democratic processes might be encouraged. It may help in delineating a clearer theoretical understanding of adult learning and its relationship to culture, control and opportunity. This will be preferable to theories which apply learning to first world cultures based too uncritically on experiences in the third world or particular approaches to radical social change which may reduce dialogue to the discovery of a particular truth rather than the means to a possible plurality of responses.

REFERENCES

1. *See Chapter One, pp. 3-4 above.*
2. *I am thinking of Raymond Williams' analysis of the 'contradictions' of industrialisation in his introductory essay to 'The Long Revolution', Pelican, 1961, pp.9-15.*
3. *D. Lane: 'The End of Inequality', Penguin, 1971.*
4. *See for example, P. Blumberg: 'Industrial Democracy', Constable, 1974, and D. Jenkins: 'Job Power', Heinemann, 1974.*
5. *See K. Coates (Ed.): 'The Right to Useful Work', Spokesman Books, 1978, particularly Chapter 3. Also D. Elliot: 'The Lucas Aerospace Workers' Campaign', Young Fabian Pamphlet, No.46, Fabian Society, 1978.*
6. *See A. Gould: 'Towards Equality of Occupational Opportunity', A.R.E., Discussion Papers 5, Dec. 1979, pp.10-12.*
7. *For a discussion of the influence of theories of scientific management on industrial and social organisation see V.H. Vroom: 'Work and Motivation' John Wiley, 1964, in particular, pp.138-139 or P.B.W. Warr (Ed.): 'Psychology at Work', Harmondsworth, Penguin, 1971, particularly the Chapter by F. Blackler and R. Williams.*
8. *See A. Gould: Op.Cit. for a discussion of this.*
9. *See A. Luard: 'Socialism without the State', MacMillan, 1979, pp. 100-103.*
10. *J. Seabrook has undertaken a provisional analysis of devolved housing estate management in Walsall. See J. Seabrook: 'The Idea of Neighbourhood', Pluto Press, 1984.*
11. *See T. Schuller: 'The Democratisation of Work' in 'Recurrent Education and Lifelong Learning', World Yearbook of Education, Kegan Paul, 1983, pp.97-110.*
12. *See J. Forbes: Op.Cit.*
13. *I am thinking of the Russell, Alexander and A.C.A.C.E. Reports.*
14. *I am thinking of the seminal document of the 1970s: 'The Baines Report'; HMSO/Dept. of the Environment: 'The New Local Authorities: Management and Structure', HMSO, 1972.*
15. *See a discussion of this in R. Ruddock: 'Perspectives on Adult Education', Op.Cit. pp.16-18.*
16. *The question of evaluation in adult education projects is further discussed in the next section, pp.*
17. *For an extensive discussion of the idea of an Evaluator/Tutor see Liverpool Second Chance: 'Evaluation, Principles and Practice' WEA/IES, Liverpool, 1984.*
18. *See in particular, T. Lovett: 'Adult Education Community Development, and the Working Class', Op.Cit.; Chapter Three, pp. above.*
19. *Educational projects in some WEA Districts have used this technique. See, for example, WEA BB&O: 'A Worm's Eye View', Milton Keynes, 1983.*

20. *The best account of the difficulties of evaluation in adult education is R. Ruddick: 'Evaluation: a Consideration of Principles and Methods', Manchester Monographs, 1981. This work is weak though on practical suggestions.*

21. *See J.Thompson: 'Adult Education for a Change', Op.Cit. pp.19-30 and 'Learning Liberation', Op.Cit.*

22. *See K. Ward: 'Beyond Tokenism - Unemployed Adults and Education', 'A Report to the Department of Education and Science on the Leeds University Action-Research Project', Department of Adult and Continuing Education, University of Leeds, Nov. 1983.*

23. *Ibid. pp.82-3.*

24. *Ibid. pp.82-3.*

25. *See A. Mansbridge: 'University Tutorial Classes', Longmans, 1913, pp.195-196.*

26. *See Chapter Two. pp. 47-48.*

27. *Ibid.*

28. *P. Fordham: 'A View from the Wall: Commitment and Purpose in Adult Education', An Inaugural Lecture, Deparment of Adult Education, University of Southampton, 22 Feb.1983, pp.8-10.*

29. *See T. Lovett: 'Adult Education, Community Development and the Working Class', Op.Cit. pp.146-148.*

30. *Ibid.*

31. *K. Percy et al: 'Post Initial Education in the North West', Op.Cit. pp.201-227.*

32. *Ibid.*

33. *Ibid. p.214.*

34. *For example, a Collaborative Project is being proposed between the Open University, Ruskin College and the WEA for unemployed adults. See WEA BB&O 'Preparatory Educational Programmes', Oxford. 1984.*

35. *K. Percy: Op.Cit. p.208.*

36. *See Chapter One pp. 3-4 above.*

37. *Ibid.*

38. *L. Stenhouse: 'An Introduction to Curriculum Research and Development', Heinemann, 1970, Chapter 6.*

39. *See K. Ward: Op.Cit. p.6.*

40. *Ibid. pp.6-8.*

41. *T.W. Adorno: 'The Authoritarian Personality', Harper and Row, 1950.*

42. *M.J. Weiner: 'English Culture and the Decline of the Industrial Spirit', Cambridge University Press, 1981, p.167.*

43. *Ibid. p.158.*

44. *For an example of this see G.H. Bantock: 'Toward a Theory of Popular Education', Op.Cit. Bantock denies any political implication in his 'affective' curriculum for working class children.*

45. *M. Woodhall: Op.Cit.*

BIBLIOGRAPHY

ACACE: 'A Strategy for the Basic Education of Adults, ACACE, Leicester, 1979.

ACACE: 'Adults - their Educational Experience and Needs', ACACE, Leicester, 1982.

ACACE: 'Adults' Mathematical Ability and Performance', ACACE, Leicester, 1982.

ACACE: 'Continuing Education: from Policies to Practice', ACACE, Leicester, 1982.

ADORNO, T.W.: 'The Authoritarian Personality', Harper and Row, 1950.

ADULT LEARNING PROJECT, GORGIE/DALRY: 'First Three Months Report', 17 September to 19 December 1979.

ADULT LEARNING PROJECT, GORGIE/DALRY: 'First Booklet', Edinburgh, 1980.

ALEXANDER D, and STEWARD, T.: 'An Educational Perspective on Community Education in Scotland', 'Scottish Journal of Adult Education', Vol.5, No.3, Autumn 1981, pp.1-13.

ALTHUSER, L.: 'Essays in Self-Criticism', New Left Books, 1976.

ARRIENS, J.W.F.: 'A Study of Factors Affecting Membership and Participation in Voluntary Leisure Associations', Ph.D. Thesis, Cambridge, 1968.

BANTOCK, G.H.: 'Toward a Theory of Popular Education' in Golby et al. (Eds.) 'Curriculum Design', Croom Helm, 1975.

BEESLEY, R.: 'Report of the External Assessor on the Adult Learning Project in Gorgie/Dalry, July 1981'. Wester Hailes Education Centre, Edinburgh. 1981.

BELORGEY, J.M.: 'Recurrent Education in France', OECD/CERI, Paris, 1976.

BERGER, P.L.: 'An Invitation to Sociology', Penguin, 1966.

BERGER, P.L. and LUCKMAN, T.: 'The Social Construction of Reality', Penguin, 1971.

BERGER, P.L.: 'Pyramids of Sacrifice, Political Ethics and Social Change' Pelican, 1977.

BERGSTEN, U.: 'Adult Education in Relation to Work and Leisure', Department of Educational Research, Stockholm Institute of Education, Almqvist and Wiksell, 1977.

BERTHOUD. R.: 'Training Opportunities for Skilled Jobs - Skill Centre Training and Labour Markets', PSI, Vol.XLIV, 1978.

BLAUNER, R.: 'Alienation and Freedom: the Factory Worker and his Industry', Phoenix Books, 1967.

BLUMBERG, P.: 'Industrial Democracy', Constable, 1974.

BOLO, P.: 'Application of the Continuous Vocational Training Act', 9 July 1971, CCC/EED, Council of Europe, 1976.

BOSHER, R.: 'Factor Analysis - A Critical Review of the Motivation, Orientation Literature', 'Adult Education' (USA), Vol.27 1, pp.24-41, 1976.

BOSTON, B.O.: 'Paulo Freire, Notes of a Loving Critic', in J.M. Grabowski (Ed.): 'Paulo Freire: A Revolutionary Dilemma for the Adult Educator', Occasional Paper No.32, ERIC Clearing House on Adult Education, Syracuse, New York, 13210, 1972.

BOTWINICK, J.: Age Differences in Self-Ratings of Confidence', Psychological Reports, Vol.27, pp.308-12, 1970.

BOWN, L.: 'Participation in Learning - for Power or Powerlessness' Keynote Address to the Community Education Association Fifth Annual Study Conference, Edinburgh, March 1982.

BROOKFIELD, S.: 'Open Learning' Continuing Education, NEC, Cambridge, July 1980.

BROOKFIELD, S.: 'Independent Adult Learning', Studies in Adult Education, Vol.13, No.1, April 1981.

BROOKFIELD, S.: 'Adult Learners, Adult Education and the Community', Open University Press, 1983.

BROMLEY, D.: 'The Psychology of Human Ageing', Penguin, 1974.

BRYANT, I.: 'The Educational Needs of Long-term Unemployed Adults', 'A Report for the SED', Department of Adult and Continuing Education, Glasgow, October, 1982.

BURGESS, T.: 'The Open University', New Society, 27 April 1972.

CENTRAL POLICY REVIEW: 'Education, Training and Industrial Performance', HMSO, 1980.

CHARNLEY, A.H.: 'Research in Adult Education in the British Isles', NIAE, 1974.

CHARNLEY, A.H.: 'Paid Educational Leave', Hart Davis Educational, 1975.

CHARNLEY, A.H. and JONES, H.A.: 'The Concept of Success in Adult Literacy', ALBSU, 1979.

CHARNLEY, A.H., OSBORNE, M., and WITHNALL, A.: 'Review of Existing Research in Adult and Continuing Education', 'Mature Students', Vol. One, NIAE, 1980.

CHARNLEY, A.H., OSBORNE, M., and WITHNALL, A.: 'Adult Education and Unemployment: a Review of Existing Research in Adult and Continuing Education', Vol.IX, N.I.A.E., 1982.

CITY OF EDINBURGH DISTRICT COUNCIL: 'Report of Director of Housing on Peripheral Housing Estates', Edinburgh, October 1982.

COATES, K. (Ed.): 'The Right to Useful Work', Spokesman Books, 1978.

COLEMAN, A.: 'Preparation for Retirement in England and Wales', NIAE, 1982.

COUNCIL FOR TERTIARY EDUCATION: 'Review of Structure and Management: Report of the Committee on Structure and Management', Edinburgh, Oct. 1981.

COURTNEY, S.: 'Factors Affecting Participation in Adult Education - An Analysis of Some of the Literature', 'Studies in Adult Education', Vol.13, No.2, Oct.1981, pp.98-111.

CRAIGMILLAR FESTIVAL SOCIETY: 'Craigmillar, A Community in Crisis', CFS, November 1982.

CROMBIE, A.D.: 'Participation and Recurrent Education', ARE, Nottingham, May 1980.

CROPLEY, A.J.: 'Lifelong Education - A Psychological Analysis', Pergamon, UNESCO, 1977.

CROSS, K.P.: 'A Critical Review of State and National Studies of the needs and interests of Adult Learners', in C.B. Statford (ed.), 'Adults learning needs and the demand for lifelong learning', National Institute of Education, Washington, DC, 1978.

DAHL, R.A.: 'Modern Political Analysis', Prentice Hall, 1970.

DALIN, A.: 'Recurrent Education in Norway', OECD/CERI, Paris, 1972.

DANIEL, W.W.: 'A National Survey of the Unemployed', PEP, October 1974.

DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION AND SCIENCE/SCOTTISH EDUCATION DEPARTMENT: 'Higher Education into the 1980s', DES/SED, London, 1978.

DEPARTMENT OF EMPLOYMENT: 'Census of Employment', D. of E. Gazette, 1971, 1981 and Dec. 1983.

DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION AND SCIENCE/HMSO: 'Adult Education, a Plan for Development', 'Report of a Committee of Enquiry under Sir Lionel Russell', London, 1973.

DURKHEIM, E.: 'Education and Sociology', Collier-MacMillan, 1950.

ELLIOTT, D.: 'The Lucas Aerospace Workers' Campaign', Young Fabian Pamphlet, No.46, Fabian Society, 1977.

ELPHICK, C.: 'Non-formal Education, An Introduction to the Debate', A.R.E., June 1981.

FLETCHER, C.: 'The Theory of Community Education and its Relation to Adult Education', in J.L. Thompson: 'Adult Education for a Change', pp.65-82.

FORBES, J.: 'Community Education and Lifelong Education', Scottish Journal of Adult Education, S.I.A.E., Vol.5, No.3, pp.23-32, Autumn, 1981.

FORDHAM, P.: 'A View from the Wall: Commitment and Purpose in Adult Education', An Inaugural Lecture, Dept. of Adult Education, University of Southampton, 22 Feb. 1983.

FORDHAM, P., POULTON, G., and RANDLE, L.: 'Learning Networks in Adult Education, Non-Formal Education on Housing Estates', Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1979.

FOSTER, P.: 'ALP, January 1982, Report of the External Assessor on the Adult Learning Project in Gorgie/Dalry', SABEU, 1982.

FREIRE, P.: 'Cultural Action for Freedom', Penguin Education, 1972.

FREIRE, P.: 'Pedagogy of the Oppressed'. Penguin Education, 1972.

FREIRE, P.: 'Education, the Practice of Freedom', Writers and Readers Publishing Co-operative, 1976.

FROMM, E.: 'Man for Himself', Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1949.

FURTER, P.: 'The Planner and Lifelong Education', UNESCO, IIEP, 1977.

GAGNE, R.M.: 'Essentials of Learning for Instruction', Dryden Press, 1975.

GOLDTHORPE, J. et al: 'The Affluent Worker, individual attitudes and behaviour', Cambridge University Press, 1968.

GOLDTHORPE, J.H. and LLEWELLYN, C.: 'Class Mobility in Modern Britain: Three Theses Examined', 'Sociology' II, 2 May 1977, pp.257.187.

GOLDTHORPE, J.H. and LLEWELLYN, C.: 'Class Mobility: Intergenerational and Work/Life Patterns', British Journal of Sociology, Vol.XXVII, 3 Sept. 1977, pp.269-302.

GOLDTHORPE, J.H. and PAYNE,C.: 'Trends in Class Mobility', Sociology, 123, Sept. 1978, pp.438-468.

GOULD, A.: 'Towards Equality of Occupational Opportunity', A.R.E., Discussion Paper 5, Dec.1979.

GRAY, R. and HUGHES, M.: 'Half our Future', Adult Education, Vol.52, No.5, Jan.1980, pp.301-308.

HALSEY, A.H., HEATH, A.F. and RIDGE, J.M.: 'Origins and Destinations: Family, Class and Education in Modern Britain', Clarendon, 1980.

HANNA, I.: 'A Socio-Psychological Survey of the Student Membership of Adult Education Classes in Leeds and Changes in the Adult Education Student Population since 1945', MA Thesis, Leeds 1964.

HARRISON, R.: 'The Demoralising Experience of Prolonged Unemployment', Department of Employment Gazette, April 1976.

HIRST, P.H. and PETERS, R.S.: 'The Logic of Education', Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1970.

HOLMES, J.: 'Thoughts on Research Methodology', 'Studies in Adult Education, Vol.8, No.2, 1976, pp.144-163.

HORNER, D.J. 'Towards a Concept of the Community University', Community Education, SCEC, Summer 1978, pp.13-18.

HORN, J.L. and DONALDSON, G.: 'On the Myth of Intellectual Decline in Adulthood', 'American Psychologist', 1976,31, pp.701-719.

HMSO/Department of the Environment: 'The New Local Authorities/Management and Structure', HMSO, 1972.

HOULE, C.O.: 'The Enquiring Mind: A Study of the Adults who Continue to Learn', University of Wisconsin, Maddison, 1961.

HOULE, C.O.: 'The Design of Education', Jossey-Bass, San Francisco, 1972.

HOUGHTON, V. and RICHARDSON, K.: 'Recurrent Education. A Plea for Lifelong Learning', Ward Lock Educational, 1974.

HOUGHTON, V.P. and GEW, T.E.: 'Management Science and Recurrent Education', Faculty of Educational Studies, the Open University, 1976.

HOY, J.P.: 'An Enquiry into the Interests and Motives for Study among Adult Evening Students', British Journal of Educational Psychology, Vol.3, 19,1933, pp.13-26.

ILLICH, T.: 'De-Schooling Society,', Calder and Boyers, 1974.

JACKSON, K.: 'Adult Education and Community Development', Studies in Adult Education, Vol.2, 1970, pp.165-172.

JACKSON, K. and LOVETT, T.: 'Universities and the WEA: An Alternative Approach', 'Adult Education' Vol.44, No.2, July 1971, pp.100-7.

JACKSON, K.: 'The Marginality of Community Development: implications for adult education', 'The International Review of Community Development', 1973.

JAMES, H. 'A Sociological Perspective', in R.H. Dave: 'Foundations of Lifelong Education', Pergamon/UNESCO, 1976, pp.129-185.

JENCKS, C.: 'Inequality', Allen Lane, 1974.

JENKINS, D.: 'Job Power', Heinemann, 1974.

JESSUP, F.W.: 'Lifelong Learning: A Symposium on Continuing Education', Pergamon, Oxford 1969.

JOHNSTONE, J.W. and RIVERA, R.J.: 'Volunteers for Learning', Washington, 1965.

JONES, H.A.: 'Beyond Literacy - the background to a strategy for adult basic education', in M. Hayes (Ed.): 'Papers on Adult Basic Education', University of Southampton, 1979.

KEDDIE, N.: 'Adult Education: an Ideology of Individualism', J.L. Thompson: 'Adult Education for a Change', pp.45-64.

KILLEEN, J. and BIRD, M.: 'Education and Work: A Study of Paid Educational Leave in England and Wales, 1976-7', NIAE 1981.

KIRKWOOD, C.: 'The Concept of Community', 'Adult Education', Vol.51, No.3, 1978, pp.145-151.

KIRKWOOD, C.: 'Report of the External Assessor on the ALP in Gorgie/Dalry covering the period October 1979 to April 1980', WEA, Edinburgh, 1980.

KIRKWOOD, C.: 'The Second Report of the External Assessor on the ALP in Gorgie/Dalry, April 1980 to September 1980', WEA, Edinburgh, 1980.

KIRKWOOD, C.: 'Some Unemployed Adults and Education': 'A Report on 31 interviews with unemployed men and women carried out in Edinburgh in the first quarter of 1981', WEA, S.E.Scotland District, 1981.

KIDD, J. ROBY: 'Research Needs in Adult Education', 'International Council for Adult Education', Studies in Adult Education, Vol.13, No.1, Aug.1981.

LAING, R.D.: 'The Self and Others', Tavistock, 1961.

LANE, D.: 'The End of Inequality', Penguin, 1971.

LAWSON, K.H.: 'Philosophical Concepts and Values in Adult Education', Department of Adult Education, Nottingham, 1975.

LAWSON, K.H.: 'A Critique of Recurrent Education', ARE, 1977.

LOTHIAN REGION A.B.E. Unit: 'Adult Basic Education - Philosophy, Policies and Priorities', Edinburgh, March 1982.

LOVETT, T.: 'Adult Education, Community Development and the Working Class', Nottingham Studies in the Theory and Practice of the Education of Adults, No.12, 2nd Edn. 1982.

LOVETT, T., CLARKE, C. and KILMURRAY, A.: 'Adult Education and Community Education', Croom Helm, 1983.

LUARD, A.: 'Socialism without the State'. MacMillan, 1979.

MACKENZIE: H.: 'The Craigroyston Curriculum Project: Seconday Education in the Inner City', Centre for Urban and Regional Research, University of Glasgow, Discussion Paper No.4, December 1981.

MANSBRIDGE, A.: 'University Tutorial Classes', Longmans, 1913.

MARX, K.: 'On Alienation' in T.B. Bottomore and M. Rubel (Eds.) 'Karl Marx, Selected Writings in Sociology and Social Philosophy', Penguin, 1963.

MARRIOTT, S.: 'A Review of Tough's latest research', 'Studies in Adult Education', Vol.15, Sept.1983. pp.111-112.

MASLOW, A.H.: 'Motivation and Personality', Harper and Row, 1954.

MASLOW, A.H. 'Toward a Psychology of Being', Van Nostrand, 1968.

McINTOSH, N.M. and CALDER, J.W.: 'A Degree of Difference: A Study of the First Year's Intake in the Open University of Great Britain', Open University, 1975.

McLEAN, N. and MARTIN, I.: 'Community Education, What are we playing at?', 'Community Education', SCEC, Edinburgh, Spring 1979, pp.9-13.

MEE, G. and WILTSHIRE, H.: 'Structure and Performance in Adult Education', Longman, 1978.

MEZIROW, J., DARKENWALD, G.G. and KNOW, A.B.: 'Last Gamble on Education', Washington, D.C., Adult Education Association of the USA, 1975.

MEZIROW, J.: 'Perspective Transformation', Studies in Adult Education, Vol.9, Oct.1977, pp.153-164.

MORRIS, J.: 'Three Aspects of the Person in Social Life', in R.Ruddock: 'Six Approaches to the Person', pp.70-92.

NEWBY, H.: 'In the Field: Reflections on the Study of Suffolk Farm Workers', in C. Bell and H. Newby (Eds.): 'Doing Sociological Research', Allen and Unwin, 1977.

NEWMAN, M.: 'The Poor Cousin: A Study of Adult Education', Allen and Unwin, 1979.

NIAE: 'Adequacy of Provision', 'Adult Education', Vol.42. March 1970.

OAKESHOTT, M.: 'Learning and Teaching', in R.S. Peters (Ed.): 'The Concept of Education', Routledge and Kegal Paul, 1967, pp.151-157.

PATEMAN, C.: 'Participation and Democratic Theory', Cambridge University Press, 1970.

PATTERSON, R.W.K.: 'Social Change as an Educational Aim', Adult Education, Vol.45, 1973, pp.353-359.

PEACOCK, A.: 'Evaluation of the Craigroyston Curriculum Development Project, The Appointing of an Adult Basic Education Worker', Discussion Paper IV, Scottish Council for Research in Education, Edinburgh, June 1982.

PERCY, K. and S. LUCAS: 'The Open College and Alternatives', Lancaster Series on Adult Education, No.2, University of Lancaster, 1980.

PERCY, K. et al: 'Post-initial Education in the North West of England: A Summary of Provision', ACACE, Leicester, 1983.

PHILIPSON, C. and STRANG, P.: 'The Impact of Pre-Retirement Education: A Longitudinal Study', University of Keele, 1983.

PILSWORTH, M. and RUDDOCK, R.: 'Some Criticisms of Survey Research Methods in Adult Education', 'Convergence, Vol.8, No.2,1975 pp. 33-45.

RAFFE, D.: 'Social Class and Entry to Further Education', Scottish Education Studies, Vol.9, No.2, Nov.1977.

RAFFE, D.: 'The Alternative Route Re-considered: Part Time Further Education and Social Mobility in England and Wales', Sociology, 13, Jan.1979, pp.47-73.

ROGERS, C.: 'Regarding learning and its facilitation' in 'Freedom to Learn', Merill, Columbus, Ohio, 1969.

ROGERS, J.: 'Adults Learning', Open University Press, 1977.

ROGERS, J. and GROOMBRIDGE, B.: 'Right to Learn', Penguin, 1979.

RUBENSON, K.: 'Participation in Recurrent Education: A Research Review', OECD/CERI, Paris, 1972.

RUBENSON, K.: 'Recruitment in Adult Education, A Research Strategy', Report from Dept, of Educational Research, School of Education, Stockholm, 1976.

RUDDOCK, R.: 'Six Approaches to the Person', Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1972.

RUDDOCK, R: 'Perspectives on Adult Education', Manchester Monographs, No.2, 1980.

RUDDOCK, R.: 'Evaluation: A Consideration of Principles and Methods' Manchester Monographs No.16, 1981.

RUDOLPH, et. al: 'Recurrent Education in the Federal Republic of Germany', OECD/CERI, Paris, 1972.

SCHULLER, T.: 'The Democratisation of Work' in 'Recurrent Education and Lifelong Learning', World Yearbook of Education, Kegan Paul, 1983, pp.97-110.

SCHUTZ, A.: 'The Phenomenology of the Social World', Heinemann, 1972.

SCOTTISH EDUCATION DEPARTMENT/HMSO: 'Adult Education - The Challenge of Change'. 'Report of a Committee of Enquiry appointed by the Secretary of State for Scotland chaired by Prof. K.E.W. Alexander', Edinburgh, 1975.

SCOTTISH EDUCATION DEPARTMENT: '16-18s in Scotland, The First Two Years of Post-Compulsory Education', SED, Edinburgh, 1979.

SEABROOK, J.: 'The Idea of Neighbourhood', Pluto Press, 1984.

SHAW, R.: 'Adult Education and the Working Class', 'Studies in Adult Education, Vol.2, 1970, pp.1-17.

STAPEL, C. and BERGEN, N.H. 'Dutch Adult Education on its way to an Open School System', Council of Europe, January 1974.

STENHOUSE, L.: 'An Introduction to Curriculum Research and Development', Heinemann, 1976.

STOCKS, M.: 'The Workers' Educational Association: The First Fifty Years', Allen and Unwin, 1953.

TAWNEY, R.H.: 'The Radical Tradition', Penguin, 1964.

THOMPSON, E.P.: 'The Making of the English Working Class', Penguin, 1968.

THOMPSON, J.L.(Ed.): 'Adult Education for a Change', Hutchinson, 1980.

THOMPSON, J.L.: 'Learning Liberation: Women's Response to Men's Education', Croom Helm, 1983.

TOUGH, A.: 'Why Adults Learn: A Study of the Major Reasons for Beginning and Continuing a Learning Project', Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, 1968.

TOUGH, A.: 'Intentional Changes: a Fresh Approach to Helping People Change', Follett Publishing Co., 1983.

TRADE UNION RESEARCH UNIT: 'Labour Market Issues', No.2, Oct. 1982, Ruskin College, Oxford.

TRENAMAN, J.: 'Communication and Comprehension', Longmans, 1957.

VROOM, V.H.: 'Work and Motivation', John Wiley, 1964.

WARD, K.: Beyond Tokenism - Unemployed Adults and Education', 'A Report to the Department of Education and Science on the Leeds University Action-Research Project'. Department of Adult and Continuing Education, Univ. of Leeds, Nov. 1983.

WARR, P.B.W. (Ed.): 'Psychology at Work', Harmondsworth, Penguin, 1971.

WEA, BB&O District: 'A Worm's Eye View', Oxford, 1983.

WEA, BB&O District: 'Preparatory Educational Programmes', Oxford, 1984.

WEA, West Lancs & Cheshire District: 'Evaluation: Principles and Practice', Second Chance to Learn, 1984.

WEINER, M.J.: 'English Culture and the Decline of the Industrial Spirit', Cambridge University Press, 1981.

WEST, L.R.: 'The Tawney Legend Re-examined' in 'Studies in Adult Education', Vol.4,No.2, 1972, pp.105-119.

WILLIAMS, R.: 'The Long Revolution', Pelican, 1961.

WILLIAMS, R.: 'Base and Superstructure in Marxist Cultural Theory', New Left Review, 82, Dec.1973, pp.3-16.

WILTSHIRE, H.: 'The Concepts of Learning and Need in Adult Education', p.146 in A. Rogers (Ed.): 'The Spirit and the Form, Essays in Adult Education in Honour of Professor Harold Wiltshire', Nottingham Studies in the Theory and Practice of the Education of Adults, Department of Adult Education, Nottingham, 1976.

WOODHALL, M.: 'The Scope and Costs of the Education and Training of Adults in Britain', ACACE, Occasional Paper Four, 1980.